

THE POST-REFORMATION
CATHOLIC COMMUNITY
IN THE NORTH OF ENGLAND

JOHN ANTONY HILTON

PhD

2016

Abstract

This thesis demonstrates that I have made a sustained, original, coherent, and significant contribution to scholarly research on post-Reformation English Catholicism by presenting and discussing a series of publications that cover the period from the Elizabethan Reformation to the eve of the Second Vatican Council.

The Introduction argues that although English Catholics became a separate recusant community that increased, it was never more than a small minority. The Introduction also outlines my contributions to the field. It goes on to discuss the historiography of the subject: Bossy's contribution, the emphasis on Church Popery by Walsham and Questier, and the Ultramontane and Liberal approaches to the later modern period.

The Critical Essay demonstrates my contribution to the study of the emergence and development of recusancy in much of the North of England. My work was used by other historians of Catholicism. I pioneered and developed the study of popular Catholicism, and made an important contribution to the understanding of the development of its spirituality, using familiar sources to answer new questions. I also argued that the failure of the policies of King James II demonstrated the weakness of English Catholicism after a century of persecution.

The Critical Essay then goes on to discuss emancipated Catholicism's continued growth in the later modern period, subject to the Industrial Revolution and its social effects. It shows that I led the way in the study of the priest and historian, John Lingard, and made a significant contribution to the study of the Catholic congregationalism. Finally, I broke new ground in both Catholic and Ruskin studies by showing how the Catholic community adopted the artistic and social teaching of Ruskin.

The Conclusion discusses my work's limitations in the light of recent research, and goes on to suggest ways in which it might be further developed.

THE POST-REFORMATION CATHOLIC COMMUNITY IN THE NORTH OF ENGLAND

JOHN ANTHONY HILTON

**A thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements
of the
Manchester Metropolitan University for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy**

**Department of History, Politics and Philosophy
Manchester Metropolitan University**

2016

Contents

Acknowledgements	1
Introduction	2
Selected Publications	22
1. 'Catholics in Elizabethan Durham', <i>Recusant History</i> , vol. 14 (1) (1979), pp. 1-8	
2. 'The Cumbrian Catholics', <i>Northern History</i> , vol. XVI (1980), pp. 40-58	
3. <i>Catholic Lancashire: From Reformation to Renewal 1559-1991</i> (Phillimore, Chichester, 1994), Chapter I, 'Reformation, 1559-1603', pp. 1-15	
4. <i>Catholic Lancashire: From Reformation to Renewal 1559-1991</i> (Phillimore, Chichester, 1994), Chapter II, 'The Consolidation of the Catholic Community, 1603-42', pp. 16-23	
5. 'Wigan Catholics and the Policies of James II', <i>North West Catholic History</i> , vol. I (3) (1969), pp. 97-110	
6. 'The Recusant Commons in the North East, 1570-1642', <i>Northern Catholic History</i> , no. 12 (1980), pp. 3-13	
7. 'The Catholic Poor: Paupers and Vagabonds 1580-1780' in Marie B. Rowlands (ed.), <i>Catholics of Parish and Town</i> (Catholic Record Society, London, 1999), pp. 115-28	
8. '“The Science of the Saints”: The Spirituality of Butler's <i>Lives of the Saints</i> ', <i>Recusant History</i> , vol. 15 (3) (1980), pp. 189-93	
9. 'Lingard's Hornby' in J. A. Hilton (ed.), <i>Catholic Englishmen</i> (North West Catholic History Society, Wigan, 1984), pp. 37-44	
10. 'Lingard's Anglo-Saxonism: A Post-Colonial Reading' in Peter Phillips (ed.), <i>Lingard Remembered: Essays to Mark the Sesquicentenary of John Lingard's Death</i> , (Catholic Record Society, London, 2004), pp. 23-34	
11. '“The Case of Wigan”: Catholic Congregationalism in the Age of Revolution', <i>North West Catholic History</i> , vol. X (1983), pp. 1-7	
12. 'Catholic Congregationalism in Fleetwood, 1841-42', <i>North West Catholic History</i> , vol. XXVI (1999), pp. 62-69	
13. 'Ruskinian Catholicism', <i>The Ruskin Review and Bulletin</i> , vol. 6 (2) (2010), pp. 5-15	
Critical Essay	200
Conclusion	244
Appendix: The Publications of J. A. Hilton	260
Bibliography	270

Acknowledgements

I am grateful to Prof. Michael Wadsworth for encouraging me to take this course, to Mr Gordon Forster and Prof. Michael Mullett for acting as referees, to Prof. Mullett and Prof. Melanie Tebbutt for helpful preliminary discussions, to Ms Deborah Bown for guiding me through the formalities of entry to the course, to Mr Christian Franklin for assistance in marrying Word and PDF, to Dr Marian McClintock and Prof. Jeffrey Richards for helping me to prepare for my viva, and to Prof. Salvador Ryan and Prof. Tebbutt for their positive suggestions about this thesis in the viva.

I am especially grateful to my supervisor, Dr Rosalind Oates. Without her interest, knowledge, insight, patience, and guidance, this thesis could not have been written.

Introduction

Over the last fifty years I have built up a coherent and significant body of published work on the history of the post-Reformation Catholic community in the North of England. The thirteen publications submitted in this thesis reflect my interest in the evolution of domestic Catholicism from the Reformation to the Second Vatican Council.

I taught history in schools and colleges in Lancashire. I obtained an MPhil from Leeds University, and have contributed to academic publications throughout my adult life. Since 1978 I have been the editor of the North West Catholic History Society's annual journal, *North West Catholic History*, and occasional publications. My contribution to North-Western Catholic history was recognised by the publication of a collection of essays dedicated to me on my seventieth birthday in 2011,¹ and by the award of a papal knighthood in 2012. I have been an active member of the Ruskin Seminar of the University of Lancaster since 2001. I was elected a Fellow of the Royal Historical Society in 2003. I obtained the Diploma of the Heraldry Society in 2012.

My basic theme is the way in which a separate Catholic community appeared and perpetuated itself. I argue that recusancy, led by the gentry, was brought

¹ John Davies and Allan Mitchinson (eds), *'Obstinate Souls': Essays presented to J. A. Hilton on the occasion of his seventieth birthday by the North West Catholic History Society* (North West Catholic History Society, Wigan, 2011).

into being by the deprived Marian clergy, and fostered by the seminary priests and Jesuits (Publications 1, 2, 3, and 4). I contrast the Elizabethan Protestant Reformation of Elizabeth I with the attempted Counter-Reformation of James II (Publication 5). I examine popular Catholicism and its spirituality (Publications 6, 7, and 8). I demonstrate that the community's ecclesiastical organisation brought with it conflict between clergy and laity, seculars and regulars, bishops and priests, and Ultramontanes and Cisalpines (Publications 9, 10, 11, and 12). Finally, I consider the Catholic community's engagement with the wider community through its attempt to adopt and to apply Ruskin's social teaching (Publication 13).

I focused on Catholicism in the North of England, because of the impression that Catholicism was stronger there than in the South; Catholic historians such as Mathew, Watkin, Hughes, Aveling, and Bossy, held that view, as did A. G. Dickens, the leading Protestant historian of his day.² The understanding of the process of the English Reformation is improved by looking at regional, county and local as well as national history. The 1960s and 1970s saw a renaissance for local and

² David Mathew, *Catholicism in England: The Portraits of a Minority: Its Culture and Tradition* (Eyre and Spottiswood, London, 1948), pp. 36, 39; E. I. Watkin, *Roman Catholicism in England from the Reformation to 1950* (Oxford University Press, London, 1967, p. 71; Philip Hughes, *The Reformation in England* (3 vols, Burns and Oates, London, 1963), vol. III, pp. 265-66, 369; J. C. H. Aveling, *The Handle and the Axe: The Catholic Recusants in England from Reformation to Emancipation* (Blond and Briggs, London, 1978), p. 67; John Bossy, 'The Character of Elizabethan Catholicism' in Trevor Aston (ed.), *Crisis in Europe 1560-1660: Essays from Past and Present* (Routledge & Kegan Paul, London, 1965), p. 224; Bossy, *English Catholic Community*, pp. 78-96; A. G. Dickens, *The English Reformation* (Batsford, London, 1964), pp. 366-67.

regional history in general, pioneered by Hoskins, and religious history in particular, led by Dickens.³

The Historiography of Post-Reformation English Catholicism

I began researching the North-East in the 1960s because a number of studies of recusancy in Northern counties had already been published. They included Leatherbarrow's study of Elizabethan recusancy in Lancashire published in 1947, the first academic study of the subject.⁴ Leatherbarrow pointed out that there were relatively many Catholics in Lancashire compared with the rest of England. He observed that the question of why this was the case involved a larger issue: was the English Reformation popular or was it imposed on an unwilling people by the government?⁵

Subsequently Haigh argued that recusancy eventually developed in Lancashire out of 'survivalism', the Catholic beliefs and practices that survived the Protestant Reformation. Because, in the 1560s and 1570s, there was still 'some semblance of Catholicism'⁶ in some churches, there was little recusancy.⁷ There was, however, a large number of ejected Marian clergy in Lancashire, which resulted in the growth of lay recusancy, especially after the intervention of Laurence Vaux. By

³ W. G. Hoskins, *Local History in England* (Longman, Harlow, 1972), passim; A. G. Dickens, *The English Reformation* (Batsford, London, 1964), passim.

⁴ J. Stanley Leatherbarrow, *The Lancashire Elizabethan Recusants* (Chetham Society, vol. 110, Manchester, 1947).

⁵ *Ibid.*, p. xi.

⁶ Christopher Haigh, *Reformation and Resistance in Tudor Lancashire* (Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 1975), p. 216.

⁷ *Ibid.*, p. 248

1571, therefore, there was 'a widespread and already well-established Catholic religious life'.⁸ 'Lancashire, then, was at the end of Elizabeth's reign by far the most Catholic county in England'.⁹ My work on Durham accorded with these accounts of widespread survivalism in the first two decades of Elizabeth's reign, followed by the emergence of recusancy,¹⁰ and I came to the same conclusion when I later turned to study Lancashire. These local studies, interesting in themselves, cast increasing light on each other and on the character of Elizabethan and Jacobean Catholicism as a whole.

Similar studies of Yorkshire¹¹ and Cheshire¹² were produced by Aveling and Wark respectively. Their accounts of the origins of recusancy were very similar to those of Leatherbarrow and Haigh: conformity and conservatism followed by recusancy, influenced by Marian and seminary priests. In Cheshire, however, the number of recusants was small compared with neighbouring Lancashire.

Meanwhile in 1975 Bossy argued that, although at the end of 1559 almost everyone conformed, eventually a growing number of people ceased to conform. He also insisted that his subject was not religious opinion but 'membership of a

⁸ Ibid., p. 259.

⁹ Ibid., p. 278.

¹⁰ J. A. Hilton, 'Catholic Recusancy in County Durham, 1559-1625' (MPhil thesis, University of Leeds, 1974).

¹¹ Hugh Aveling, *Post-Reformation Catholicism in East Yorkshire 1558-1790* (East Yorkshire Local History Series, number 11, York, 1960), pp. 5-42; Aveling, 'The Catholic Recusants of the West Riding of Yorkshire 1558-1790', *Proceedings of the Leeds Philosophical and Literary Society* (Leeds, 1963), pp. 191-256; Aveling, *Northern Catholics: The Catholic Recusants of the North Riding of Yorkshire 1558-1790* (Geoffrey Chapman, London, 1966), pp. 7-300; Aveling, *Catholic Recusancy in the City of York 1558-1791* (Catholic Record Society, London, 1970), pp. 1-88.

¹² K. R. Wark, *Elizabethan Recusancy in Cheshire* (Chetham Society, new series, volume 19, Manchester, 1971).

community'.¹³ Recusancy ensured that Catholicism would continue to exist as a separate community. Bossy's hypothesis seemed controversial, but it had been anticipated by Hughes, who described Elizabethan Catholicism moving from drift to revival,¹⁴ and Aveling, who concluded that English Catholicism 'was utterly recreated'.¹⁵ Bossy's interpretation of the history of Elizabethan Catholicism made sense of the virtual absence of recusancy in the first decade of the reign followed by its subsequent appearance and expansion, which I found in Durham and Northumberland.

Bossy's thesis was, however, criticised by Haigh, though he rather over-stated Bossy's case, arguing that recusant Catholicism was 'not a new post-Reformation creation of missionaries from the Continent'.¹⁶ Eventually Haigh revised this view, accepting that the government had hoped that Catholicism would die with the last old Catholic priest, but that the arrival of the seminary priests dashed this hope.¹⁷

Recent studies of Elizabethan Catholicism, especially by Walsham¹⁸ and Questier,¹⁹ privileged the shifting ambiguity of Elizabethan religion, emphasising

¹³ Bossy, *English Catholic Community*, pp. 182-83.

¹⁴ Hughes, *Reformation in England*, vol. III, pp. 239-338.

¹⁵ Aveling, *Handle and Axe*, p. 19.

¹⁶ Christopher Haigh, 'The Continuity of Catholicism in the English Reformation', *Past and Present*, number 93 (November, 1981), pp.37-69.

¹⁷ Haigh, *English Reformations: Religion, Politics and Society under the Tudors* (Oxford University Press, Oxford, 1993), pp. 262-63.

¹⁸ Alexandra Walsham, *Church Papists: Catholicism, Conformity and Confessional Polemic in Early Modern England* (Boydell, Woodbridge, 1999), passim; Walsham, "'Yielding to the Extremity of the Time": Conformity, Orthodoxy and the Post-Reformation Catholic Community' in Peter Lake and Michael Questier (eds), *Conformity and Orthodoxy in the English Church, c. 1560-1660* (Boydell Press, Woodbridge, 2000), pp. 211-36;

¹⁹ Michael Questier, 'Conformity and the Law' in Lake and Questier, pp. 217-61;

the importance of Church Popery. More recently, Kelly has shown, like Questier, that Church Popery could be used by a Catholic to cover his political activity on behalf of recusants.²⁰ There are, however, problems with assessing the extent of Church Popery. Church Papists were, by definition, almost invisible, and so leave little trace in the records. There was a range of responses to the Reformation, characterised and exemplified by Haigh. The religion of Shakespeare is only the most celebrated and controversial possible example.²¹ As with recusancy, we are dealing not with religious opinion but with 'membership of a community'.²²

Bossy's most recent publication defends the counting of recusants, because it reveals actual people, guards against inflating the strength of recusancy, and provides information on its distribution. He accepts Walsham's and Questier's emphasis on the importance of Church Popery, but re-asserts the value of concentrating on recusancy.²³

²⁰ James E. Kelly, 'Conformity, Loyalty and the Jesuit Mission to England of 1589', in Eliane Glaser (ed.), *Religious Tolerance in the Atlantic World: Early Modern and Contemporary Perspectives* (Palgrave Macmillan, Basingstoke, 2014), pp. 149-70;

²¹ Christopher Haigh, 'Success and Failure in the English Reformation', *Past and Present*, issue 173 (2001), pp. 28-49; Haigh, *The Plain Man's Pathway to Heaven*, passim; Richard Dutton, Alison Findlay and Richard Wilson (eds), *Region, religion and patronage: Lancastrian Shakespeare* (Manchester University Press, Manchester, 2003), passim; Dutton, Findlay and Wilson (eds), *Theatre and Religion: Lancastrian Shakespeare* (Manchester University Press, 2003), passim; Felicity Heal, *Reformation in Britain and Ireland* (Oxford University Press, Oxford, 2003), passim; Michael C. Questier, *Catholicism and Community in Early Modern England: Politics, Aristocratic Patronage and Religion, c. 1550-1640* (Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 2006), passim; Ronald Corthell, Frances E. Dolan, Christopher Highley, and Arthur F. Marotti, *Catholic Culture in Early Modern England* (University of Notre Dame Press, Notre Dame, 2007), passim; Peter Marshall and Geoffrey Scott (eds), *Catholic Gentry in English Society: The Throckmortons of Coughton from Reformation to Emancipation* (Ashgate, Farnham, 2009), passim; John Bossy, 'Recusant History and after', *British Catholic History*, vol. 32 (3) (2015), pp. 271-79.

²² Bossy, *English Catholic Community*, pp. 182-83.

²³ Bossy, 'Recusant history and after', *British Catholic History*, vol. 32 (3) (2015), pp. 272-79.

Other recent approaches include looking at particular aspects of the Catholic community other than the clergy and the adult male recusant gentry, because they were the minority. The majority included the women and children of the recusant gentry, and the commoners. Popular Catholicism, that is Catholics below the rank of gentry, a topic which I pioneered, has received some treatment, using familiar sources to ask new questions.²⁴

The study of women, whose importance in fostering recusancy I emphasised, has become a particular field of interest within the subject. Women were always at least half the Catholic community, and sometimes more. They were also far from passive and subservient, but often played an active part in organising the mission. Some, however, pursued the religious life abroad, where their communities generated the internal archives impossible for Catholics in England. Rowlands's survey of recusant women outlined the subject for further research: she described the penal laws in so far as they applied to women, the role of women in Catholic households, and the founding of English convents abroad.²⁵ Hollinshead showed how vital the Blundell women were in maintaining Catholicism in south-western Lancashire and how great was their contribution to

²⁴ Hilton, 'The Recusant Commons in the North East 1570-1642', *Northern Catholic History*, no. 12 (1980), pp. 3-13; B. G. Blackwood, 'Plebeian Catholics in the 1640s and 1650s', *Recusant History*, vol. 18 (1) (1986), pp. 42-59; Hilton, 'The Catholic Poor: Paupers and Vagabonds, 1580-1780', in Marie B. Rowlands (ed.), *Catholics of Parish and Town 1558-1778* (Catholic Record Society, London, 1990), pp. 115-30.

²⁵ Marie Rowlands, 'Recusant Women 1560-1640' in Mary Prior (ed.), *Women in English Society 1500-1800* (Methuen, London, 1975), pp. 63-78.

the continental convents.²⁶ Lux-Sterritt demonstrated the role played by women in the male clerical mission.²⁷ Brindley demonstrated the role of women in nurturing Catholic piety, ensuring the provision of priests, and devotional and polemical literature in Catholic households, in maintaining links with the English continental convents, and in exercising influence through kinship networks.²⁸ Less has been done on Catholic children. Nevertheless, adolescent rebellion has been considered by Underwood as a factor in turning Church Papists into recusants.²⁹

English Catholic culture – its piety, literature, art, and music - is also under scrutiny, examining the articulation of cultural and political struggles in religious language,³⁰ and the integration of Catholics into the wider community.³¹ Walsham broke new ground in her study of the landscape. She argued that the landscape and its religious features, constitute a source, indeed, a palimpsest on which the history of the Reformation is written.³² In separating from the

²⁶ Janet E. Hollinshead, *Women of the Catholic Community: The Blundells of south Lancashire during the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries* (North West Catholic History Society, Wigan, 2010);

²⁷ Laurence Lux-Sterritt, 'Virgo becomes Virago': women in the accounts of seventeenth-century English Catholic missionary', *Recusant History*, vol. 30 (4) (2011), pp. 537-54.

²⁸ Christina Michelle Brindley, 'Images of Female Piety and the Development of Post-Reformation Catholicism in the Diocese of Chester, c. 1558 – c. 1625 (unpublished Ph.D. thesis, Manchester Metropolitan University, 2014), passim.

²⁹ Lucy Underwood, 'Recusancy and the Rising Generation', *Recusant History*, vol. 31 (4) (2013), pp. 511-34.

³⁰ Ronald Corthell, Frances E. Dolan, Christopher Highley, and Arthur F. Marotti (eds), *Catholic Culture in Early Modern England* (University of Notre Dame Press, Notre Dame, Indiana, 2009), passim;

³¹ Peter Marshall and Geoffrey Scott, *Catholic Gentry in English Society: The Throckmortons of Coughton from Reformation to Emancipation* (Ashgate, Farnham, 2009), passim.

³² Alexandra Walsham, *The Reformation of the Landscape: Religion, Identity and Memory in Early Modern Britain and Ireland* (Oxford University Press, Oxford, 2011), passim.

Protestant mainstream, English Catholics developed their own sub-culture. My Conclusion discusses the more recent literature.

Until recently historians of the reign of James II have concentrated on the causes of the Revolution of 1688 but have directed little attention to his co-religionists, in whose interests he formulated his policies.³³ Miller, however, surveyed the Catholic community in detail and analysed its reaction to the royal policies. He showed the extent of the Catholic gentry's co-operation in the creation of a Catholic ascendancy in local government.³⁴

More recently attention has focussed on James's creation of an Anglo-Gallican English Catholic Church. Pincus has argued that James intended to create a Catholic absolutism on the model of Gallican France, and shows the extent of his drive to re-convert England to Catholicism.³⁵ Glickman re-assesses English Catholicism in the period that followed the Revolution, arguing James's policies were continued in an Anglo-Gallican Jacobite Church, strengthening English Catholic resistance to papal authority.³⁶

Like Bossy, I have been concerned to write 'the continuous history of the [English Catholic] community as such.'³⁷ My *Catholic Lancashire* was my attempt to do so for that community in one county, which has arguably been its centre

³³ Michael Mullett, *James II and English Politics 1678-1688* (Routledge, London, 1994); Eveline Cruickshanks, *The Glorious Revolution* (Macmillan, Basingstoke, 2000).

³⁴ John Miller, *Popery and Politics in England 1660-1688* (Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 1975).

³⁵ Steve Pincus, *1688: The First Modern Revolution* (Yale University Press, New Haven and London, 2009), pp. 118-220.

³⁶ Gabriel Glickman, *The English Catholic Community 1688-1745: Politics, Culture and Ideology* (Boydell Press, Woodbridge, 2009).

³⁷ Bossy, *Catholic Community*, p. 1.

since the Reformation.³⁸ Looking at a longer period one can identify the continuities and discontinuities of the community's history, such as the process of separation following the Reformation, the reconstruction of an ecclesiastical organisation, and the search for a *modus vivendi* with the wider community and the Protestant State

This later modern English Catholicism is the background of my studies of Catholic devotion, the work of Lingard, Catholic congregationalism, and the influence of Ruskin (Publications 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, and 13). The study of later modern English Catholicism is less contested than the early modern period. Indeed, there seems to be a consensus: English Catholics were granted toleration in 1791 and emancipation in 1829; thereafter, reinforced by Irish immigration, they increased in numbers, which was marked by the restoration of the hierarchy in 1850; and Catholics increased in numbers and confidence into the middle of the twentieth century.³⁹

Whether, however, as Bossy argued, Catholics increased in numbers well into the eighteenth century⁴⁰ is still debated.⁴¹ The picture of English Catholicism at a

³⁸ Hilton, *Catholic Lancashire: From Reformation to Renewal 1559-1991* (Phillimore, Chichester, 1994), *passim*.

³⁹ E. I. Watkin, *Roman Catholicism in England from the Reformation to 1950* (Oxford University Press, London, 1957), pp. 103-231; E. E. Y Hales, *The Catholic Church in the Modern World: A Survey from the French Revolution to the present* (Eyre and Spottiswoode, London, 1958), pp. 114-17, 258-59; Alan D. Gilbert, *Religion and Society in Industrial England: Church, Chapel and Social Change, 1740-1914* (Longman, London, 1976), pp. 45-47; Edward Norman, *Roman Catholicism in England from the Elizabethan Settlement to the Second Vatican Council* (Oxford University Press, Oxford, 1985), pp. 54-129; Michael A. Mullett, *Catholics in Britain and Ireland, 1558-1829* (Macmillan, Basingstoke, 1998), p. 140.

⁴⁰ Bossy, *English Catholic Community*, pp. 182-94, 278-92, 295-322.

low ebb in the first half of the eighteenth century owed much to Joseph Berington's *State and Behaviour of English Catholics* (1780), which pointed to some defections to Anglicanism from the Catholic aristocracy. Together with the defeat of two Jacobite rebellions, this looked like the nadir of post-Reformation Catholic fortunes, a view repeated in the work of such historians as Watkin. On the other hand, contemporary estimates do not support this pessimism, which Watkin finds 'puzzling'.⁴² Rowlands agreed with Bossy that the growing congregations of the public chapels in industrial towns more than made up for the decline in some rural congregations.⁴³

Bernard Ward's trilogy covered the period from 1781 to 1850, which saw the struggle for the Relief Acts, the Emancipation Act, the restoration of the hierarchy and the conflict between the Cisalpines and the Ultramontanes, ending in the triumph of the latter.⁴⁴ Ward, looking back on this struggle from a clerical and Ultramontane perspective at the beginning of the twentieth century, saw it as culminating in 'the Roman spirit', replacing a 'narrow', 'dry' English piety with continental devotions.⁴⁵

⁴¹ Gilbert, *Religion and Society in Industrial England*, pp. 45-47; J. Anthony Williams, 'Change or Decay? The Provincial Laity 1691-1781' in Eamon Duffy (ed.), *Challoner and his Church* (Darton, Longman and Todd, London 1981), pp. 31-32; Mullett, *Catholics in Britain and Ireland*, p. 140

⁴² Watkin, *Roman Catholicism in England*, pp. 102-51.

⁴³ Rowlands, '1767 – The New People' in Rowlands (ed.), *Catholics of Parish and Town*, pp. 286-356.

⁴⁴ Bernard Ward, *The Dawn of the Catholic Revival in England 1781-1803* (2 vols, Longmans, Green and Co., London, 1909); Ward, *The Eve of Catholic Emancipation 1803-1829* (3 vols, Longmans, Green and Co., London, 1911-12); Ward, *The Sequel to Catholic Emancipation 1830-1850* (2 vols, Longmans, Green and Co., London, 1915).

⁴⁵ Ward, *Sequel to Catholic Emancipation*, vol. I, p. vii.

In the aftermath of the Second Vatican Council, however, Holmes took the opposite Liberal, neo-Cisalpine view. The restoration of the hierarchy, which the Cisalpines, such as Lingard, hoped would increase the independence of the English Church from Rome and of the clergy from the bishops, had the opposite effect.⁴⁶ Henceforth, the pope ruled the Church, the bishops their dioceses, and the priests their missions. Recent surveys, such as McClelland's and Gilley's have confirmed this view of an authoritarian and Ultramontane Church.⁴⁷

Bossy argued that the later Catholic community was largely the result of the Industrial Revolution, which brought Catholics from the English countryside, as well as from Ireland, into the towns.⁴⁸ Mullett, in opposition to Bossy, maintains that there was some demographic decline in the eighteenth century, and argues that well into the nineteenth century Catholicism remained strong in the countryside, and was still dominated by the gentry.⁴⁹ Gilbert's survey of all the English Christian denominations, also accepts that the eighteenth century was a period of decline for Catholics, in which their legally subordinate position resulted in their sharing many of the characteristics of Protestant Nonconformity. He then argues that Irish immigration added ethnic to religious differences in English Catholicism. (The Catholics of nineteenth-century Manchester were

⁴⁶ J. Derek Holmes, *More Roman than Rome: English Catholicism in the Nineteenth Century* (Burns and Oates, London, 1978), pp. 85-90.

⁴⁷ V. Alan McClelland, 'The Formative Years, 1850-92' in McClelland and Michael Hodgetts (eds), *From Without the Flaminian Gate: 150 Years of Roman Catholicism in England and Wales 1850-2000* (Darton, Longman and Todd, London, 1999), pp. 1-20; Sheridan Gilley, 'The Years of Equipoise, 1892-1943' in McClelland and Hodgetts, pp. 21-61.

⁴⁸ Bossy, *English Catholic Community*, pp. 295-401.

⁴⁹ Michael A. Mullett, *Catholics in Britain and Ireland, 1558-1829* (Macmillan, Basingstoke, 1998), pp. 138-161.

overwhelmingly Irish.⁵⁰) Meanwhile, Gilbert argues that English Catholicism's claim to be a Church increased its sectarian characteristics that enabled it to resist the secularising trend of the late nineteenth and twentieth centuries.⁵¹ Similarly, McLeod argues that the nineteenth century was a period both of increasing secularism and religious revival, which formed the distinctive identities of specific communities.⁵² More recently, Wheeler points out that while English Catholics presented a united front to Protestants, they quarrelled amongst themselves.⁵³ .

There are detailed studies on nineteenth- and twentieth-century English Catholicism. Beck's collection of essays looked back over the hundred years after the restoration of the hierarchy in 1850.⁵⁴ Hughes's essay set out the basic themes of the collection. Anticipating McLeod, he argued that the challenges facing the Catholic Church were secularism and the condition of the poor. He found the answer in the decrees of the (First) Vatican Council on the pope's universal authority and infallibility, in the bishops' success in asserting the right to a separate Catholic system of education, and in *Rerum Novarum* and its application by Manning and his successors at Westminster.⁵⁵ Norman's more recent account agrees that the nineteenth century was one of 'Catholic revival', 'a

⁵⁰ Alan Kidd, *Manchester: A History* (Carnegie Publishing, Lancaster, 4th edition, 2008), pp. 48-49, 122, 173-74.

⁵¹ Gilbert, *Religion and Society in Industrial England*, 14-17, 45-47, 172-74

⁵² Hugh McLeod, *Religion and the People of Western Europe* (Oxford University Press, Oxford, 1981), passim

⁵³ Michael Wheeler, *The Old Enemies: Catholic and Protestant in Nineteenth-Century English Culture* (Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 2006), pp. 37-46.

⁵⁴ George Andrew Beck, *The English Catholics 1850* (Burns and Oates, London, 1850-1950).

⁵⁵ Philip Hughes, 'The Coming Century' in Beck (ed.), *Ibid.*, pp. 1-41.

triumphant era', in which Ultramontanism affected English Catholic life in every detail.⁵⁶ Beck's collection has also been supplemented by another which looks back from the aftermath of the Second Vatican Council over the hundred and fifty years from the restoration of the hierarchy. Its editors argue that the study of this *longue durée* will contribute to the understanding of the Church's struggle to come to grips with the modern world while trying to preserve its inheritance, values, approach, and teaching.⁵⁷

It is the growth of this urban Catholicism from the eighteenth to the twentieth centuries that I see as driving the response of the clergy who replaced the gentry as the leaders of the Catholic community, and my Publications 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, and 13 deal with aspects of that response.

My work on Alban Butler's *Lives of the Saints* (Publication 8) argued it combined meditation with hagiography. Butler's book was set within the more widely used and better-known works of Richard Challoner, especially his *Garden of the Soul* (1740).⁵⁸ Burton's biography of Challoner explained that the *Garden of the Soul* contained a great deal of devotional instruction.⁵⁹ Bossy regarded it as the central book of devotion of the late eighteenth and early nineteenth

⁵⁶ Edward Norman, *The English Catholic Church in the Nineteenth Century* (Oxford University Press, Oxford, 1984), passim.

⁵⁷ McClelland and Hodgetts 'Introduction' in McClelland and Hodgetts (eds), *From Without the Flaminian Gate*, p. xiii..

⁵⁸ Hilton, "'The Science of the Saints': The Spirituality of Butler's *Lives of the Saints*", *Recusant History*, vol. 15 (3) (1980), pp. 189-93.

⁵⁹ Edwin H. Burton, *The Life and Times of Bishop Challoner (1691-1781)* (2 vols, Longmans, Green and Co., London, 1909).

centuries.⁶⁰ Duffy argued that Challoner's writings 'are best considered as an extension of his pastoral concern'.⁶¹ Mursell showed that Challoner moved away from a world-denying piety to one designed to fit the Catholic laity for the context of their own lives. Mursell also acknowledged my interpretation of Butler's *Lives of the Saints* as a book of devotion.⁶²

My work on Lingard (Publications 9 and 10) argued that he was the outstanding English Catholic of the first half of the nineteenth century. My work was based on earlier studies,⁶³ and was taken up by later writers. Haile and Bonney's biography had the advantage of access to Lingard's letters and papers at Ushaw, and dealt in depth with his role as historian and Cisalpine leader. It was, however, overwhelmed by detail, and no clear argument emerges, other than admiration for its subject.⁶⁴

Thereafter Lingard was ignored until the later twentieth century when two books on him appeared in America. Shea's book concentrated on the historian, exploring, like Ranke, the original sources. At the same time, Shea showed that

⁶⁰ Bossy, *Catholic Community*, pp. 364-70.

⁶¹ Duffy, 'Richard Challoner 1691-1781: A Memoir' in Duffy (ed.), *Challoner and his Church: A Catholic Bishop in Georgian England* (Darton, Longman and Todd, London, 1981), p. 21

⁶² Gordon Mursell, *English Spirituality From 1700 to the Present Day* (Society for Promoting Christian Knowledge, London, 2001), pp. 31-36.

⁶³ Hilton, 'Lingard's Cisalpine History', *Priests and People*, vol. 3 (8), pp. 328-31; Hilton, 'Lingard's Hornby' in Hilton (ed.), *Catholic Englishmen* (North West Catholic History Society, Wigan, 1984), pp. 37-44; Hilton, 'Lingard's Anglo-Saxonism: A Post-Colonial Reading' in Peter Phillips (ed.), *Lingard Remembered* (Catholic Record Society, London, 2004), pp. 23-34.

⁶⁴ Martin Haile and Edwin Bonney, *Life and Letters of John Lingard 1771-1851* (Herbert and Daniel, London, 1912), passim.

Lingard's purpose was apologetic; he eschewed controversy, but sought to remove Protestant prejudice against Catholicism.⁶⁵

Chinnici's book placed Lingard as historian in the background of the Enlightenment, in the attempt to reconcile faith and reason. He highlighted Lingard's role as a leading Cisalpine or Anglo-Gallican, who tried to bring about an accommodation between Catholicism and the British State, and to secure the autonomy of the English Catholic Church.⁶⁶

Bossy dealt in passing with Lingard as pastor, Cisalpine, and liturgist.⁶⁷ Edwin Jones's accepted my estimate of Lingard and made a systematic analysis of Lingard's historical method.⁶⁸ Phillips edited a collection of essays on Lingard, to which I contributed one which argued that Lingard emphasised the Englishness of Catholicism.⁶⁹ Phillips's biography replaced Haile and Bonney as the standard work. Phillips demonstrated both Lingard's contribution to the development of the English Catholic Church and to the transformation of historical scholarship.⁷⁰ Cattermole argued that Lingard's aim was neither historical truth nor apologetics, but the insinuation of the right of the Catholic nobility and gentry to a share in the government of the country, an agenda motivated by snobbery.⁷¹

⁶⁵ Donald F. Shea, *The English Ranke: John Lingard* (Humanities Press, New York, 1969), passim.

⁶⁶ Joseph P. Chinnici, *The English Catholic Enlightenment: John Lingard and the Cisalpine Movement, 1780-1850* (Patmos Press, Shepherdstown, 1980), passim.

⁶⁷ Bossy, *Catholic Community*, pp. 302, 332, 3452, 358, 374-77, 381-86.

⁶⁸ Edwin Jones, *John Lingard and the Pursuit of Historical Truth* (Sussex Academic Press, Brighton, 1981), p. 17.

⁶⁹ Phillips (ed.), *Lingard Remembered*, passim.

⁷⁰ Phillips, *John Lingard: Priest and Historian* (Gracewing, Leominster, 2008), passim.

⁷¹ Philip H. Cattermole, *John Lingard: The Historian as Apologist* (Matador, Kibworth Beachamp, 2013), passim.

The subject of my essays on Catholic congregationalism in Wigan and Fleetwood (Publication 11 and 12)⁷² was largely uncharted territory. Ward, in his account of late eighteenth-century Catholicism occasionally mentions trustees and the resulting disputes, but regards them as a temporary expedient rather than a viable form of permanent organisation.⁷³ Bossy, however, placed these disputes within the context of a struggle between the bishops, the priests, the gentry, and the middle class for control of the English Church.⁷⁴ Aveling pointed out the relationship of Cisalpinism to the Liberal Catholicism of the late nineteenth century and its revival in the late twentieth century.⁷⁵ As Bossy and Aveling showed, Catholic congregationalism, like Cisalpinism, was viewed with hostility by the Ultramontanes who dominated the English Catholic Church from 1850, and it had, perhaps deliberately, been written out of the histories. The literature of this almost forgotten episode, therefore, must be gleaned from scattered references in the general accounts of the disputes of the period, parish histories, and, if possible, collections of relevant documents.

In my original contribution to Ruskinian studies, which showed Ruskin's influence on English Catholicism (Publication 13),⁷⁶ I had much material to work on. Ruskin's collected works, edited shortly after his death, contain his artistic and

⁷² Hilton, 'The Case of Wigan: Catholic Congregationalism in the Age of Revolution', *North West Catholic History*, vol. X (1983), pp. 1-7; Hilton, 'Catholic Congregationalism in Fleetwood, 1841-42', *North West Catholic History*, vol. XXVI (1999), pp. 62-69.

⁷³ Ward, *Dawn of the Catholic Revival*, vol. I, pp. 191-92; Ward, *Eve of Catholic Emancipation*, vol. III, p. 33; Ward, *Sequel to Catholic Emancipation*, vol. I, pp. 3 6-38, 194-98

⁷⁴ Bossy, *English Catholic Community*, p. 337-54.

⁷⁵ Aveling, *The Handle and the Axe*, pp. 336-39.

⁷⁶ Hilton, 'Ruskinian Catholicism', *The Ruskin Review and Bulletin*, vol. 6 (2) (2010), pp. 5-15.

social teaching, which was influential in late Victorian England. They also contain much on his fascination with Catholicism, but very little on his influence on English Catholicism.⁷⁷ His death in 1900 was followed almost immediately by a couple of biographies, including one by his secretary, Collingwood, who was determined to preserve the flame, but not concerned with Catholicism.⁷⁸ For his Catholic friend, Meynell, Ruskin was the convert that got away, so she had much to say on his interest in Catholicism as well as on his teaching, but little on his influence on Catholicism.⁷⁹

Ruskin's reputation revived in the last decades of the twentieth century, led by Clark's book on the Gothic Revival.⁸⁰ The Ruskin revival continued with the publication of Tim Hilton's two-volume biography, which, though it dealt with Ruskin's interest in Catholicism, had nothing to say about his influence upon it.⁸¹ Wheeler's book on Ruskin's religion dealt briefly with Ruskin's fascination with Catholicism and his invention of his own 'wider' version, but ignored Ruskin's influence on Catholics.⁸² Wheeler's recent book on the clash between Catholics and Protestants in the fifty years that followed the restoration of the Catholic hierarchy covers Ruskin's early opposition to and later sympathy with

⁷⁷ E. T. Cook and Alexander Wedderburn (eds), *The Works of John Ruskin* (36 vols, George Allen, London 1903-12).

⁷⁸ W. G. Collingwood, *The Life of John Ruskin* (Riverside Press, Cambridge, 1902).

⁷⁹ Mrs [Alice] Meynell, *John Ruskin* (Blackwood, Edinburgh and London, 1900), passim.

⁸⁰ Kenneth Clark, *The Gothic Revival* (Pelican, Harmondsworth, 1964), pp. 176-96.

⁸¹ Tim Hilton, *John Ruskin: The Early Years* (Yale University Press, London, 1985); Tim Hilton, *John Ruskin: The Later Years* (Yale University Press, London, 2000).

⁸² Michael Wheeler, *Ruskin's God* (Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 1999), passim.

Catholicism. He does, however, mention Ruskin's inspiration of the Byzantine architectural revival in England, represented by Westminster Cathedral.⁸³

English Catholicism in the first half of the twentieth century, when Ruskin's influence on Catholicism was at its strongest, is the subject of some useful studies. Rockett's account of Catholic parish life in this period, argues that, despite poverty and discrimination, the laity were loyal in their support of the Church.⁸⁴ Hastings's account of the Church's reaction to the economic crisis of the nineteen-thirties is not one I recognise. He characterises the bishops and clergy as too obsessed with Catholic schools, which they regarded as the main method of perpetuating the community, to offer a serious response to the problem of unemployment. Worse still, he describes the lay intellectual elite as more concerned with culture than the economy, and this when the Distributist movement was at its height.⁸⁵ The seeds of this account are contained in an earlier essay in which he dismissed Belloc as a mere apologist and Catholic Action, one of the manifestations of Distributism, as crypto-Fascism.⁸⁶ A more balanced account of the English Catholic Church in the first half of the twentieth century is provided by Aspden. He argues that, though schools remained at the forefront of the concerns of bishops and priests, they were involved in encouraging the laity

⁸³ Wheeler, Michael, *The Old Enemies: Catholics and Protestants in Nineteenth-Century English Culture* (Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 2006), pp. 199- 209.

⁸⁴ June Rockett, *Held in Trust: Catholic Parishes in England and Wales 1900-1950* (St Austin Press, London, 2001), passim.

⁸⁵ Adrian Hastings, *A History of English Christianity 1920-1990* (SCM Press, London, 1991), pp. 131-58, 273-87,

⁸⁶ Hastings, 'Some reflexions on the English Catholicism of the late 1930s' in Hastings (ed.), *Bishops and Writers: Aspects of the Evolution of Modern English Catholicism* (Anthony Clark, Wheathampstead, 1977), pp. 107-126.

to engage in action to ameliorate the economic and social conditions of the people.⁸⁷ Lothian places the lay leaders of Distributism at the centre of the English Catholic Community in the first half of the twentieth century. He argues that Belloc and his disciples, McNabb, Gill, and Chesterton, formed an intellectual community that put forward a unified political, economic, and social ideology that dominated Catholic thought and had a wider impact.⁸⁸ Villis examines the flirtation of some Distributists with Fascism, and shows that, though the two ideologies sprang from a common reaction to the same problems of a crisis in liberal democracy and the threat of communism, they were not identical.⁸⁹ Distributism demonstrates the continued influence of Ruskin on English Catholicism, its concern with economic and social issues, and its willingness to engage with the wider community.

The historiography of early modern English Catholicism evinces a clear dialogue between Bossy, who put forward the hypothesis that the recusant community was a new phenomenon brought about by the seminary priests, and his critics, pre-eminently Haigh, who insisted that recusancy's roots lay in the pre-Reformation Church and that it owed its survival to the Marian clergy. Into this dialogue was inserted the view of Walsham and Questier that Church Popery was

⁸⁷ Kester Aspden, *Fortress Church: The English Roman Catholic Bishops and Politics 1903-63* (Gracewing, Leominster, 2002), pp. 20-75, 110-194, 234-62.

⁸⁸ James R. Lothian, *The Making and Unmaking of the English Catholic Intellectual Community, 1910-1950* (University of Notre Dame Press, Notre Dame, Indiana, 2009), passim.

⁸⁹ Tom Villis, *British Catholics and Fascism: Religious Identity and Political Extremism between the Wars* (Palgrave Macmillan, Basingstoke, 2013), passim.

just as important as recusancy in the history of English Catholicism. The underlying theme is the opposing stress on separation and integration.

The historiography of later modern English Catholicism does not display such a clear dialogue, but one is implicit in it. That dialogue is between on the one hand, the Cisalpines, who cherished the national culture of the English Church and sought an accommodation with the dominant Protestant culture, and on the other, the Ultramontanes, who aimed to romanise English Catholicism and denounced any compromise with Protestantism. That dialogue is represented by the Ultramontanism of Ward and the Liberalism of Holmes. Paradoxically, however, it was the arch-Ultramontane Manning who reached out to accept Ruskin's teaching in order to deal with the problems of the ordinary members of the English Catholic Church in a society changed completely by the Industrial Revolution.

Selected Publications (Websites in brackets do not have text online.)

14. 'Catholics in Elizabethan Durham', *Recusant History*, vol. 14 (1) (1979), pp. 1-8; www.journals.cambridge.org/BCH
15. 'The Cumbrian Catholics', *Northern History*, vol. XVI (1980), pp. 40-58; www.tandfonline.com
16. *Catholic Lancashire: From Reformation to Renewal 1559-1991* (Phillimore, Chichester, 1994), Chapter I, 'Reformation, 1559-1603', pp. 1-15; (www.phillimore.co.uk)
17. *Catholic Lancashire: From Reformation to Renewal 1559-1991* (Phillimore, Chichester, 1994), Chapter II, 'The Consolidation of the Catholic Community, 1603-42', pp. 16-23; (www.phillimore.co.uk)
18. 'Wigan Catholics and the Policies of James II', *North West Catholic History*, vol. I (3) (1969), pp. 97-110; www.nwcatholichistory.org.uk
19. 'The Recusant Commons in the North East, 1570-1642', *Northern Catholic History*, no. 12 (1980), pp. 3-13; (www.rcdhn.org.uk/general_directory)
20. 'The Catholic Poor: Paupers and Vagabonds 1580-1780' in Marie B. Rowlands (ed.), *Catholics of Parish and Town* (Catholic Record Society, London, 1999), pp. 115-28; (www.catholicrecordsociety.co.uk/)
21. ' "The Science of the Saints": The Spirituality of Butler's *Lives of the Saints*', *Recusant History*, vol. 15 (3) (1980), pp. 189-93; www.journals.cambridge.org/BCH
22. 'Lingard's Hornby' in J. A. Hilton (ed.), *Catholic Englishmen* (North West Catholic History Society, Wigan, 1984), pp. 37-44; (www.nwcatholichistory.org.uk/)
23. 'Lingard's Anglo-Saxonism: A Post-Colonial Reading' in Peter Phillips (ed.), *Lingard Remembered: Essays to Mark the Sesquicentenary of John Lingard's Death*, (Catholic Record Society, London, 2004), pp. 23-34; (www.catholicrecordsociety.co.uk/)
24. ' "The Case of Wigan": Catholic Congregationalism in the Age of Revolution', *North West Catholic History*, vol. X (1983), pp. 1-7; www.nwcatholichistory.org.uk
25. 'Catholic Congregationalism in Fleetwood, 1841-42', *North West Catholic History*, vol. XXVI (1999), pp. 62-69; www.nwcatholichistory.org.uk
26. 'Ruskinian Catholicism', *The Ruskin Review and Bulletin*, vol. 6 (2) (2010), pp. 5-15; (www.lancaster.ac.uk/fass/ruskin/research/publications.htm)

Critical Essay

The publications presented in this thesis cover the history of the post-Reformation English Catholic community from the Elizabethan Reformation to the eve of the Second Vatican Council. They examine the emergence of Catholic recusancy, chiefly in the North of England, and explore the development of new forms of Catholic organisation in the period of the Industrial Revolution. Together they make an original, coherent, and influential contribution to the history of post-Reformation English Catholicism.

The first seven publications deal with the post-Reformation English Catholic community under the anti-Catholic penal laws, examining the origin and consolidation of Catholic recusancy. In the debate about post-Reformation English Catholicism in the hundred years that followed the Elizabethan settlement, I maintain that, though at first Catholic sympathies and practices were widespread, recusancy was slow to emerge but increased towards the end of Elizabeth's reign. Recusancy was, however, never more than a small minority, even in Lancashire where it was strongest. Nevertheless, recusancy constituted the Catholic community, which it ensured would survive as a separate body.

Publication 1, 'Catholicism in Elizabethan Durham', ¹was the first academic account of the origins of recusancy in the region, developed from my M.Phil. thesis, which Questier has described as one of 'the seminal recusancy theses', ² a group of theses written in the 1960s and 1970s which mapped recusancy county by county in an attempt to assess the extent of recusancy. Before these theses appeared Catholic history had consisted largely of studies of the clergy, gentry families and martyrs, such as Blundell on Lancashire, and Bolton on Salford diocese.³ Counties were the areas covered, partly because county record offices made local sources available. The county was not only a unit of local government but also a form of local community, which bound at least the gentry together. Questier has criticised counting recusants on the grounds that recusancy was not necessarily the same as Catholicism.⁴ Nevertheless, in localities where recusancy was high it is possible to discern the formation of Catholic communities, ministered to by seminary priests and Jesuits. These communities continued in existence after recusancy ceased to be prosecuted as a crime, and formed the basis of the English Catholic Church as it still exists.⁵ As Bossy points out, the study

¹ Hilton, 'Catholicism in Elizabethan Durham', *Recusant History*, vol. 14 (1) (1977), pp. 1-8.

² Michael Questier, 'Conformity, Catholicism and the Law' in Peter Lake and Michael Questier, *Conformity and Orthodoxy in the English Church, c. 1560-1660*, p. 239, n.3.

³ F. O. Blundell, *Old Catholic Lancashire* (3 vols, Burns Oates and Washbourne, London, 1925-1941) Charles A. Bolton, *Salford Diocese and its Catholic Past* (Manchester, 1950).

⁴ Questier, *Ibid.*, pp. 237-61.

⁵ Marie B. Rowlands, 'Hidden People: Catholic Commoners, 1558-1625' in Rowlands (ed.) *English Catholics of Parish and Town 1558-1778* (Catholic Record Society, London, 1999), pp. 10-35; Rowlands, '1767 - The New People' in *ibid.*, pp. 286-352.

of these Catholic congregations is 'inconceivable' without the statistical and geographical data provided by 'recusant-hunting'.⁶

In pursuit of recusants I used a variety of central and local, governmental and ecclesiastical sources, and the few sources created by recusants themselves, such as the account by Richard Holtby, the Jesuit who organised the Durham mission, of the persecution of 1592-94.⁷

My research on County Durham confirmed the findings of Leatherbarrow and Haigh on Lancashire, Aveling on Yorkshire, and Wark on Cheshire.⁸ I pointed out, however, that Durham had its own peculiarities: the influence of bastard feudal Catholicism, which protected Catholic conservatism in County Durham, the proximity of the Newcastle hospitals, whose clergy maintained connections with Catholic refugee clergy at Louvain, and the work of Scottish priests, who reinforced the native Marian priests. I also pointed out the influence of Church Papists in protecting recusants, and the importance of the Jesuit network of safe houses, and I concluded that the Catholic community was increasingly dominated by the gentry.

⁶ John Bossy, 'Recusant History and after', *British Catholic History*, vol. 32 (3) (2015), p. 273.

⁷ John Morris (ed.), *The Troubles of our Catholic Forefathers* (3 vols, London, Burns and Oates, 1872-77), vol. III, pp. 187-94.

⁸ J. Stanley Leatherbarrow, *The Lancashire Elizabethan Recusants* (Chetham Society, vol. 110, Manchester 1947); Christopher Haigh, *Reformation and Resistance in Tudor Lancashire* (Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 1975); Hugh Aveling, *Post-Reformation Catholicism in East Yorkshire, 1558-1790* (East Yorkshire Local History Series, number 11, York, 1960); Aveling, 'The Catholic Recusants of the West Riding of Yorkshire 1558-1790', *Proceedings of the Leeds Philosophical and Literary Society* (Leeds, 1963); Aveling, *Northern Catholics: The Catholics of the North Riding of Yorkshire 1558-1790* (Geoffrey Chapman, London, 1966); Aveling, *Catholic Recusancy in the City of York 1558-1791* (Catholic Record Society, London, 1970); K. R. Wark, *Elizabethan Recusancy in Cheshire* (Chetham Society, new series, volume 19, Manchester, 1971).

This article was the first and most widely recognised of my contributions to the history of the origins of recusancy. In his survey of Elizabethan and early Stuart Catholicism, Dures described the strength of Catholicism in Country Durham in the period between the Elizabethan Settlement of 1559 and the Northern Rising of 1569, and cited as its source my 'Catholicism in Elizabethan Durham' (which he mistakenly referred to as 'Recusancy in Elizabethan Durham').⁹ Haigh included my 'Catholicism in Elizabethan Durham' 'among the best' local studies.¹⁰

Some of my other work on Catholicism in the North-East was cited by Wright for the continuity of Catholicism in the region and in England as a whole,¹¹ and by Doran in support of her mistaken conclusion that by the mid-1580s 'popular Catholicism all but died out'.¹²

My work on northern Catholicism also influenced Walsham's ground-breaking study of Church Papists. She used my account of conformist husbands to show the importance of Church Popery in ensuring the survival of recusancy amongst the gentry and amongst 'the middling sort'.¹³

Braddock, drew on my articles on Elizabethan Durham, Jacobean Durham, and Elizabethan Northumberland¹⁴ in his discussion of the survival and revival of Catholicism in the long seventeenth century to argue that the role of the gentry in

⁹ Alan Dures, *English Catholicism 1558-1642* (Longman, Harlow, 1983), p. 5.

¹⁰ Christopher Haigh, *English Reformations: Religion, Politics, and Society under the Tudors* (Oxford University Press, Oxford, 1993), p. 341.

¹¹ A. D. Wright, 'Catholic History, North and South', *Northern History*, vol. XIV (1978), pp. 126-51.

¹² Susan Doran, *Elizabeth I and Religion 1558-1603* (Routledge, London, 1994), p. 55.

¹³ Alexandra Walsham, *Church Papist: Catholicism, Conformity and Confessional Polemic in Early Modern England* (The Boydell Press, Woodbridge, 1999), p. 78.

¹⁴ Hilton, 'Catholicism in Jacobean Durham', *Recusant History*, vol. 14 (2) (1977), pp. 73-87; Hilton, 'Catholicism in Elizabethan Northumberland', *Northern History*, vol. XIII (1977), pp. 44-85.

the survival of Catholicism reflected the limitations as well as the capacity of the English state.¹⁵

Paxton used my work to argue that, because Lancashire took no part in the Northern Rising of 1569 and therefore did not suffer persecution in its aftermath, Catholicism remained stronger in Lancashire than in the North-East, which did.¹⁶

Questier, however, has been more critical, rejecting my conclusion that after the Rising of 1569 the North-Eastern Catholics lost any real appetite for revolt,¹⁷ and I return to this issue in my 'Conclusion'.

Although this article did emphasise the importance of Church Popery, it did so only in so far as it protected recusancy, rather than in its own right, as demonstrated by Walsham and Questier.¹⁸ As Walsham remarks of her *Church Papists*, historical publications are 'the products of particular historiographical moments',¹⁹ so I did not anticipate her research. Nevertheless, I maintain that my approach was and remains sound in so far as it was concerned to show how a separate recusant community emerged and survived.

¹⁵ Michael J. Braddick, *State Formation in Early Modern England c. 1550-1700* (Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 2000), pp. 303-304.

¹⁶ Nicholas Paxton, 'The Survival of Catholicism in Elizabethan Lancashire – A Single Movement?', *North West Catholic History*, vol. XXXVIII (2011), pp. 5-23.

¹⁷ Michael Questier, 'Practical Antipapistry during the reign of Elizabeth I', *The Journal of British Studies*, vol. 36 (1997), p. 378.

¹⁸ Walsham, *Church Papists*, passim; Walsham, "'Yielding to the Extremity of the Time": Conformity, Orthodox and the Post-Reformation Catholic Community' in Peter Lake and Michael Questier (eds), *Community and Orthodoxy in the English Church, c.1560-1660* (Boydell Press, Woodbridge, 2000), pp. 211-236; Questier, 'Conformity, Catholicism and the Law' in *ibid.*, pp. 237-61.

¹⁹ Walsham, *Church Papists*, p. xi.

Publication 2, ‘The Cumbrian Catholics’,²⁰ explored the origins and continued fortunes of recusancy in Cumbria, the counties of Cumberland and Westmorland, and the Furness district of Lancashire. My curiosity had been aroused by Bossy’s conclusion that ‘the extreme North-west displayed ... an imperviousness to Catholicism [after 1559]’, so that, with the exception of one or two aristocratic and gentry houses, by the time of the Civil War, ‘it had lost all connection with Catholicism’.²¹

How could it be that one of the ‘dark corners of the land’,²² the region most remote from the central government in London, and consisting primarily of rugged mountains, where ignorance, superstition, and Catholicism might be expected to flourish, was virtually devoid of Catholic recusants? Very little work had been done on recusancy in the region, except for an account of Elizabethan recusancy by Bouch, which had anticipated Bossy’s conclusion.²³

I therefore set out to prove Bossy wrong. At the same time, I decided to take the long view, the *longue durée*, rather than concentrating on the period following the Elizabethan settlement of religion, so as to show the continuity and evolution of post-Reformation English Catholicism in the manner of Bossy, Aveling, and

²⁰ Hilton, ‘The Cumbrian Catholics’, *Northern History*, vol. XVI (1980), pp. 40-58.

²¹ John Bossy, *The Catholic Community 1570-1850* (Darton, Longman and Todd (London, 1975), p. 96.

²² J. E. C. Hill, ‘Puritans and “the Dark Corners of the Land”’, *Transactions of the Royal Historical Society*, 5th series, vol. 13 (1963), pp. 77-102.

²³ C. M. L. Bouch, *Prelates and People of the Lake Counties: A History of the Diocese of Carlisle 1333-1933* (Titus Wilson and Son Ltd, Kendal, 1948), pp. 196-224.

Delumeau.²⁴ I used a collection of obvious sources, such as the various official lists of recusants compiled by the magistrates and the clergy, and manuscripts in the county record offices, such as the Cumberland Protestation Returns. I was obliged, however, to accept Bossy's conclusion that Catholicism became almost extinct in Cumbria. I found that there were few recusants in sixteenth- and seventeenth-century Cumbria, and that the numbers declined until the last quarter of the eighteenth century when a recovery began. I concluded that the reason for the small number of recusants was implied by Bossy's contention that English Catholicism was revived by the seminary priests. Few seminary priests worked in this remote and isolated region, and, therefore, Cumbrian recusancy, never strong, declined.²⁵

The nadir was reached about 1773 when there were only two clerical missions. Thereafter there was some increase. These developments confirmed the view that the number of Catholics depended on the number of priests, who were still dependent on the gentry for support. By 1840, however, Irish Catholic immigration had begun into western Cumbria.²⁶

This account was accepted by Doran in her survey of Elizabeth religion. Citing my article she concluded that Catholicism

²⁴ Bossy, *Catholic Community*, passim; J. C. H. Aveling, *The Handle and the Axe: The Catholic Recusants in England from Reformation to Emancipation* (BBlond and Briggs, Colchester, 1976), passim; Jean Delumeau, *Catholicism between Luther and Voltaire* (Burns and Oates, London, 1977), passim.

²⁵ Hilton, 'Cumbrian Catholics', pp. 48, 54

²⁶ *Ibid.*, pp. 52-57.

... failed to survive in areas such as ... Cumberland or Westmorland where it had been strong in the 1560s but where the seminary priests failed to penetrate in the 1580s.²⁷

Parkinson's study of Catholics in Furness, a district formerly part of the county of Lancashire, but geographically (and now administratively) part of Cumbria, bore out my argument.²⁸

In her Ph.D. thesis on the Layburne family, Alison Wright noted that I concurred with Bossy in giving most of the credit for the creation of the post-Reformation Catholic community to the seminary priests.²⁹

Eventually, however, the above account and explanation, that Cumbrian Catholicism declined in the seventeenth century because it was starved of priests, came under attack by critics who responded directly to Bossy's remarks and to my article, and this was a strong reason for choosing to submit it as part of this thesis. I, therefore, return to this issue in my 'Conclusion'.

Mullett remarks in his essay on Catholics in Penrith, 'While J. A. Hilton is right to note the relative weakness of post-Reformation "Cumbrian" Catholicism, certainly compared with that of "Catholic Lancashire" ... the old faith certainly

²⁷ Susan Doran, *Elizabeth I and Religion 1558-1603* (Routledge, London, 1994), p. 62.

²⁸ Anne C. Parkinson, *A History of Catholicism in the Furness Peninsula 1127-1997* (University of Lancaster, Centre for North West Regional Studies, Lancaster, 1998), pp. 18-106.

²⁹ F. Alison Wright, 'The Layburns and their World circa 1620-1720, the English Catholic Community and the House of Stuart' (unpublished Ph.D. thesis, St Andrews University, 2002), pp. 4-5.

had its adherents in this part of the world', ³⁰ but those adherents were few and far between. There are indications that the Cumbrian Catholic community declined in the later seventeenth century, but it began to increase in the later eighteenth century, and was reinforced by Irish immigration.³¹

My study of Cumbrian Catholicism confirms my conclusions about English Catholicism that by the end of Elizabeth's reign it had been reduced to a very small minority, dependent on the gentry, but that about the end of the eighteenth century it began to increase in numbers and to evolve from a rural into an urban community.

Publication 3, *Catholic Lancashire*, Chapter I, 'Reformation, 1559-1603':³² this book was the first serious attempt to cover the whole history of the post-Reformation Catholic community in Lancashire from the Elizabethan settlement of religion to the aftermath of the Second Vatican Council. This opening chapter was a reconsideration of my own research on Lancashire with that of Leatherbarrow and Haigh, together with John Walton's excellent survey of religion from 1558 to 1660.³³

³⁰ Michael Mullett, "'Composed Entirely of the Poorest Class": The Establishment of the Parish of St Catherine, Penrith, Cumbria, 1833-50' in John Davies and Allan Mitchinson *'Obstinate Souls': Essays presented to J. A. Hilton on the occasion of his seventieth birthday* (North West Catholic History Society, Wigan, 2011), p. 30.

³¹ Hilton, 'Cumbrian Catholics', pp. 56-57.

³² Hilton, *Catholic Lancashire: From Reformation to Renewal* (Phillimore, Chichester, 1994), Chapter I, pp. 1-15.

³³ Leatherbarrow, *The Lancashire Elizabethan Recusants*, passim; Haigh, *Reformation and Resistance in Tudor Lancashire*, pp. 209-332; John K. Walton, *Lancashire: a social history, 1558-1939* (Manchester University Press, Manchester, 1987), pp. 36-59.

As I had done with Cumbria, I applied to Lancashire a consideration of the *longue durée* to show the evolution of an English Catholic Church distinct from the Church of England established by Elizabeth I. Moreover, I insisted that the continued existence and expansion of Catholicism as a distinct community from the conformist and increasingly Protestant majority meant that Catholics had to be recusants rather than Church Papists:

Whatever went on in the minds and hearts of men and women, practising Catholics, which in the 16th and 17th centuries meant recusants, were a small but growing minority responding to the call of their priests 'to be plainly and openly Catholics'.³⁴

I showed that Catholicism in Elizabethan Lancashire had the same characteristics as Catholicism in the rest of the North, and, indeed, elsewhere in England: religious conservatism ministered to by conservative conformist clerics gave way to Protestant conformism or to recusancy ministered to by seminary priests, and centred on the seigneurial household. Lancashire, however, was perhaps different from other counties in the strength of its popular and urban Catholicism, centred in towns, such as Wigan, made up of the recusant wives, daughters, and widows, of conformist burgesses.

I emphasized the severity of the collapse of Catholicism under the Elizabethan regime, its fall from a Church to a sect. Furthermore I argued that, although the Lancashire recusant community was the largest in England, it was, by the end of

³⁴ Hilton, *Catholic Lancashire*, p. 12.

Elizabeth's reign, still a very small minority, about 0.4 per cent of the population: 'a pathetic remnant'.³⁵ In considering the causes of the emergence and strength of Catholic recusancy in Lancashire, while most scholars, including Leatherbarrow, Haigh, Walton, and Bossy,³⁶ gave equal weight to a variety of factors, I insisted on the decisive roles of Vaux and Allen. Vaux circulated the papal ruling against conformity and succeeded in persuading a number of gentry to obey it. Allen ensured the continued survival of recusant Catholicism by the creation of the English continental seminaries, as well as forming his own network of recusant family and friends. 'Lancastrian Catholicism was to a certain degree the extended family of Vaux and Allen ...'.³⁷ In outlining its geographical distribution, concentrated in the west and north of the county, I pointed out that ... even in the so-called Catholic areas, Catholics were in a minority.

The relative success of Catholicism in Lancashire should not blind us to the overwhelming success of Protestantism ...³⁸

This chapter covers the opening phase of the history of a community that exists to this day, the over-arching theme of my work. The Elizabethan persecution failed to destroy Catholicism in Lancashire, and under the early Stuarts the number of recusants fell and rose, as the penal laws were applied or not.

³⁵ Hilton, *Catholic Lancashire*, p. 6.

³⁶ Leatherbarrow, *Lancashire Elizabethan Recusants*, pp. 152-60; Haigh, *Reformation and Resistance*, pp. 247-68; Walton, *Lancashire*, pp. 445-48; Bossy, *English Catholic Community*, pp. 91-95.

³⁷ *Ibid.*, pp. 8-9

³⁸ *Ibid.*, pp. 11-12.

This chapter of my book has been influential and is cited widely. Mitchinson, Tom Smith, and Paxton have acknowledged it for the influence of Allen and Vaux. Mullett, Findlay, and Dutton use it as background for some of their own work.³⁹

Langton in his historical geography of Catholic Lancashire engaged with my book in more detail, and demonstrated the value of the *longue durée*. Langton's article set out to demonstrate Lancashire's regional culture, characterised by the persistence of Catholicism from the sixteenth to the early nineteenth century, to demonstrate 'how much geographical continuity there was in Lancashire Catholicism'.⁴⁰ Langton, however, tends to overestimate the strength of Catholicism in Lancashire, and I return to this issue in my 'Conclusion'.

I supplemented my synthesis of writing on Elizabethan Catholic Lancashire with original material, much of which had been underused by earlier historians. I used the documents published in Law's edition of Vaux's *Catechism*, including Vaux's letter conveying the papal ban on attendance at the Church of England's services, the response of some of the gentry, and the reaction of the local and central government, to assess his contribution to the emergence of recusancy – the creation of community of recusant gentry in south-western Lancashire –

³⁹ Allan Mitchinson, *Catholicism in Standish: From Persecution to Parish 1559-1884* (North West Catholic History Society [NWCHS]), Wigan, 2005), p. 85. T. A. Smith, *Catholics in Preston: From Early to Modern Times* (NWCHS, Wigan, 2008), pp. 29-30; Nicholas Paxton, 'The Survival of Catholics in Elizabethan Lancashire – A Single Movement', *NWCH*, vol. XXXVIII (2011), p. 10; Michael Mullett, 'The Reformation in the parish of Whalley' in Robert Poole (ed.), *The Lancashire Witches: Histories and Stories* (Manchester University Press, Manchester, 2002) p. 96; Alison Findlay and Richard Dutton, 'Introduction' in Findlay and Dutton, *Region, religion and patronage: Lancastrian Shakespeare* (Manchester University Press, Manchester, 2003), p. 6.

⁴⁰ John Langton, 'The continuity of regional culture: Lancashire Catholicism from the late sixteenth to the early nineteenth century' in Edward Royle (ed.), *Issues of Regional Identity: In honour of John Marshall* (Manchester University Press, Manchester, 1998), pp. 82-101.

which I considered undervalued.⁴¹ I also used the 'Book of Recusants', a list of recusants parish by parish, compiled by the ecclesiastical authorities for the privy council in 1595,⁴² to survey recusancy in Lancashire and to notice the shopkeepers of Wigan and the poor vagrants in some places.

Publication 4, *Catholic Lancashire*, Chapter II, 'The Consolidation of the Catholic Community, 1603-42'⁴³, addressed the consolidation of the largest Catholic county community under the early Stuarts, the completion of its separation from the Church of England, and the creation of its own formal ecclesiastical institutions, which nobody had attempted before.

It considered some of the issues more recently tackled by Questier, who points out that some interpretations of the pre-Civil War Catholic community 'have a tendency to mislead... because their *terminus ad quem* is usually 1603'.⁴⁴ Indeed, until recently the only serious attempt to consider Jacobean Catholics in their own right was an essay by Bossy.⁴⁵ Similarly, there was little on the Caroline Catholics other than Havran's book'.⁴⁶

⁴¹ Hilton, *Catholic Lancashire*, pp. 7-9; Thomas Graves Law (ed.), *A Catechisme of Christian Doctrine* (Chetham Society, Manchester, 1885), pp. xxxi-xlix; Hilton, *The Historiography of Laurence Vaux* (North West Catholic History Society, Wigan, 2015), *passim*.

⁴² Clare Talbot (ed.), *Miscellanea: Recusant Records* (Catholic Record Society, London, 1961), pp. 70-86.

⁴³ Hilton, *Catholic Lancashire*, Chapter II, 'The Consolidation of the Catholic Community', pp. 16-23.

⁴⁴ Michael Questier, *Catholicism and Community in Early Modern England: Politics, Aristocratic Patronage and Religion, c. 1550-1640* (Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 2006), p. 19.

⁴⁵ John Bossy, 'The English Catholic Community 1603-1623' in Alan G. R. Smith (ed.), *The Reign of James VI and I* (Macmillan, London, 1973), pp. 91-195.

⁴⁶ Martin J. Havran, *The Catholics in Caroline England* (Stanford University Press, Stanford, California, and Oxford University Press, London, 1961), p. vii.

I insisted that, even where they were most numerous, Catholic recusants were in the minority, so that the Catholic village of Little Crosby, whose squire boasted that it contained not a single Protestant,⁴⁷ was the exception that proved the rule.

I demonstrated that the Catholic community was dominated by the gentry, who constituted half of the county gentry. Nevertheless, I pointed out that the gentry were heavily outnumbered by ordinary Catholics, who, especially the yeomen, also harboured priests. Moreover, Catholics tended to be concentrated in towns such as Preston, which by 1605 had its own chapel, the majority of its congregants living in the town.

My discussion of urban Catholicism has been influential. Rowlands used this example to argue that, though seigneurialism remained the dominant form of recusancy, by the early seventeenth century there were urban centres of recusancy, independent of the gentry, with their own chapels and priests.⁴⁸ Mullett, in a survey of the progress of Protestantism in the towns of the North-West, also refers to Preston, arguing that Manchester was exceptional in its Protestantism, remarking 'And of course Hilton is right: "Lancastrian Catholicism was ... an urban phenomenon"'.⁴⁹

I showed that priests from Lancashire played a significant part in the adoption of a detailed formal ecclesiastical organisation for the first time since the

⁴⁷ Hilton, *Catholic Lancashire*, p. 42.

⁴⁸ Marie B. Rowlands, 'Hidden People, 1558-1625' in Rowlands (ed.), *Catholics of Parish and Town 1558-1778* (Catholic Records Society, London, 1999), p. 29.

⁴⁹ Michael Mullett, 'The Urban Reformation in North-Western England', *North West Catholic History*, vol. XXXI (2004), pp. 15, 18.

Elizabethan Reformation, though this organisation led to disputes between the secular and the regular clergy, and between the clergy and the laity, that were to bedevil the community well into the nineteenth century. The Jesuit mission in Lancashire was organised in 1622 by its superior, the Lancastrian John Worthington. They were also joined by the English Benedictines, whose superior was the Lancastrian Augustine Smith. These monks were re-organised as the English Benedictine Congregation in 1619, largely as a result of the work of the Lancastrian Anselm Beech.

The characteristics of the community so consolidated – still dominated by the gentry but with a vigorous popular Catholicism and a newly organised clergy - remained constant until the Industrial Revolution and beyond.

Again, I used sources that had been published, to illumine this early Stuart Catholicism. I used the report of the vicar of Prescott to the bishop of Chester to support my contention that even in the most Catholic parts of the most Catholic county, the recusant community was fundamentally weak and could easily be subdued by firm government and Protestant preaching. I used another document in the same collection, a presentment from Farnworth chapelry, to analyse recusancy within this typical chapelry. I also used a list of recusants compiled by the leading Catholic clergy and gentry for the subsidy of 1639 to outline the distribution of the missions in Lancashire.⁵⁰ Furthermore, I used the contemporary biography of Ambrose Barlow to outline the work of this Benedictine, who was

⁵⁰ Talbot (ed.), *Miscellanea*, pp. 146-50; Godfrey Anstruther, 'Lancashire Clergy in 1639', *Recusant History*, vol. 5 (1) (1957), pp. 38-46.

maintained by the Tyldesley family of gentry, but did not live with them and worked amongst the poor.⁵¹ I also used this and a number of other sources, such as the report of a pilgrimage to the shrine of St Winefride in 1629 to explore the devotional life of Catholics, both gentry and commoners.⁵²

Publication 5, 'Wigan Catholics and the Policies of James II',⁵³ examined the response of Catholics to James II's policy of granting them toleration, which involved the appointment of many of them to office, and elevated them to a political ascendancy, a process which alienated the Protestant majority. (I followed it with a series of regional studies.⁵⁴) Wigan provided an interesting test case, as it had a large Catholic minority, a Nonconformist minority that also might be expected to welcome toleration, and a strong tradition of Tory Anglican loyalty to the crown. This case could be investigated in the hitherto unused archives of the borough (the records of the borough administration) and

⁵¹ W. E. Rhodes (ed.), 'The Apostolical Life of Ambrose Barlow', *Chetham Miscellanies* (Chetham Sociest, Manchester, new series vol. 2, 1909)

⁵² Paul Hook (ed.), 'Catholic Registers of Holywell, Flintshire', 1698-1829' in *Miscellanea III* (Catholic Record Society, London, vol. 3, 1906), p. 108.

⁵³ Hilton, 'Wigan Catholics and the Policies of James II', *North West Catholic History*, vol. I (3) (1969), pp. 97-110.

⁵⁴ J. A. Hilton, 'The Catholic Ascendancy in the Worcester Region, 1685-88', *Worcestershire Recusant*, vol. XXIV (1975), pp. 2-7; Hilton, 'The Catholic Ascendancy in London and the Home Counties', *London Recusant*, vol. V (2) (1975), pp. 78-83; Hilton, 'The Catholic Ascendancy in the South-West, 1685-88', *London Recusant*, vol. VII (2) (1977), pp. 68-72; Hilton, 'The Catholic Ascendancy in Wales and the Marches, 1685-88', *Worcestershire Recusant*, vol. XXX (1977), pp. 3-8; Hilton, 'The Catholic Ascendancy in the Eastern Counties, 1685-88', *Essex Recusant*, vol. XX (1) (1978), pp. 15-23; Hilton, 'The Catholic Ascendancy in the Midlands, 1685-88', *Staffordshire Catholic History*, vol. XVIII (1978), pp. 15-18; Hilton, 'The Catholic Ascendancy in the North, 1685-88', *North West Catholic History*, vol. V (1978), pp. 1-13; Hilton, 'The Catholicism of the Ascendancy, 1685-88', *London Recusant*, new series vol. I (1981), pp. 60-67; Hilton, 'The Anglo-Celtic Catholic Ascendancy, 1685-91', *North West Catholic History*, vol. XIX (1992), pp. 1-6.

the neglected published papers of the county administration (the correspondence between local men and the county clerk of the peace). If James's policies failed in Wigan, they were unlikely to succeed elsewhere. As well as demonstrating the extent of James's failure, Wigan also demonstrated the extent of his success and of his support from local Catholic gentry, who supported the opening of a chapel and a school by the Jesuits, and flocked to receive confirmation from the newly appointed vicar apostolic.⁵⁵ Moreover, the Catholic gentry accepted office from the King in both the county and the borough, and, though they were soon ejected, many became active Jacobites.⁵⁶ The Catholic gentry remained eager to participate in politics.

Describing the events of 1688 in Wigan, however, I recorded that on 6 September the majority of the common council of the borough refused to re-elect the Catholic mayor and elected a Protestant. I found this difficult to reconcile with the fact that the Catholic mayor was still in office on 11 September. In note 77, I speculated that the date of the letter describing this event might have been incorrectly transcribed.⁵⁷ As part of the research for this thesis I consulted the original in the Lancashire Record Office, and the date of the letter was correctly transcribed. I failed to realise that, in fact, from 6 September to 23 October, when the corporation elected a new Protestant mayor, there

⁵⁵ J. A. Hilton, A. J. Mitchinson, Barbara Murray and Peggy Wells (eds), *Bishop Leyburn's Confirmation Register of 1687* (North West Catholic History Society, Wigan, 1997), pp. 165-82.

⁵⁶ Hilton, *Catholic Lancashire*, pp. 44-52, 64-65.

⁵⁷ Hilton, 'Wigan Catholic and the Policies of James II', *North West Catholic History*, vol. I (43) (1969), pp. 106-107, and note 17.

seem to have been two rival mayors in Wigan, and, as Mullett noted, the Catholic one was still protesting that he was the real mayor on 11 November.⁵⁸ This state of affairs shows how divided the town was, and how fluid the situation was in late 1688.

This article was cited by Williams arguing that the Catholic ascendancy in Wigan and elsewhere 'had provoked an unsurprising backlash'. He cited the article again arguing that in general the urban presence of Catholicism provoked Protestant violence.⁵⁹ It also prompted Whitehead's study of the network of Jesuit schools opened in that period, which put into practice James's policy of toleration by offering education to both Catholics and Protestants, which confirmed my work.⁶⁰

Miller's study of the reign confirms my contention that by 1685 the Catholics were too few to reverse the Reformation. He dealt not only with the politics but also with the religion of Catholics; he described the laity and the clergy, and the missionary campaign launched by James.⁶¹ That campaign failed because, Miller

⁵⁸ Mullett, ' "A Receptacle for Papists and an Assilum": Catholicism in Disorder in Late Seventeenth-Century Wigan', *The Catholic Historical Review*, vol. LXXIII (3) (1987), p. 406.

⁵⁹ J. Anthony Williams, 'Change or Decay? The Provincial Laity 1691-1781' in Eamonn Duffy (ed.), *Challoner and his Church* (Darton, Longman and Todd, London, 1981), pp. 46-71; Williams 'No Popery Violence in 1688: Revolt in the Provinces' in G. A. M. Janssens and A. G. A. M. Aarts (eds), *Studies in Seventeenth-Century English Literature, History and Bibliography* (Editions Rodopi B. V., Amsterdam, 1984), p. 257.

⁶⁰ Maurice Whitehead, "'Violently pulled down": The English Jesuit Educational Experiment of 1687-88' in John Davies and Allan Mitchinson (eds), *'Obstinate Souls': Essays presented to J. A. Hilton on the occasion of his seventieth birthday by the North West Catholic History Society* (North West Catholic History, Wigan, 2011), pp. 1-14.

⁶¹ John Miller, *Popery and Politics in England 1660-1688* (Cambridge University Press, London, 1973), *passim*.

argues, James did not have sufficient resources to convert the Protestant majority who 'simply did not *want* to turn Catholic'.⁶²

Miller's book prompted me to use Duckett's collection of sources on local government under James,⁶³ and I began a series of regional and national studies of the Catholic ascendancy, showing the numbers of Catholic officials appointed by James in county and borough government. I also described the programme of opening Catholic chapels and schools,⁶⁴ aimed not only to answer Catholic needs but also to bring about conversions. These articles were used by Rowlands arguing that the king began a campaign, supported by the recusant gentry, of Catholic chapel-building in the towns.⁶⁵ Sowerby's recent book also cites these articles but points out that the majority of new borough officials were Anglicans and Presbyterians, because there were not enough Catholics.⁶⁶ On the other hand, Pincus, who argues that the king was intent on introducing an English version of Gallican Catholicism,⁶⁷ is over impressed by the strength of

⁶² Ibid., p. 239.

⁶³ Sir G. F. Duckett, *Penal Laws and Test Act 1687-8* (2 vols, London, 1882-3), passim.

⁶⁴ Hilton, 'The Catholic Ascendancy in London and the Home Counties', *London Recusant*, vol. V (2) (1975), pp. 78-83; Hilton, 'The Catholic Ascendancy in the South-West', *London Recusant*, vol. VII (2) (1977), pp. 68-72; Hilton, 'The Catholic Ascendancy in Wales and the Marches', *Worcestershire Recusant*, vol. XXX (1977), pp. -8; Hilton, 'The Catholic Ascendancy in the Eastern Counties', *Essex Recusant*, vol. XX (1) (1978), pp. 13-23; Hilton, 'The Catholic Ascendancy in the Midlands', *Staffordshire Catholic History*, vol. I. V (1978), pp. 1-13; Hilton, 'The Catholicism of the Ascendancy, 1685-88', *London Recusant*, new series vol. I (1981).pp. 6-67; Hilton, 'The Anglo-Celtic Catholic Ascendancy, 1685-91', *North West Catholic History*, vol. XIX, pp. 1-6.

⁶⁵ Marie B. Rowlands, 'Surviving the Times, 1625-90' in Rowlands (ed.), *English Catholics of Parish and Town*, (Catholic Record Society, London, 1999), p. 70 and n. 25.

⁶⁶ Scott Sowerby, *Making Toleration: The Repealers and the Glorious Revolution* (Harvard University Press, Cambridge, Mass., 1993), p. 143.

⁶⁷ Steve Pincus, *1688: The First Modern Revolution* (Yale University Press, New Haven, 2009), pp.182-220.

Catholicism, and argues that the conversion of England was possible.⁶⁸ This conclusion is over-optimistic, and is not borne out by my work or Miller's.

Nevertheless, the Catholic ascendancy holds up a mirror to the English Protestant Reformation. Within fifty years of the accession of Elizabeth I, England had been changed from a Catholic to a Protestant country, because the Reformation had not only sufficient popular support but also effective support from significant sections of the elite. James II and his supporters hoped to reverse this process, but a hundred years later the Catholic recusant gentry and nobility were even more isolated, his policies alarmed his opponents who feared that he might succeed, and the king had too little support to carry them through.

Publication 6, 'The Recusant Commons in the North East, 1570-1642',⁶⁹ was a pioneering study of popular Catholicism. While surveying recusancy in the North of England, I realised that in concentrating on the leadership of the Catholic community, the clergy and the gentry, I was ignoring the majority, those lay men and women below the rank of gentry. I also realised that these ordinary Catholics were in the sources, alongside the priests and gentlefolk. It was, therefore, possible to find out about popular Catholicism by taking what Tosh calls 'the oblique method of exploiting historical evidence',⁷⁰ that is by asking different questions of sources. Quite simply, while I had previously looked at the various

⁶⁸ Ibid., pp. 165-66.

⁶⁹ Hilton, 'The Recusant Commons in the North East, 1570-1642', *Northern Catholic History*, no 12 (1980), pp. 3-13,

⁷⁰ Tosh, *The Pursuit of History*, p. 61.

lists of recusants, such as the returns of the clergy and the recusant rolls, to find the gentry, I now looked at them to find the commoners. Given the small population of the average parish, recusants of all ranks were visible to the parochial authorities and appeared in the records.

Using these sources, I produced this article on the recusant commons. Although I accepted that recusancy was dominated by the gentry, I showed that by 1640 sixty per cent of recusants were not members of the gentry, though many were dependent on the recusant gentry. The bulk of recusant commoners, therefore, lived in or near seigneurial Catholic households, but there were a few scattered recusant commoners. In the 1590s less than twenty per cent of recusants were yeomen, more than twenty per cent were husbandmen, craftsmen etc, and there were a few vagrants and poor prisoners. By the early seventeenth century, however, over forty per cent of recusants were yeomen, and the records tended to concentrate on this class and the gentry, presumably because the authorities were concerned with those who could afford to pay the recusancy fines. Some regular clergy, travelling on foot, worked amongst the poor, often administering exorcism, because, according to the latest study of that rite. 'Exorcism became one of the main methods of bringing about ... conversions'.⁷¹ I could only speculate on the devotional life of the common people but pointed out that books of devotion were available to the yeomen, while the rosary remained a traditional aid to prayer for all classes. I concluded that this popular Catholicism formed 'a

⁷¹ Brian P. Levack, *The Devil Within: Possession and Exorcism in the Christian West* (Yale University Press, New Haven, 2013), pp. 91-99.

submerged, shifting sub-culture', 'a Catholic underworld' alongside 'the Catholic underground of the clergy and gentry'.⁷²

Blackwood followed my lead. Having produced a corpus of work on the Lancashire gentry,⁷³ he turned to plebeian Catholics during the Civil War and Interregnum.⁷⁴ He pointed out that 'most historians have either neglected plebeian Catholics, or else played down their importance'. He summarised my article in his own which surveyed Catholic commoners elsewhere, and showed that there were few recusants of the middle sort. He concluded that in the 1640s and 1650s Catholicism remained 'essentially seigneurial' but that Lancashire had 'a fair number of plebeian Catholic communities'.⁷⁵

Blackwood's article and mine were trail-blazing attempts on the subject, in so far as, though there had been some treatment of the recusant commons in national and regional surveys, nobody else had produced regional studies that concentrated on recusants below the rank of gentry.

⁷² Hilton, 'Recusant Commons in the North East', p. 11.

⁷³ B. G. Blackwood, 'The Lancashire Cavaliers and their Tenants', *Transactions of the Historic Society of Lancashire and Cheshire*, vol. 117 (1965), pp. 17-32; Blackwood, 'The Cavalier and Roundhead Gentry of Lancashire', *Transactions of the Lancashire and Cheshire Antiquarian Society*, vol. 77 (1967), pp. 77-96; Blackwood, 'The Catholic and Protestant Gentry of Lancashire during the Civil War period', *Transactions of the Historic Society of Lancashire and Cheshire*, vol. 126 (1976), pp. 1-29; Blackwood, 'The Economic State of the Lancashire Gentry on the Eve of the Civil War', *Northern History*, vol. XII (1976), pp. 53-83; Blackwood, *The Lancashire Gentry and the Great Rebellion 1640-60* (Chetham Society, Manchester, 1978).

⁷⁴ Blackwood, 'Plebeian Catholics in the 1640s and 1650s', *Recusant History*, vol. 18 (1) (May 1986), pp. 42-58.

⁷⁵ Blackwood, pp. 42-58.

Publication 7, 'The Catholic Poor: Paupers and Vagabonds 1580-1780,'⁷⁶

appeared in a collection of essays on the Catholic commons.

As the editor wrote:

The purpose of this volume is to examine the experiences of a group which has attracted less attention, namely the Catholics of the common sort who make up the vast majority of those named in the records of Catholics.⁷⁷

The book contained an 'Introduction' that dealt with problems of definition, citing Blackwood, Aveling, and myself, and a number of essays on the subject. Bossy pays tribute to Rowlands's book on a subject 'inadequately recognised, I guess, in such narratives as my own'.⁷⁸

I was drawn to the study of Catholic paupers and vagabonds because they suffered under the double burden of the recusancy laws and the Poor Law. Once again, I was able to ask new questions of well-known sources, such as the recusant rolls, and the returns of the clergy, including the national return of 1767, to arrive at new conclusions about the extent of Catholicism amongst the poor. This article, therefore, covered a narrower social range than the North-Eastern article but dealt with the country as a whole over a longer period, to provide an overview of Catholics of the very lowest class. This class, which included the

⁷⁶ Hilton, 'The Catholic Poor: Paupers and Vagabonds 1580-1780' in Marie B. Rowlands (ed.), *English Catholics of Parish and Town 1558-1778* (Catholic Record Society, London 1999), pp. 115-28.

⁷⁷ Rowlands, 'Introduction' in *ibid.*, p. 3.

⁷⁸ Bossy, 'Recusant History and after', *British Catholic History*, vol. 32 (3) (2015), p. 273.

unemployed, the more numerous underemployed, the old, sick, infirm, widowed, and orphaned, described as 'decreasing the wealth of the country', made up half the population in 1688 according to Gregory King, the herald and contemporary observer.⁷⁹ It was not surprising, therefore, that they contained Catholics. They included members of some seigneurial Catholic communities, some apparently independent groups, some resident and some vagrant. The gentry and the clergy, however, made increasing provision for their care. A recent study of the Shireburns of Stonyhurst demonstrates the philanthropy of the Catholic gentry.⁸⁰ English Catholics formed a genuine community, which cared for the poor.

My article influenced other scholars. Anthony Milton, in his discussion of the extent to which the pre-Civil War parish constituted a single united community notes that wealthy Catholics made provision for the Catholic poor, citing this article.⁸¹ Walsham, in her most recent book, citing this article among other work, acknowledges

... one of the more important discoveries of research by Marie

Rowlands and other scholars – an urban and rural, artisan, peasant

and plebeian Catholicism, whose partially conformist or church

⁷⁹ Peter Laslett, *The World we have lost* (Methuen, London, 1979), pp. 31, 36-37, p. 268, n. 27.

⁸⁰ John Callow and Michael Mullett, 'The Shireburns of Stonyhurst: memory and survival in a Lancashire recusant family' in Dutton, Findlay and Wilson (eds), *Region, religion and patronage: Lancastrian Shakespeare*, pp. 169-85.

⁸¹ Anthony Milton, 'Religion and community in pre-civil war England' in Nicholas Tyacke (ed.), *The English Revolution c. 1590-1720: Politics, Religion and Communities* (Manchester University Press, Manchester, 2013), p. 67.

papist character has all too often allowed it to fall into the shadows.⁸²

I also later went on to use the 1767 Anglican survey of recusants and Catholic parish registers to trace the existence of Catholic Black slaves in England. Again I asked new questions of these well-known sources to illuminate a neglected topic. I showed the existence of a handful of Black Catholic domestic servants in London and Liverpool, all but one of them the servants of Catholic masters. The sources use the word 'servant', but these servants were probably slaves. I also discussed the Catholic apologists for and opponents of slavery to show how Catholics engaged with the wider society.⁸³

The recusant gentry were the most influential element in the Catholic community from the Elizabethan settlement until well into the nineteenth century, and in some parts of the countryside remain so today. Nevertheless, the common people were always the majority, and deserve our attention. As Hoskins remarked of local history, 'the dead hand of the seventeenth-century squire still guided, until recently, the hand of the living antiquary' and the categories of the *Victoria County Histories*, the parish and the manor, the parson and the squire,⁸⁴ have long been reflected in regional and local Catholic history's emphasis on the recusant squire and his chaplain.

⁸² Alexandra Walsham, *Catholic Reformation in Protestant Britain* (Ashgate, Farnham, 2014), p. 536.

⁸³ Hilton, 'Catholic Negro Slaves in Eighteenth-Century England', *North West Catholic History*, vol. XXVII (2000), pp. 20-25; *ibid.*, www.blackpresence.co.uk/catholic-slaves/ (accessed 8 July 2015).

⁸⁴ W. G. Hoskins, *Local History in England* (Longman, 1984), pp. 29-30.

These two articles on the Catholic commons endeavoured to redress the balance. They asked new questions of well-used sources about the common people rather than the gentry. Despite Walsham's characterisation of popular Catholicism as 'partially conformist or church papist', both Blackwood and I confined ourselves to recusants, because they are more readily identifiable, and church papists became a gradually disappearing species. Moreover, without recusancy there would not now be, for better or worse, an English Catholic Church.

The last six publications offered for examination are concerned with the period from the later eighteenth to the early twentieth century, in which the English Catholics were granted toleration, the hierarchy was restored, and profound economic and social changes altered the constitution of the English Catholic community, which continued to grow and to adapt to its changing circumstances. The community grew through natural increase and, in the nineteenth century especially, through Irish immigration. Its members also migrated from the countryside to the towns. The community adapted by increasing the authority of the bishops and priests, by building new chapels in the towns, and by providing, in an uneasy partnership with the State, elementary education for its children.

Publication 8, “The Science of the Saints”: The Spirituality of Butler’s *Lives of the Saints*, ⁸⁵ deals with a central but neglected issue of the history of Catholicism, the devotional life of the ordinary Catholic. The history of recusancy concentrates on the attempts of Catholics to practise their religion in the face of persecution, but tends to ignore what that practice involved beyond absence from the Anglican services and attendance at Mass. With the increasing tolerance of Catholics in eighteenth century England, it becomes easier to consider Catholics, not as victims, but as religious people, ‘to rediscover the “average” Christian of past ages and to know how and to what extent he practised his religion and lived his faith’.⁸⁶ This publication, therefore, considers an aspect of the inner life of some of the ordinary Catholics.

I demonstrated that Butler’s popular *Lives of the Saints* was more than a work of hagiography but also a manual of devotion in the same school as Challoner’s better known *Garden of the Soul*. Bossy declared that:

Almost everything we need to know about the private devotion of English Catholics ... can be discovered by consulting Challoner’s *Garden of the Soul*.⁸⁷

Luckett agreed: ‘Challoner, the author, defined a period’, and the phrase ‘Garden-of-the-Soul Catholics’ was used to describe the cradle Catholics of the mid-

⁸⁵Hilton, ‘“The Science of the Saints”: The Spirituality of Butler’s *Lives of the Saints*’, *Recusant History*, vol. 15 (3) (1980), pp. 189-93,

⁸⁶ Jean Delumeau, *Catholicism between Luther and Voltaire* (Burns and Oates, London, 1977), p. 129.

⁸⁷ *Ibid.*, p. 364.

nineteenth century as distinct from the converts from the Oxford Movement.⁸⁸

My essay rescued Butler from obscurity as a spiritual writer overshadowed by Challoner.

I argued that Butler's *Lives of the Saints*, also made a considerable and lasting contribution to the spirituality of the period.⁸⁹ I drew attention to the conclusions to each saint's life, which amounted to short homilies, of the bulk of the entries in Butler's book. This viewpoint changed our understanding of the book from an outmoded work of hagiography to a programme of instruction in mental prayer. Instead of asking what information it contains about the saints or even what it tells us about Butler's scholarship, I asked what lessons on prayer he was trying to inculcate and to whom.

My essay proved that Butler's work was an attempt to inculcate the practice of mental prayer amongst the laity on a par with Challoner's in *The Garden of the Soul*.⁹⁰ I showed that Butler, like Challoner, was not content to confine meditation to the clergy and cloistered religious but sought to introduce it to the laity, especially his intended audience, the members of the Catholic middle class, who had 'a farm or shop'.⁹¹ It reveals the concern of Butler and Challoner for the religious education of the increasingly important Catholic middle class, as well as

⁸⁸ Richard Lockett, 'Bishop Challoner: The Devotional Writer' in Eamon Duffy (ed.), *Challoner and his Church: A Catholic Bishop in Georgian England* (Darton, Longman and Todd, London, 1981), pp. 71-90.

⁸⁹ Hilton, "'Science of the Saints'": The Spirituality of Butler's *Lives of the Saints*, *Recusant History*, vol. 15 (3). (1980), pp. 189-93.

⁹⁰ Hilton, "'The Science of the Saints'", pp. 189-93.

⁹¹ Alban Butler, *The Lives of the Fathers, Martyrs and other Principal Saints* (4 vols, no publisher named, London, 1756-59), 'SS Cripsin and Crispinian'.

the large Catholic working class. That there was such an audience is evinced by a nineteenth-century working man's account of a vision he received during Mass, which I edited and published. It reveals a very Butlerian mystical experience leading to resolutions of charity and forgiveness.⁹² At four volumes, Butler's book was never going to be cheap, but it was within the reach of its target middle-class audience, and its frequent reprints indicate its continued popularity down to the present day.⁹³

My work on Butler was an important contribution to the slim literature on eighteenth-century English Catholic spirituality. Indeed, the only general accounts of the subject are Bossy's remarks on Challoner, Lockett's article on Challoner, part of Heimann's study of Victorian Catholic devotion, and a few pages in Mursell's survey of English spirituality.⁹⁴

The importance of my interpretation of Butler's work was acknowledged by historians of spirituality. It was presumably the reason why I was commissioned to write the entry on Butler in *The Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*.⁹⁵

Mullett, in the comprehensive collection of recusant literature that he edited, cited it twice.⁹⁶ In his survey of later modern English spirituality Mursell used my

⁹² Hilton, 'Adventure, conversion and vision in the Evangelical Age: Thomas Rutter's "Religious Experience"', *North West Catholic History*, vol. XXX (2003), pp. 67-73.

⁹³ Alban Butler, *The Lives of the Saints* (First-Rate Books, New York, 2013).

⁹⁴ Mary Heimann, *Catholic Devotion in Victorian England* (Oxford University Press, Oxford, 1995), pp. 1-99; Gordon Mursell, *English Spirituality From 1700 to the Present Day* (Society for Promoting Christian Knowledge, London, 2001), pp. 31-36.

⁹⁵ Hilton, 'Butler, Alban', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, vol. 9, pp. 115-16.

⁹⁶ Michael Mullett (ed.), *English Catholicism* (6 vols, Pickering and Chatto, London, 2006), vol. 1, p. xxxii, vol. 4, p. 30, n. 2.

essay to argue that Butler's *Lives* was intended to foster private devotion as well as providing hagiographical scholarship.⁹⁷

Butler's work may not help us, as Delumeau put it, 'to know the "average Christian" of the past',⁹⁸ only what a scholarly priest thought they ought to do, but its popularity indicates that it was widely owned, though it might have sat unopened on their shelves, more an aspiration than an experience, of which we remain largely ignorant.

Publication 9, 'Lingard's Hornby',⁹⁹ and Publication 10, 'Lingard's Anglo-Saxonism: A Post-Colonial Reading',¹⁰⁰ are part of my collection of publications on Lingard.¹⁰¹ I led the English revival of Lingard scholarship. Before I published 'Lingard's Hornby', the only work examining his legacy, apart from a biography early in the last century,¹⁰² was by Shea and Chinnici in America.¹⁰³ Following my

⁹⁷ Gordon Mursell, *English Spirituality: From 1700 to the Present Day* (Society for Promoting Christian Knowledge, London, 2001), pp. 31-35.

⁹⁸ Delumeau, *Catholicism between Luther and Voltaire*, p. 129.

⁹⁹ Hilton, 'Lingard's Hornby' in Hilton (ed.), *Catholic Englishmen: Essays Presented to the Rt Rev. Brian Charles Foley, Bishop of Lancaster* (North West Catholic History Society, Wigan, 1984), pp. 37-44.

¹⁰⁰ Hilton 'Lingard's Anglo-Saxonism: A Post-Colonial Reading' in Peter Phillips (ed.), *Lingard Remembered: Essays to mark the Sesquicentenary of John Lingard's Death* (Catholic Record Society, London, 2004), pp. 23-34.

¹⁰¹ Hilton, 'Lingard's Cisalpine History', *Priests and People*, vol. 3 (8) (1989), pp. 328-332; Hilton 'The Cisalpines' in Hilton (ed.), *A Catholic of the Enlightenment: Essays on Lingard's Work and Times* (North West Catholic History Society, Wigan, 1999), pp. 10-20; Hilton, *A Reasonable Service: Two Essays on Lingard* (The Lingard Fund, Wigan, 1998); Hilton, "'So very Anglo-Saxon": cisalpines, goths, and Anglo-Saxons', *True Principles: The journal of The Pugin Society*, vol. III (1) (2004), pp. 43-47; Hilton, *Lingard's Rome* (North West Catholic History Society, Wigan, 2012).

¹⁰² Martin Haile and Edwin Bonney, *Life and Letters of John Lingard 1771-1851* (Herbert and Daniel, London, 1912).

¹⁰³ Donald F. Shea, *The English Ranke: John Lingard* (Humanities Press, New York, 1969); Joseph P. Chinnici, *The English Catholic Enlightenment: John Lingard and the Cisalpine Movement, 1780-1850* (Patmos Press, Shepherdstown, 1980).

first publication, there have been several books on Lingard, which have built on my research,¹⁰⁴ and I have developed my original argument, especially in my 'Lingard's Anglo-Saxonism'.

John Lingard holds a special place in English Catholic historiography, as both an outstanding leader of the English Catholic community in the first half of the nineteenth century and as an eminent historian in his own right. He was the leader of the Cisalpine (Anglo-Gallican) movement, which sought complete toleration for English Catholics and the restoration of the English Catholic hierarchy, and a historian whose work pioneered the critical use of original sources and challenged the Protestant interpretation of English history.

Lingard's life and work at Hornby, a Lancashire village, were the subject of my 'Lingard's Hornby', in which I demonstrated Lingard's importance as the leading Catholic intellectual of the first half of the nineteenth century, and showed the value of his *History of England* in defending Catholicism against its atheistic critics and Cisalpinism against its Ultramontane opponents.

My assessment of Lingard was taken up by other scholars. In the 'Introduction' to his study of Lingard's historical methodology, Edwin Jones, summing up Lingard's reputation as an historian, quoted my assessment of Lingard in

¹⁰⁴ Edwin Jones, *The English Nation: The Great Myth* (Sutton Publishing, Stroud, 1998); Jones, *John Lingard and the Pursuit of Historical Truth* (Sussex Academic Presson, Brighton, 2001); Peter Phillips, 'Lingard, John', in H. G. C. Matthew and Brian Harrison, *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography* (60 vols, Oxford University Press, Oxford, 2004), vol. 33, pp. 913-96; Phillips (ed.), *Lingard Remembered: Essays to mark the Sesquicentenary of Lingard's Death* (Catholic Record Sociey, London, 2004); Peter Phillips, *John Lingard: Priest and Historian* (Gracewing, Leominster, 2008); Philip H. Cattermole, *John Lingard: The Historian as Apologist* (Matador, Kidworth Beauchamp, 2013), *passim*.

‘Lingard’s Hornby’ thrice: Lingard was ‘the outstanding intellectual of English Catholicism’, who ‘worked within the centre of European scholarly tradition’, and ‘the intellectual centre of English Catholicism rested in Hornby’.¹⁰⁵ Writing about Lingard as liturgist Riley referred to my characterisation of Lingard ‘as a late Enlightenment thinker’.¹⁰⁶ Subsequently, however, Phillips, the leading Lingard scholar, taking issue with Chinnici, argued that Lingard, in writing his *History of England*, abandons his earlier explicit Cisalpine position for a more ireinical approach to his Protestant audience in order to help secure acceptance of Catholic Emancipation.¹⁰⁷

I also showed that Lingard’s mission at Hornby represented a change in the sociology of the English Catholic community, as it moved from the leadership of the gentry to that of the clergy, and as the formerly largely rural and agrarian community became increasingly urban and industrial. This was the aspect of the article on which most other historians, such as Riley and Mullett, drew.¹⁰⁸

Mullett declared that I had shown Hornby had been a seigneurial congregation, which had evolved into a clerical mission, but that it was declining

¹⁰⁵ Jones, *John Lingard and the Pursuit of Historical Truth*, p. 17.

¹⁰⁶ Emma Riley, ‘John Lingard and the Liturgy’ in Peter Phillips (ed.), *Lingard Remembered: Essays to mark the Sesquicentenary of John Lingard’s Death* (Catholic Record Society, London, 2004), p. 144.

¹⁰⁷ Peter Phillips, ‘Re-evaluating John Lingard’s *History of England*’, *Recusant History*, vol. 28 (4) (2007), p. 529-41.

¹⁰⁸ Riley ‘Lingard as Liturgist’ in Hilton (ed.), *A Catholic of the Enlightenment*, n. 28; Michael Mullett, ‘John Lingard, Historian’, *North West Catholic History*, vol. XXII (1995), p. 36.

in numbers because of emigration.¹⁰⁹ Phillips, however, is apparently more critical, describing my conclusion as 'pessimistic'.

My 'Lingard's Anglo-Saxonism' took an original approach to Lingard's writing about the Anglo-Saxons, that is his *Antiquities of the Anglo-Saxon Church* (1806) and the relevant chapters of his *History of England* (1845) On the model of Orientalism, I used post-colonial theory, a strategy I used elsewhere,¹¹⁰ to reveal Lingard's undeclared and, perhaps, unconscious agenda, despite his disclaimer of 'any pretension' to 'the philosophy of history'.

I argued that, having achieved religious toleration in 1791 and political equality in 1829, English Catholics were in a post-colonial period. Penal times were their colonial period, and the pre-Reformation middle ages were their pre-colonial period. I maintained that in writing the history of the Anglo-Saxon Church, Lingard was asserting the continuity and Englishness of the post-Reformation English Church. He hoped to secure acceptance for Catholics from the Protestant majority, and the restoration of the English Catholic hierarchy from Rome.

Lingard's life may have ended in disappointment. He lived just long enough to see the restoration of the English Catholic hierarchy in 1850, but it was merely the restoration of diocesan bishops without any restoration of the canonical rights of the ordinary secular clergy. Moreover, the restoration of the hierarchy not only

¹⁰⁹ Mullett, 'John Lingard in Context' in Hilton (ed.), *A Catholic of the Enlightenment*, pp. 6-7.

¹¹⁰ Hilton, "'So very Anglo-Saxon": cisalpines, Goths, and Anglo-Saxons', *True Principles: The journal of the Pugin Society*, vol. II (1) (2004), pp. 43-47; Hilton, 'Ruskin's Anglo-Saxonism: Constructing and Deconstructing *The Pleasures of England*', *The Ruskin Review and Bulletin*, vol. I (3) (2005), pp. 38-55; Hilton, *Anglo-Saxon Attitudes: A Short Introduction to Anglo-Saxonism* (Anglo-Saxon Books, Hockwold, 2006), passim; Hilton, "'An English Spring": Newman's Anglo-Saxonism', *Midland Catholic History*, vol. XIII (2006), pp. 26-30.

marked the failure of Cisalpinism, which he personified, and the triumph of Ultramontanism, but also a shift from the old rural Catholicism, which he inhabited, to the new urban Catholicism.¹¹¹

Publication 11 “The Case of Wigan” Catholic Congregationalism in the Age of Revolution’,¹¹² and Publication 12 ‘Catholic Congregationalism in Fleetwood’,¹¹³

deal with examples of the rise and fall of Catholic congregationalism. With the increasing informal tolerance of Catholic chapel-building and the repeal by the Relief Act of 1791 of the statute forbidding it, together with the increase in the numbers of Catholics in towns, urban Catholic chapels were built. Financed by public subscriptions, they were administered by lay trustees, who often demanded a voice in the choice of their pastors, a system which amounted to a form of Catholic congregationalism, and which frequently led to clashes between the lay trustees and their priests and bishops. Such disputes occurred in the United States of America (in Albany 1844, New York 1815, and Philadelphia 1802-30), as well as in England, especially in Lancashire, including Liverpool (1778) and Preston (1815).¹¹⁴ Some of these disputes were covered by Ward, the historian of

¹¹¹ Hilton, ‘The Cisalpines’ in Hilton (ed.), *A Catholic of the Enlightenment*, pp. 10-20.

¹¹² Hilton, “‘The Case of Wigan’: Catholic Congregationalism in the Age of Revolution’, *North West Catholic History*, vol. X (1983), pp. 1-7.

¹¹³ Hilton, ‘Catholic Congregationalism in Fleetwood, 1841-42’, *North West Catholic History*, vol. XXVI (1999), pp. 62-69,

¹¹⁴ Bossy, *The English Catholic Community*, pp. 337-56; Edward Norman, *The English Catholic Church in the Nineteenth Century* (Clarendon Press, Oxford, 1984), pp. 75-78, 86; Hilton, *Catholic Lancashire*, pp. 65-86.

Catholic Emancipation, but he regarded trustees as temporary expedients.¹¹⁵

Bossy, however, demonstrated that they were an important part of the history of the English Catholic community, and dealt with them in detail.¹¹⁶

I argued that trustees were the laity's response to the need for urban chapels. They were also a legitimate form of organisation with the precedent of lay patronage that had existed in the pre-Reformation Church and continued into penal times. They were a viable alternative to the clerical domination subsequently imposed on congregations. What was original in my account of Wigan was that I had access to the complete controversial literature on the issue. On the dispute in Fleetwood I had possession of the long-lost minutes of the trustees who had founded the chapel, thus revealing a hitherto unknown example of a Catholic congregation in dispute with its priest.

These studies drew together a number of my major themes. They illustrated the continuing rivalry between the secular clergy and the Jesuits, and the related clash between the Cisalpines and the Ultramontanes. They demonstrated the struggle for control of the English Church between the bishops, the clergy and the laity. They exemplified the rise of urban Catholicism with the growth of the Catholic industrial working and middle classes, and the decline of seigneurial rural Catholicism and the gentry who controlled it. Moreover, the case of Wigan

¹¹⁵ Bernard Ward, *The Dawn of the Catholic Emancipation 1781-1803* (2 vols, Longmans, Green and Co., London, 1909), vol. I, pp. 191-92; Ward, *The Eve of Catholic Emancipation 1803-1829* (3 vols, Longmans, Green and Co., London, 1911-12) vol. II, p. 33; Ward, *The Sequel to Catholic to Catholic Emancipation 1830-1850* (2 vols, Longmans, Green, and Co., London, 1915), vol. I, pp. 36-38.

¹¹⁶ Bossy, *Catholic Community*, pp. 337-54,

involved Lingard in an important role. Bossy had already treated Wigan in his seminal survey of Catholic congregationalism, because it clearly illustrated the clash of congregational pretensions and episcopal authority, and involved the dispute about the restoration of the Jesuits.

I demonstrated how the dispute in Wigan was caused by the growth of its Catholic congregation, the result of the transformation of Wigan from a small market town into a growing industrial centre. I showed how a middle-class challenge to gentry leadership emerged when a committee was formed under the leadership of a cotton manufacturer to build a chapel. I also explained how the local issue became entangled with the wider issue of the rivalry between the secular clergy and the Jesuits. Moreover, I pointed out that the ensuing pamphlet war explored the wider issues of ecclesiastical government, episcopal authority, and the rights of the religious orders and of the gentry patrons of the mission, as the Catholic community adjusted to the demands of the Industrial Revolution.¹¹⁷

In an essay on the social structure of the English Catholic community in the first half of the nineteenth century,¹¹⁸ Mullett described my account of the Wigan dispute as portraying a social revolution in which a member of the middle class challenged the leadership of the local gentry.¹¹⁹ He also compared my portrait of Catholic Wigan with Norman Gardner's picture of Catholic Lancaster in which

¹¹⁷ Hilton, 'The Cisalpines' in Hilton (Ed.), *A Catholic of the Enlightenment: Essays on Lingard's Work and Times* (North West Catholic History, Wigan, 1999), p. 17; Hilton, 'The Case of Wigan', *passim*.

¹¹⁸ Michael Mullett, 'John Lingard in Context' in Hilton (ed.), *A Catholic of the Enlightenment*, pp. 2-10.

¹¹⁹ *Ibid.*, p. 2.

aristocratic leadership was replaced by a new middle class elite.¹²⁰ Mullett went on to warn against pre-dating the fall of the aristocracy and gentry and the triumph of the middle class.¹²¹ Mullett appears to be conflating my Wigan with Gardner's Lancaster, for I did not claim that there the middle-class replaced the gentry as leaders of the congregation but showed that the ex-Jesuit chapel in Wigan enjoyed the support of the Catholic squire.¹²²

Nevertheless, a definite shift was taking place in the social structure of English Catholicism, as it became more urban, and the gentry began to give way, if not to the middle class, then certainly to the clergy, a change emphasised by the restoration of the hierarchy.¹²³ The eventual decline of seigneurial influence in the English Catholic community, slower in the countryside than in the towns, was not replaced by middle-class oligarchy or popular democracy but by absolute clerical control, in most cases with widespread acceptance; for instance, the failure of the attempt of a lay committee to raise enough money to build a school in Lancaster in 1847, resulted in its secretary, the banker, Thomas Coulston junior's 'resolve to trust only the clergy concerning future building projects ...'.¹²⁴

My article on Fleetwood uncovered a previously unknown example of a Catholic congregational dispute, which demonstrates the trustees' surrender in

¹²⁰ Ibid. p. 2.

¹²¹ Ibid., p. 7.

¹²² Hilton, 'The Case of Wigan', passim.

¹²³ Alan D. Gilbert, *Religion and Society in Industrial England: Church, Chapel and Social Change, 1740-1914* (Longman, London, 1976), pp. 125-143.

¹²⁴ Norman Gardner, 'The Coulstons of Lonsdale and Lancaster: Merchants, Bankers and Catholic Benefactors', *North West Catholic History*, vol. XXV (1998), p. 19.

the face of clerical pretensions. The hitherto undiscovered local source, the minutes of the committee, revealed an immediate collision between the trustees and the priest. The trustees appear not to have understood that their pretensions to financial control of the mission would arouse the wrath of their priest. In the event the trustees declared that they would stand down in favour of new trustees. It seems unlikely, however, that new trustees were elected for the trustees' minute book came to an abrupt end in 1842. In any case, the dispute seems to have been little known outside Fleetwood and its lay combatants were less sophisticated than those involved in Wigan. The dispute involved no pamphlet war like that in Wigan so that the affair was forgotten. It is, however, significant as an example of lay initiative quelled by clerical authority.¹²⁵

I pointed out that this dispute and that at Lee House, Chipping, Lancashire, in 1841, were the last of their kind, because soon the vicar apostolic moved against trustees in general. In 1841 Pope Gregory XVI declared that trustees were utterly dependent on episcopal authority, and in 1844 Bishop Brown abolished them completely in the Lancashire vicariate, and the other English bishops eventually followed suit.¹²⁶

Writing in the centenary year of the restoration of the English hierarchy, the clerical author of an essay on diocesan administration could declare that in 1850

¹²⁵ Hilton, 'Catholic Congregationalism in Fleetwood, 1841-42', *North West Catholic History*, vol. XXVI (1999), pp. 33-62.

¹²⁶ Hilton, 'Catholic Congregationalism in Fleetwood', p. 66; Norman, p. 78; Peter Doyle, *Mitres and Missions: The Roman Catholic Diocese of Liverpool 1850-2000* (The Bluecoat Press, Liverpool, 2005), p. 32.

lay patronage had disappeared. Moreover, he turned to the suggestion that lay parish councils should administer the temporal affairs of a parish, and remarked 'It is perhaps as well that parish councils did not exist when the missions were built up, since it is doubtful whether any of the parishes would have been founded at all'. All memory of Catholic congregationalism appears to have conveniently vanished. In fact, if it had not been for the 'parish councils' of the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries, the urban missions would not have been founded as early as they were.¹²⁷

My article on Wigan added detail to Bossy's account of the affair, and my article on Fleetwood broke new ground. Doyle made use of these articles in his history of Liverpool diocese. As a result of the Fleetwood article, I was commissioned to revise the entry on Bishop George Hilary Brown, last vicar apostolic of Lancashire and first bishop of Liverpool, for the *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*. These articles helped to rescue the episode of Catholic congregationalism from the partial oblivion in which it had sunk, and recovered a forgotten path, along which the English Catholic Church might have followed the Church of England as well as the Nonconformist denominations into a form of congregational government involving elected representatives.¹²⁸

¹²⁷ Morgan V. Sweeney, 'Diocesan Organisation and Administration' in George Andrew Beck (ed.), *The English Catholics 1850-1950* (Burns and Oates, London, 1950), pp. 121-22, 136

¹²⁸ Doyle, *Mitres and Missions*, pp. 25, 33-34; Thomas Cooper, revised Hilton, 'Brown, George Hilary (1786-1856)', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, vol. 8, p. 42.

Publication 13, 'Ruskinian Catholicism',¹²⁹ drew on a series of articles in which I made an original contribution to both English Catholic history and Ruskin studies.¹³⁰ I argued that the teaching of the non-Catholic John Ruskin (1819-1900) on art and society had a direct influence on the English Catholic Church well into the twentieth century, shaping its churches and inspiring its attempts to deal with social problems. The literature on Ruskin is vast, including an edition of his collected works published at the beginning of the twentieth century.¹³¹ The main biographies include that by his secretary and friend, W. G. Collingwood, the two-volume biography by Tim Hilton, and the entry in the *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography* by Hewison.¹³² Apart, however, from the early biography by his Catholic friend Alice Meynell, there has been very little comment on his attitude to and influence on English Catholicism, even in Wheeler's book on Ruskin's religion, though he does discuss Ruskin's growing respect for Catholicism and his invention of his own 'wider' version of it..¹³³

¹²⁹ Hilton, 'Ruskinian Catholicism', *The Ruskin Review and Bulletin*, vol. 6 (2) (2010), pp. 5-15.

¹³⁰ Hilton, 'Ruskin's Influence on English Catholicism', *Recusant History*, vol. 25 (1) (2000), pp. 96-105; Hilton, 'Ruskin's Road to Rome', *Friends of Ruskin's Brantwood Newsletter* (Autumn 2003), pp. 17-30; Hilton, *Ruskin's Rome* (Portico Library, Manchester, 2005), passim; Hilton, *The Artifice of Eternity: The Byzantine Romanesque Revival in Catholic Lancashire* (North West Catholic History Society, Wigan, 2008), passim; Hilton, "'Sailing to Byzantium": Ruskin's Imaginary Travel to Greece' in Keith Hanley and Emma Sdegno (eds), *Ruskin, Venice and Nineteenth-Century Cultural Travel* (Universita Ca' Foscari Venezia, Venice, 2011), pp. 361-81; Hilton, *'Perilous Speculations': Ruskin's Romanists* (Prodesse, Wigan, 2013), passim.

¹³¹ E. T. Cook and Alexander Wedderburn (eds), *The Works of John Ruskin* (36 vols, George Allen, London, 1903-12).

¹³² W. G. Collingwood, *The Life of John Ruskin* (The Riverside Press, Cambridge, 1902); Tim Hilton, *John Ruskin: The Early Years* (Yale University Press, London, 1985); Tim Hilton, *John Ruskin: The Later Years* (Yale, London, 2000); Robert Hewison, 'Ruskin, John', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, vol. 48, pp. 173-93.

¹³³ Mrs [Alice] Meynell, *John Ruskin* (Blackwood, Edinburgh and London, 1900); Michael Wheeler, *Ruskin's God* (Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 1999), pp. 206-61.

I argued that, despite being brought up as an Evangelical Protestant, (in contrast to the A. W. N. Pugin, the Catholic convert and advocate of the Gothic) Ruskin's admiration for medieval art and architecture, which was essentially Catholic, made him increasingly sympathetic to Catholicism, and brought him some Catholic friends, and almost led to his conversion.¹³⁴ *The Rambler*, the mouthpiece of a group of Catholic converts, pointed out the contradiction that Ruskin

... should write a book exalting the religious architecture of the 13th century almost to the level of inspiration, and term it pre-eminently *Christian* architecture, and at the same time believe the Pope to be Antichrist, ...¹³⁵

It was partly this intellectual and emotional conflict which led in 1858 to the loss of his Evangelical faith. Nevertheless, though he was tempted to become a Catholic, he could never bring himself to do so.¹³⁶

Moreover, I demonstrated that Ruskin's advocacy of Byzantine-Romanesque style influenced English Catholic architecture. It was not until the 1890s, however, that the Byzantine-Romanesque style was embraced wholeheartedly by the English Catholic Church, when Cardinal Vaughan decided to erect a cathedral for his diocese, and instructed his architect, John Francis Bentley, to build it in the

¹³⁴ Hilton, 'Ruskin's Influence on English Catholicism', *Recusant History*, vol. 25 (1) (2000), pp. 96-106.

¹³⁵ Ibid. p. 97.

¹³⁶ Ibid., pp. 96-98; Hilton, 'Perilous Speculations': *Ruskin's Romanists*, pp. 2-13; Clark, *The Gothic Revival*, pp. 176-96.

Byzantine-Romanesque style. Westminster Cathedral was opened in 1903, and sparked an explosion in Byzantine-Romanesque church building - 48 in Lancashire alone - which lasted until the eve of the Second Vatican Council in 1962.¹³⁷

The primary sources for the study of Ruskin's influence on English Catholic architecture are his published writing on architecture, especially passages on Byzantine and Romanesque churches in his *The Seven Lamps of Architecture*, *The Stones of Venice*, and *St Mark's Rest*.¹³⁸ His ideas were developed by William Morris,¹³⁹ and given further currency by Lethaby and Swainson's book on *Sancta Sophia*.¹⁴⁰ The application of these ideas by the English Catholic Church is contained in the letters of John Francis Bentley, the architect of Westminster Cathedral.¹⁴¹ In addition to these written sources, there are the Byzantine-Romanesque English Catholic churches built in the first half of the twentieth century, starting with Westminster Cathedral. Together these sources explain Ruskin's influence on English Catholic architecture. There are in addition a number of secondary sources too many to mention on Ruskin and on English architecture in the early twentieth century, but surprisingly very little on the Byzantine-Romanesque Revival, a gap my work has helped to fill.

¹³⁷ Hilton, 'Ruskin's Influence', p. 100; Hilton, *The Artifice of Eternity: The Byzantine-Romanesque Revival in Catholic Lancashire* (North West Catholic History Society, Wigan, 2008), passim.

¹³⁸ E. T. Cook and Alexander Wedderburn (eds), *The Works of John Ruskin* (36 vols, George Allen, London, 1903-12), vol. VIII, pp. 119-21, 258-58, vol. IX, pp. 35-37, vol. X, pp. 78, 93, vol. XXIV, p. 277.

¹³⁹ William Morris, *Gothic Architecture: A Lecture to the Arts and Crafts Exhibition Society* (Kelmscott Press, Hammersmith, 1893), pp. 8-10.

¹⁴⁰ W. R. Lethaby and Harold Swainson, *The Church of Sancta Sophia, Constantinople, A Study of Byzantine Building* (Methuen, London, 1894), pp. 189-99.

¹⁴¹ Winefride de l'Hopital, *Westminster Cathedral and its Architect* (2 vols, Methuen, London, 1919), vol. I, 26-35, 43-45.

I argued that Ruskin's social teaching profoundly influenced Catholic social teaching at a time when, especially in England, Catholicism was faced by the poverty of its largely industrial working-class members, an influence previously neglected. Ruskin concluded that art was a reflection of society, and turned, in works such as *Unto This Last* (1862), *Time and Tide* (1867), and *Fors Clavigera* (1871-80), to expounding the need to abandon laissez-faire capitalism in order to create a just society, a view that found an immediate and lasting response among some leading Catholics.¹⁴² Cardinal Manning (1808-92), the embodiment of the confident restored hierarchy, dedicated to the spiritual and social care of its large urban working-class laity, responded enthusiastically to Ruskin's socio-economic teaching, and his views were confirmed by Pope Leo XIII's encyclical *Rerum Novarum* (1891).¹⁴³ The Distributists, especially Belloc, Chesterton, McNabb, and Gill, followed Ruskin in rejecting laissez-faire capitalism, together with the factory system. Instead, they called for the voluntary redistribution of wealth, and a utopian return to agrarian self-sufficiency, handicrafts, and guilds.¹⁴⁴

Merrell uses my work to show that 'there is much in Ruskin's work that accorded with the traditional Roman Catholic view ...', especially in his

¹⁴² Hilton, 'Ruskin's Influence', pp. 96, 100-104.; Hilton, 'Ruskinian Catholicism', *Ruskin Review and Bulletin*, vol. 6 (2) (2010), pp. 5-14.

¹⁴³ Hilton, 'Ruskin's Influence', p. 101; Hilton, *Perilous Speculations*, pp. 52-57.

¹⁴⁴ Hilaire Belloc, *The Servile State* (T. N. Fouch, London, 1912), passim; Belloc, *The Crisis of Civilization* (Cassell, London, 1937), passim; G. K. Chesterton, *What's Wrong with the World* (Cassell, London, 1910), passim; Vincent McNabb, *The Church and the Land* (Burns, Oates and Washbourne, London, 1926), passim; Eric Gill, *Autobiography* (Devlin-Adair, New York, 1941), passim; Gill, *In a Strange Land* (Jonathan Cape, London, 1944), pp. 85-88.

paternalism, his support for guilds, and his belief in the impossibility of equality.¹⁴⁵

Hanley uses my work to show Ruskin's influence via Manning on Leo XIII and on the Distributists,¹⁴⁶ an observation taken up by Eagles in his study of Ruskin's continuing social and political influence.¹⁴⁷

In the works considered here I have explained the origins and consolidation of recusancy, and shown the causes of the failure of James II's attempt to establish a Catholic ascendancy. I have also opened up the study of popular Catholicism, and the influence of Lingard. I have added to our knowledge of English Catholic devotion and Catholic congregationalism, and I have pioneered the study of Ruskin's influence on Catholicism. In effect, I have written a history of the post-Reformation English Catholic community from the Elizabethan Reformation to the present, from the Council of Trent to the Second Vatican Council.

¹⁴⁵ Catherine Berenice Merrell, 'The Late Victorian Periodical Press and Attitudes to the "Problem of the Poor"' (Ph.D. thesis, De Montfort University 2001), p. 19.

¹⁴⁶ John Davies, *Back to the Land: From Ditchling to Parbold*, p. 3; Hanley 'Introduction' in Rachel Dickinson and Keith Hanley (eds), *Ruskin's Struggle for Coherence: Self-Representation through Art, Place and Society* (Cambridge Scholars Press, Newcastle, 2006), p. xxv.

¹⁴⁷ Stuart Eagles, *After Ruskin: The Social and Political Legacies of a Victorian Prophet, 1870-1920* (Oxford University Press, Oxford, 2011), p. 14-15.

Conclusion

Methodological Issues and Future Research

My published work presented in this thesis has made an original contribution to the history of the post-Reformation English Catholic community. My publications form a coherent body of work on the history of post-Reformation English Catholicism, covering the period from the Elizabethan religious settlement to the eve of the Second Vatican Council.

I have emphasised that post-Reformation English Catholicism was never more than a small minority, never more than ten per cent of the population.

From a European perspective, therefore, MacCulloch argues that 'English Catholicism fossilized as a largely-upper class and faintly exotic sect, before a new and spectacular expansion in the nineteenth century',¹ though this expansion was largely in proportion to the expansion of the population as a whole.

Although I have published on the period after the Second Vatican Council,² I decided not to include this work, because for those who have lived through it the period remains controversial, and no final judgement is possible, because its

¹ Diarmaid MacCulloch, *Reformation: Europe's House Divided 1490-1700* (Penguin Books, London, 2004), p. 393.

² Hilton, 'Twenty Years On: The Catholic Renewal in the North-West 1965-1985', *North West Catholic History*, vol. XIII (1986), pp. 21-26; Hilton, *Catholic Lancashire*, pp. 122-32; Hilton, 'Catholic Lancashire at the End of the Second Millennium', *North West Catholic History*, vol. XXVIII (2001), pp. 93-97.

consequences have not yet worked themselves out. Meanwhile, there is other useful work on this particular topic.³

Are there any other gaps in my work? I admit that an omission in my work is my failure to explore the extent of Church Popery, even though, as Walsham acknowledges, I showed that Church Papists played an important role in protecting recusants.⁴ I also showed that recusants and Church Papists were not fixed groups, that individuals moved to and fro between them over time, and that individuals also exhibited different degrees of commitment. Nevertheless, I accept Walsham's achievement,⁵ expanded by Lake and Questier,⁶ in rescuing Church Papists from the condescension of recusants and their historians, arguing that Church Popery was a viable response to persecution. Responses ranged from passive attendance at services, through avoidance of Holy Communion, and practising Catholic devotions during services, to open contempt. Meanwhile, recusancy involved avoiding Anglican and attending Catholic services, combined

³ Michael P. Hornsby-Smith (ed.), *Catholics in England 1950-2000: Historical and Sociological Perspectives* (Cassell, London, 1999); V. Allan McClelland and Michael Hodgetts (eds), *From Without the Flaminian Gate: 150 Years of Roman Catholicism in England and Wales 1850-2000* (Darton, Longman and Todd, London, 1999); Alana Harris, *Faith in the family: A lived religious history of English Catholicism, 1945-82* (Manchester University Press, Manchester, 2013)

⁴ Alexandra Walsham, *Church Papists* (Boydell Press, Woodbridge, 1999), p. 78.

⁵ Alexandra Walsham, *Church Papists: Catholicism, Conformity and Confessional Polemic in Early Modern England* (Boydell Press, Woodbridge, 1999); Walsham, "'Yielding to the Extremity of the Time": Conformity, Orthodoxy and the Post-Reformation Catholic Community' in Peter Lake and Michael Questier (eds), *Conformity and Orthodoxy in the English Church, c. 1560-1660* (Boydell, Woodbridge, 2000); Walsham, *Catholic Reformation in Protestant Britain* (Ashgate, Farnham, 2014), pp. 1-128.

⁶ Lake and Questier (eds), *Conformity and Orthodoxy in the English Church, c. 1560-1660*; Questier, *Catholicism and Community in Early Modern England: Politics, Aristocratic Patronage and Religion, c. 1560-1640* (Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 1996); Questier, 'Practical Antipapistry during the reign of Elizabeth I', *Journal of British Studies*, vol. 36 (1997), pp. 371-96; Questier, 'The Politics of Religious Conformity and the Accession of James I', *Historical Research*, vol. 74 (174) (2000), pp. 28-47.

with declarations of loyalty to the crown or plotting against it. Moreover, Questier and Kelly have brought out the importance of the political manoeuvres of élite Church Papists in defence of all Catholics.⁷ Work on the Stanleys in Lancashire suggests further research on them as Church Papists.⁸ By studying eminent Church Papists, rather than the recusant minority, Questier and those historians who take a similar approach to restore Catholics to a central position in the narrative of English History.⁹ If I were re-writing my earlier work on recusancy, while still insisting on its importance in the emergence of a separate Catholic community, I would emphasise its dynamic relationship with Church Popery.

My failure to enlarge on the existence of Church Papists, however, was not just an oversight on my part, but followed on from my teleological central concern, the study of the origin and growth of recusancy, which became the separate Catholic community which survives today. Walsham, Haigh and Maltby suggest that many Catholics found a refuge in their parish church as Church Papists who

⁷ Questier, *Catholicism and Community in Early Modern England*, passim; Questier, 'Elizabeth and the Catholics' in Ethan E. Shagan (ed.), *Catholics and the 'Protestant Nation': Religious Politics and Identity in Early Modern England* (Manchester University Press, Manchester, 2005), pp. 69-94; James Edward Kelly, 'Learning to Survive: the Petre Family and the formation of Catholic communities from Elizabeth I to the eve of the English Civil War' (Ph.D. thesis, King's College London, 2008); Kelly, 'Conformity, Loyalty and the Jesuit Mission to England of 1580' in Elaine Glaser (ed.), *Religious Tolerance in the Atlantic World: Early Modern and Contemporary Perspectives* (Palgrave Macmillan, Basingstoke, 2014), pp. 149-70.

⁸ Alison Findlay and Richard Dutton, 'Introduction' in Findlay, Dutton and Richard Wilson (eds), *Region, religion and patronage: Lancastrian Shakespeare* (Manchester University Press, Manchester, 2003), pp. 8-9.

⁹ Peter Marshall and Geoffrey Scott, 'Introduction: The Catholic Gentry in English Society' in Marshall and Scott (eds), *The Catholic Gentry in English Society* (Ashgate, Farnham, 2009), pp. 1-30; Ethan H. Shagan, *Catholics and the 'Protestant nation': Religious politics and identity in early modern England* (Manchester University Press, Manchester, 2005), passim.

eventually became 'parish Anglicans' or 'Prayer Book Anglicans', though it is difficult to discern much left from Catholicism in the Church of England by the end of Elizabeth's reign.¹⁰

Indeed, a methodological issue in the history of English religion in the hundred years after the Elizabethan settlement is the problem of the definition of 'Catholic': is a Catholic one who holds some Catholic doctrines and practices some Catholic devotions or is it someone who is in communion with the pope? If the former, then Church Papists were Catholics; if the latter, only the recusants were Catholics. As it is very difficult, if not impossible, to know exactly what went on in people's hearts and minds, it is simpler to follow Bossy and restrict the definition of Catholic to recusant, especially if we accept that the recusant Catholic community is the parent of the present English Catholic Church as well as the child of the pre-Reformation English Catholic Church. That community was held together not only by a refusal to attend the services of the Church of England but also by shared beliefs and rituals, by the experience of persecution and discrimination, and increasingly by family ties and communal organisations.

I dealt briefly with the role of women as lay Catholics, including the different roles of wives, daughters, and widows, gentlewomen and commoners, in towns as well as the countryside, and as members of continental convents. Since I

¹⁰ Walsham, *Church Papists*, pp. 100-19; Christopher Haigh, *English Reformations* (Oxford University Press, Oxford, 1993), pp. 285-95; Judith Maltby, *Prayer Book and People in Elizabethan and Early Stuart England* (Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 2000), passim; Eamon Duffy, *The Stripping of the Altars: Traditional Religion in England c. 1400-c.1580* (Yale University Press, New Haven and London, 1992), p.593

undertook my research, there has been a lot more work on Catholic women, as historians explore the wider Catholic community. Much of this recent research is concerned with nuns, assisted by the Arts and Humanities Research Council's project *Who were the Nuns?*,¹¹ but the sources generated by the English convents abroad also tell us much about women at home. These studies reveal flourishing female religious communities, often strengthened by the ties of kinship, with their spirituality nourished by continental models. Gibbons has concentrated on English exiles in France, exploring the interaction between convents and home and the host communities.¹² Walker has produced a range of work on nuns in France and the Spanish Netherlands, and has highlighted their political activities, such as the English Benedictine Dames of Ghent facilitating Royalist correspondence during the Interregnum.¹³ Lux-Sterritt has published work on

¹¹ *Who were the Nuns? A Prosopographical study of the English convents in exile 1600-1800*, wwtn.history.qmul.ac.uk.

¹² Katy Gibbons, "'An Unquiet Estate Abroad': the religious exile of Catholic noble and gentlewomen under Elizabeth I" in F. Reid and K. Holden (eds), *Women on the Move: Refugees, Migration and Exile* (Cambridge Scholars Publishing, Cambridge, 2010), pp. 43-58; Gibbons, *English Catholic Exiles in Late Sixteenth-Century Paris* (Boydell and Brewer, Woodbridge, 2011), passim; Gibbons, "'No home in exile?': Elizabethan Catholics in Paris", *Reformation*, vol. 15 (2010), pp. 115-31; Gibbons, "'Une place réservée?': Catholic exiles and contested space in later sixteenth-century Paris", *French Historical Studies*, vol. 32 (2009), pp. 33-61.

¹³ Claire Walker, "'Do not suppose me a well mortified Nun dead to the world": Letter Writing in Early Modern English Convents', in J. Daybell (ed.), *Early Modern Women Letter Writers 1450-1700* (Palgrave Macmillan, Basingstoke, 2001), pp. 159-76; Walker, *Gender and Politics in Early Modern Europe: English Convents in France and the Low Countries* (Palgrave Macmillan, Basingstoke, 2003), passim; "'Going against some forcible wind": Writing and Reform in Medieval and Early Modern Convents', *Journal of Women's History*, vol. 21 (1) (2009), pp. 145-54; Walker, 'Loyal and Dutiful Subjects: English Nuns and Stuart Politics' in J. Daybell (ed.), *Women and Politics in Early Modern England* (Ashgate, Aldershot, 2004), pp. 228-42; Walker, 'Prayer, Patronage and Political Conspiracy: English Nuns and the Restoration', *The Historical Journal*, vol. 43 (2000), pp. 1-23; Walker, 'Priests, Nuns, Presses and Prayers: The Southern Netherlands and the Contours of English Catholicism' in E. Kaplan et al. (eds), *Catholic Communities in Protestant States: Britain and the Netherlands, c. 1570-1720* (Manchester University Press, Manchester, 2009), pp. 136-55; Walker, 'Recusants, Daughters and Sisters of Christ: English Nuns and their

nuns abroad and in England (Mary Ward's Institute), and on the vital role of women in the Catholic household.¹⁴ Brindley has written a thorough analysis of Catholic women in the North West and abroad, analysing the close contacts between home and abroad.¹⁵ Future regional studies of Catholicism will have to take account of this extraordinary phenomenon of the English female religious communities abroad, dedicated, with the brief exception of Mary Ward's Institute, not to the English mission but purely to a life of prayer, and supported by the English Catholic community at home. If, therefore, I were starting my own research again, I would look in more detail at the English continental convents. At the same time, I would use the records of those convents to throw light on Catholic families in England.

Communities in the Seventeenth Century' in S. Broomhall and S. Tarbin (eds), *Women, Identities and Political Cultures in Early Modern Europe* (Ashgate, Aldershot, 2008), pp. 51-76; Walker, 'Securing Souls or Telling Tales? The Politics of Cloistered Spirituality', in C. van Wyhe (ed.), *Female Monasticism in Early Modern Europe: An interdisciplinary View* (Ashgate, Aldershot, 2008), pp. 227-44; Walker, 'Spiritual Property: The English Benedictine Nuns of Cambrai and the Dispute over the Baker Manuscripts' in N. Wright et al. (eds), *Women, Property and the Letters of the Law in Early Modern England* (University of Toronto Press, Toronto, 2004), pp. 237-55.

¹⁴ Laurence Lux-Sterritt and Carmen Mangion (eds), *Gender, Catholicism and Spirituality: Women and the Roman Catholic Church in Britain and Europe, 1200-1900* (Palgrave Macmillan, Basingstoke, 2011), passim; Lux-Sterritt, 'An Analysis of the Controversy Caused by Mary Ward's Institute in the 1620s', *Recusant History*, vol. 25 (4) (2001), pp. 636-47; Lux-Sterritt, 'Les religieuses en mouvement: Ursulines et Dames anglaises à l'aube de XVII^e siècle', *Revue de d'Histoire Moderne et Contemporaine*, vol. 53 (4) (2005), pp. 7-23; Lux-Sterritt, 'Mary Ward's English Institute: the Apostolate of Self-Affirmation', *Recusant History*, vol. 28 (2) (2006), pp. 192-208; Lux-Sterritt, *Redefining Female Religious Life: French Ursulines and English Ladies in Seventeenth-Century Catholicism* (Ashgate, Aldershot, 2005); Lux-Sterritt, 'Une polémique dans l'Angleterre de la contre-réforme: Mary Ward et sa Compagnie de Jésus au féminin', *Revue de l'Histoire de Religions*, vol. 225 (3) (2008), pp. 393-414; 'Virgo becomes Virago': Women in the Accounts of Seventeenth-Century Missionaries', *Recusant History*, vol. 30 (4) (2011), pp. 537-53.

¹⁵ Christina Michelle Brindley, 'Images of Female Piety and the Development of Post-Reformation Catholicism in the Diocese of Chester, c. 1558-c. 1635' (PhD thesis, Manchester Metropolitan University, 2014), passim.

Other recent work plays into my basic narrative: the development of a separate English Catholic community, which shared in the national culture but also had its own sub-culture, inherited from medieval Catholicism and influenced by continental Counter-Reformation Catholicism. Various aspects of this culture have been considered by Corthell et al., including Catholic houses, Latin literature, vestments, the court of Henrietta Maria, English poetry, antiquarianism, conversion narratives, relics and devotional objects, the English continental colleges, hagiography, and chivalric romances.¹⁶ Cooper and Gregory examine the interconnections between élite and popular religion.¹⁷ Baker uses the history of reading to reveal the mentality of a Lancashire Catholic gentleman.¹⁸ Shell has used printed and manuscript sources to explore oral media, such as ballads and stories, to reveal the survival of Catholic popular culture beyond the narrow confines of recusancy.¹⁹ Sena examines the importance of Catholic gentry networks.²⁰ Underwood demonstrates the way in which children were integrated into the Catholic community.²¹ Murphy shows

¹⁶ Ronald Corthell, Frances E. Dolan, Christopher Highley, and Arthur F. Marotti, *Catholic Culture in Early Modern England* (University of Notre Dame Press, Notre Dame, Indiana, 2007), passim.

¹⁷ Kate Cooper and Jeremy Gregory (eds), *Elite and Popular Religion: Studies in Church History*, vol. 42 (Boydell and Brewer, Woodbridge, 2006), passim.

¹⁸ Baker, Geoff, *Reading and Politics in Early Modern England: the Mental World of a Seventeenth-Century Catholic Gentleman* (Manchester University Press, Manchester, 2013), passim.

¹⁹ Alison Shell, *Oral Culture and Catholicism in Early Modern England* (Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 2009), passim.

²⁰ Margaret Sena, 'William Blundell and the Networks of Catholic Dissent in post-Reformation England' in Alexandra Shepard and Phil Withington (eds), *Communities in Early Modern England: Networks, Place, Rhetoric* (Manchester University Press, Manchester, 2000), pp. 54-75.

²¹ Lucy Underwood, 'Catechesis, Socialization and Play in a Catholic Household, c. 1660: The "Children's Exercises" from the Blundell Papers' in John Doran, Charlotte Methuen and Alexandra Walsham (eds), *Religion and the Household: Studies in Church History vol. 50* (Boydell Press, Woodbridge, 2014), pp. 269-81.

importance of liturgical music in gentry household the interconnection between élite and popular religion.²² Peters's original approach to women and piety across the religious divide explains how separate Catholic and Protestant systems of devotion developed, as the former emphasised and the latter abandoned the image of the Blessed Virgin Mary; her work combines the study of women and of confessional cultures, as the English adapted to the existence of multiple versions of Christianity, each with its own sub-culture.²³ If, therefore, I were to re-write my work on early modern English Catholicism, I would look in depth at the various manifestations of the culture of the developing Catholic community.

My early work attempted to provide a solution to the problems involved with compiling and interpreting the statistics of recusancy. I approached the difficulty by looking for underlying trends. The lists of recusants, the ecclesiastical returns, recusant rolls, and government surveys, were compiled by local secular and ecclesiastical bureaucracies that might be amateur, incompetent, partial or corrupt, so that they perhaps tend to underestimate the number of recusants, perhaps deliberately to demonstrate to higher authority that the problem was under control. It can, therefore, be argued that the statistics reveal the levels of the professionalism, competence, partiality, and zeal of the bureaucracy, the malice of individuals, or the current attitude of the regime, rather than the real

²² Emilie K. Murphy, 'Music and Catholic Culture in post-Reformation Lancashire: Piety, Protest and Conversion, *British Catholic History*, vol. 32 (4) (2015), pp. 492-525; Murphy, 'Adoremus Te Christe: Music and post-Reformation English Catholic Domestic Piety in Doran et al (eds), *Religion and the Household*, pp. 240-53.

²³ Christine Peters, *Patterns of Piety: Women, Gender and Religion in Late Medieval and Reformation England* (Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 2003), passim.

number of recusants. On the other hand, there were very few recusants before Vaux began to circulate the papal condemnation of conformity in 1566. As the application of the penal laws was relaxed during the reign of James I, the number of recusants increased.²⁴ Moreover, though the number of recusants in County Durham differed widely from year to year, there was an upwards trend overall.²⁵ In Lancashire the upward trend was steadier and increasingly rapid under both Elizabeth I and James I.²⁶ Cumbria, where after some initial increase, the numbers began to fall in the last years of Elizabeth's reign, followed by some increase at first under James, and then a further decline, was exceptional.²⁷ The overall trend was the result of greater numbers of people with Catholic sympathies responding to the appeal of the seminary priests to become recusants, especially as persecution decreased under the Stuarts.

My work has had a significant impact on the field, and has stimulated research into new areas, such as recusancy in Cumbria and Lancashire, popular Catholicism, and Lingard. Some of the historians who have drawn on my work have come to different conclusions from me. Sometimes it has been a matter of interpretation, emphasis, and nuance, but in other cases the difference has been real.

Questier was critical of my remarks about the political activity of recusants in County Durham after the Rising of 1569, though our difference seems to be one of

²⁴ Hilton, 'Catholicism in Elizabethan Durham', *Recusant History*, vol. 14 (1) (1977), pp. 4-7; Haigh, *Reformation and Resistance*, pp. 272-75; Questier, 'Conformity, Catholicism and the Law' in Lake and Questier (eds), *Conformity and Orthodoxy in the English Church*, pp. 237-61.

²⁵ Hilton, 'Catholicism in Elizabethan Durham', *Recusant History*, vol. 14 (1), p. 6.

²⁶ Hilton, *Catholic Lancashire*, pp. 6, 14, 17.

²⁷ Hilton, 'The Cumbrian Catholics', *Northern History*, vol. XVI (1980), pp. 45-46, pp 48-49.

emphasis rather than of fact. He seems not to have read my 'Catholics in Elizabethan Durham' (Publication 1), in which I wrote that after the Rising 'many continued to cherish the hope of the restoration of Catholicism by the renewed intervention of [Lord] Westmorland'.²⁸ He has, however, read my M.Phil. thesis in which I wrote that while in the 1580s Durham Catholics had 'previously been prone to disloyalty and had even risen in rebellion, they no longer appeared to be so inclined, despite the plots and foreign tension of the decade, partly because they were deprived of the leadership of the Nevilles [the family of the earls of Westmorland] and partly because most of the seminary priests refused to have anything to do with such schemes'.²⁹ Questier remarked 'It is very hard to agree with this analysis. Almost exactly the reverse would appear to be the case',³⁰ because the Neville faction continued to plot but did not have widespread Catholic support in the North. I find it hard to understand with what he disagrees.³¹

'Exactly the reverse'? Surely, more or less the same?

In the case of my 'The Cumbrian Catholics' (Publication 2) there has been a real difference, not so much of fact, as of interpretation. My argument, in support of Bossy, that recusancy in Cumbria was never strong, and declined in the seventeenth century, because it was starved of priests, came under

²⁸ Hilton, 'Catholicism in Elizabethan Durham', *Recusant History*, vol. 14 (1), p. 3.

²⁹ Hilton, 'Catholic Recusancy in County Durham, 1559-1625 (M. Phil. Thesis, University of Leeds, 1974), p. 85.

³⁰ Questier, 'Practical Antipapistry during the reign of Elizabeth I', *The Journal of British Studies*, vol. 36 (1997), p. 379.

³¹ Hilton, 'Catholic Recusancy in County Durham (M.Phil. thesis), pp. 52-53, 85-86; Hilton, 'Catholicism in Elizabethan Durham', *Recusant History*, vol. 14 (1), p. 3; K. J. Kesselring, *The Northern Rebellion of 1569: Faith, Politics, and Protest in Elizabethan England* (Palgrave Macmillan, Basingstoke, 2010), pp. 122-43.

attack by critics, who responded directly to Bossy's remarks and my article, and this was a strong reason for choosing to submit it as part of this thesis.

Thwaytes criticised Bossy and me for our analysis, arguing that it was 'not supported by the available contemporary evidence'.³² Thwaytes demonstrated that the number of convicted recusants in Kendal Barony (the southern half of Westmorland) in 1626 was 105, and by 1641 on the eve of the Civil War had risen to 195. He pointed out that there were a number of recusant gentry but that the majority of recusants, 90%, were beneath the rank of gentry. He, therefore, concluded that the suggestion that Cumbria lost virtually all connection with Catholicism was incorrect.³³

I accept Thwaytes's statistics for the recusants of the Barony of Kendal in the 1640s, but do not accept his conclusion. His recusants amount to one per cent of the probable population of the barony, and even if we add to them wives and children they still amount to less than five per cent at a time when the recusants of Lancashire numbered 9,000 that is nine per cent of the population.³⁴ His conclusion is literally true, but any implication that Catholicism was strong in Westmorland is false.

³² Lance Thwaytes, 'Catholics of the Seventeenth Century in the Barony of Kendal' in Marie B. Rowlands (ed.), *Catholics of Parish and Town 1558-1778* (Catholic Record Society, London, 1999), pp. 179-209.

³³ Thwaytes, pp. 182-83.

³⁴ Hilton, *Catholic Lancashire*, p. 17; John K. Walton, *Lancashire: a social history, 1558-1939* (Manchester University Press, Manchester, 1987), p. 23, for the population of Lancashire.

Parkinson also argued that I had seriously underestimated the strength of Cumbrian Catholicism.³⁵ She admitted that ‘... the total number of recusants presented in Cumberland and Westmorland during the reign of Elizabeth may not have been high compared with the returns of Lancashire and Yorkshire’, but argued that Cumberland and Westmorland were sparsely populated and that ‘many Catholics were not presented ...’.³⁶ She concluded: ‘I have shown ... that contrary to the argument put forward by both Bossy and Hilton, Catholics did not die out in the two counties of Cumberland and Westmorland after the Elizabethan Settlement of 1559’.³⁷

Parkinson, however, failed to make out her case. Indeed, a comparison of our estimates of Cumbrian Catholics demonstrates that they are not far apart, and that her estimates are sometimes smaller than mine, though not by much. Her estimates indicate that by the end of Elizabeth’s reign the percentage of recusants in Cumbria was approximately 0.2 per cent compared with 0.4 per cent in Lancashire, and that by 1770 the recusants in Cumbria were about 0.7 per cent of the population compared with an estimated 20 per cent in Lancashire, though I would put it at just below 10 per cent.³⁸ These estimates indicate that Catholic

³⁵ Anne Cecilia Parkinson, ‘Catholicism in Cumberland and Westmorland 1558-1829’ (unpublished Ph.D. thesis, University of Lancaster, 2003), pp. 3-4.

³⁶ Ibid., p. 120

³⁷ Ibid., p. 427.

³⁸ Hilton, *Catholic Lancashire*, pp. 6, 70; Joan Thirsk, *The Agrarian History of England and Wales* (5 vols, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 1984), vol. V, p. 4 for the population of Cumbria in the eighteenth century; C. B. Phillips and J. A. Smith, *Lancashire and Cheshire from AD 1540* (Routledge, London, 2014), p. 67 for the population of Lancashire.

recusants may not have disappeared from Cumbria but they were a much smaller proportion of the population than those of Lancashire.

Langton, in his historical geography of Catholic Lancashire, engages with my *Catholic Lancashire* (Publications 3 and 4), and demonstrates the value of the *longue durée*. Langton's article sets out to explore Lancashire's regional culture, characterised by the persistence of Catholicism.³⁹

Langton, however, overestimates Catholicism's strength in Lancashire. He argues that before the 1580s the incomplete separation of Catholics from the Church of England, the phenomenon of Church Papists, and the conformity of heads of families 'all make any itemisation prone to categorical errors and overall understatement',⁴⁰ whereas he is prone to exaggeration. Emphasizing the strength of Catholicism in Wigan he simplifies to the extent of misleading: the mayor and chief magistrates who attended the Catholic chapel were not elected burgesses but Catholic gentry intruded by King James II, and swept away by the Revolution of 1688.⁴¹ He also claims that Wigan had rival Catholic chapels by the 1780s, but the two rival chapels did not appear until 1818.⁴² Langton concludes, quoting me, 'This "last English outpost of the great Roman Catholic Church" was rather more than the "pathetic remnant" recognised by its most recent

³⁹ John Langton, 'The continuity of regional culture: Lancashire Catholicism from the late sixteenth to the early nineteenth century' in *Issues of Regional Identity: In honour of John Marshall* (Manchester University Press, Manchester, 1998), pp. 82-101.

⁴⁰ *Ibid.*, p. 84.

⁴¹ *Ibid.*, p. 93; Hilton, *Catholic Lancashire*, p. 44; Hilton, 'Wigan Catholics and the Policies of James II', *North West Catholic History (NWCH)*, vol. I (3) (1969), pp. 07-110.

⁴² Langton, p. 94; Hilton, *Catholic Lancashire*, p. 85; Hilton, 'The Case of Wigan', *NWCH*, vol. X (1983), pp. 1-7.

historian'.⁴³ If we accept the *Oxford English Dictionary's* definition of the word 'pathetic' as 'Arousing sadness, compassion, or sympathy', it was just that. Indeed, Langton concludes that Lancashire 'was not a "Catholic region" ... Catholics were probably not in a majority even where they were most numerous'.⁴⁴ Again, our difference is largely one of interpretation.

I do not think the criticisms of my earlier work on the origins of recusancy in Durham, Cumbria, and Lancashire are justified. I might publish a short article or articles comparing the conclusions of Thwaytes and Parkinson with mine on Cumbria and Langton's with mine on Lancashire, just to make clear that there is a tendency of historians of recusancy to overestimate its extent.

Influenced by Questier's concept of entourage, the exercise of aristocratic influence through dependants and clients,⁴⁵ a possible future research project might be a study of the role of the earls of Derby in the survival of Catholicism in Lancashire. The 3rd earl exercised bastard-feudal authority in Lancashire which might have sheltered both recusancy and Church Popery. Recent work has shown that Lathom House was 'a site where people of Catholic, Anglican and Puritan sympathies were brought together'.⁴⁶

Another line of research might be to consider religion as a whole in Lancashire in the seventeenth century, to continue where Haigh left off with 'the cockpit of

⁴³ Langton, p. 85

⁴⁴ Ibid., p. 96.

⁴⁵ Michael C. Questier, *Catholicism and Community in Early Modern England: Politics, Aristocratic Patronage and Religion, c. 1550-1640* (Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 2006), pp. 1-29.

⁴⁶ Alison Findlay and Richard Dutton, 'Introduction' in Richard Dutton, Alison Findlay and Richard Wilson (eds), *Region, religion and patronage: Lancastrian Shakespeare* (Manchester University Press, Manchester, 2003), pp. 8-9.

conscience'.⁴⁷ Such a study would involve not only revisiting my work on recusancy in Lancashire in the light of recent research, such as Walsham's on Church Popery, but also the gradual success of the Church of England, the growth and secession of Puritanism, the role of witchcraft, and the extent of religious indifference amounting to atheism.⁴⁸

Meanwhile I am expanding my range of work by studying Catholic heraldry. The use of heraldry by the Catholic aristocracy and gentry, as well ecclesiastical institutions, gives an insight into their mentality, and I have recently published work on the subject.⁴⁹ Cust has argued convincingly that the recusant gentry had an obsession with heraldry, and this idea has been taken up by other historians, while Gooch has demonstrated the heraldic obsession of Lord Lumley.⁵⁰ The Catholic form of this obsession, however, needs to be clearly distinguished from the widespread Protestant gentry obsession with heraldry. This could be dealt with by a comparison of Catholic and Protestant writers on heraldry, and Catholic and Protestant displays in the Elizabethan and early Stuart periods.

⁴⁷ Christopher Haigh, *Reformation and Resistance in Tudor Lancashire* (Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 1975), p. p. 332.

⁴⁸ John K. Walton, *Lancashire: A Social History, 1558-1939* (Manchester University Press, Manchester, 1987), pp. 36-59.

⁴⁹ Hilton, 'Pugin's Heraldic Revival', *True Principles: The journal of the Pugin Society*, vol. IV (4) (2014), pp. 324-330; Hilton, 'The Heraldry of the post-Reformation English Catholic Community: Part I, English Catholic Heraldry under Penalty, 1559-1778; Part II, English Catholic Heraldry since Toleration, 1778-2010', *The Coat of Arms: The Journal of the Heraldry Society* (pending

⁵⁰ Richard Cust, 'Catholicism, Antiquarianism and Gentry Honour: The Writings of Sir Thomas Shirley,' *Midland History*, vol. XXIII (1998), pp. 40-70; Peter Marshall and Geoffrey Scott, 'Introduction: The Catholic Gentry in English Society' in Marshall and Scott (eds), *The Catholic Gentry in English Society: The Throckmortons of Coughton from Reformation to Emancipation* (Ashgate, Farnham, 2009), p. 12; Leo Gooch, *A Complete Pattern of Nobility: John Lord Lumley (c. 1534-1609)* (University of Sunderland Press, Rainton Bridge, 2009), passim.

It might be asked, why, since I consider the Catholic community to have been so small, I have thought it worthwhile to expend so much time and energy on it? My reply is that, however small, it was not insignificant and remained a fragment of what Newman called 'the Great Communion'.⁵¹ Challenged by the Protestant Reformation, that Church reformed itself, took Christianity to the New World, and recovered parts of Europe it had lost. It did not recover England, but it kept a toe-hold here, and the struggle to retain that toe-hold is part of the wider history of the Counter-Reformation. Then again, faced by the Industrial Revolution, which began in England, and the rise of secularism, the Catholic Church tried to improve the temporal situation of the poor as well as to offer them the consolations of religion, a two-fold service it still offers to a troubled world.

⁵¹ Newman, *Sermons preached on Various Occasions*, (Longmans, Green and Co. London, 1913), p. 171.

Appendix

The Publications of J. A. Hilton

Abbreviations

NWCH *North West Catholic History*

NWCHS North West Catholic History Society

‘Wigan Catholics and the Policies of James II’, *North West Catholic History*

(NWCH), I (3) (1969), pp.97-110

“Tim Bobbin” and the Origins of Provincial Consciousness in Lancashire’, *Journal of the Lancashire Dialect Society*, XIX (1970), pp. 2-7

‘The Catholic Ascendancy in the Worcester Region, 1685-88’, *Worcestershire*

Recusant, XXVI (1975), pp. 3-7

‘The Catholic Ascendancy in London and the Home Counties’, *London Recusant*, V

(2) (1975), pp. 78-83

‘The Catholics in Caroline Durham 1625-1642’, *Durham County Local History*

Society Bulletin, IX (1976), pp. 9-18

‘Catholicism in Elizabethan Durham’, *Recusant History*, XIV (1) (1977), pp. 1-8

‘Catholicism in Jacobean Durham’, *Recusant History*, XIV (2) (1977), pp. 75-85

‘Catholicism in Elizabethan Northumberland’, *Northern History*, XIII (1977), pp.

44-58

‘The Counter-Reformation in the North East’, *Northern Catholic History*, V (1977), pp. 3-12

‘The Catholic Ascendancy in the South-West, 1685-88’, *London Recusant*, VII (2) (1977), pp. 68-72

‘The Catholic Ascendancy in Wales and the Marches, 1685-88’, *Worcestershire Recusant*, XXX (1977), pp. 3-8

‘The Catholic Ascendancy in the Eastern Counties, 1685-88’, *Essex Recusant*, XX (1) (1978), pp. 15-23

‘The Catholic Ascendancy in the Midlands, 1685-88’, *Staffordshire Catholic History*, XVIII (1978), pp. 15-18

‘The Catholic Ascendancy in the North, 1685-88’, *NWCH*, V (1978), pp. 1-13

‘Catholicism in Jacobean Northumberland’, *Northern Catholic History*, VII (1978), pp. 10-19

‘Catholicism in Caroline Northumberland’, *Northern Catholic History*, VIII (1978), pp. 3-10

‘The Cumbrian Catholics’, *Northern History*, XVI (1980), pp. 40-58

‘The Catholic North-East 1640-1850’, *Durham County Local History Society Bulletin*, XXIV (1980), pp. 37-44

‘The Recusant Commons in the North-East, 1570-1642’, *Northern Catholic History*, XII (1980), pp. 3-13

‘“The Science of the Saints”: The Spirituality of Butler’s *Lives of the Saints*’, *Recusant History*, XV (3) (1980), pp. 189-93

- 'John Roby's "Traditions of Lancashire"', *JLDS*, XXIX (1980), pp. 36-44
- 'A Select Critical Bibliography of North-Western Post-Reformation Catholic History', *NWCH*, VIII (1981), pp. 30-32
- 'The Catholicism of the Ascendancy, 1685-88', *London Recusant*, N.S. I (1981), pp.60-67
- 'Post-Reformation Catholicism in Cheshire', *NWCH*, IX (1982), pp. 1-7
- The Catholic Revival in Yealand* (Preston, 1982)
- 'The Archives of the Parishes of St John and St Mary, Wigan', *Catholic Archives*, III (1983), pp.20-21
- 'Acton: Liberal Catholic Historian', *Worcestershire Recusant*, XLII (1983), pp. 1-17
- 'The Case of Wigan: Catholic Congregationalism in the Age of Revolution', *NWCH*, X (1983), pp. 1-7
- 'Lingard's Hornby' in Hilton, *Catholic Englishmen: Essays Presented to the Rt Rev. Brian Charles Foley* (North West Catholic History Society [NWCHS], Wigan, 1984), pp. 37-44
- The Lancastrian Catholic Heritage: An Historical Guide* (NWCHS, Wigan, 1984)
- 'Local Catholic History: A Select Bibliography', *NWCH*, XI (1984), pp. 32-35
- 'The Catholic Revival in Thurnham', *NWCH*, XII (1985), pp. 1-5
- 'Twenty Years On: The Catholic Renewal in the North-West 1965-1985', *NWCH*, XIII (1986), pp. 21-26
- 'Dodd's *Church History*', *NWCH*, XIV (1987), pp. 1-4

‘Post-Reformation Catholicism in Derbyshire’, *Derbyshire Miscellany*, XI (3) (1987), pp. 54-60

‘Holy Family Parish, New Springs’, *NWCH*, XV (1988), pp. 16-21

‘Lingard’s Cisalpine History’, *Priests and People*, III (8) (1989), pp. 328-331

‘Upholland College Archives’, *Catholic Archives*, IX (1989), p. 61

‘Holy Ground: The Influence of the North Welsh Shrines’, in Hilton (ed.), *The Loveable West: Essays presented to Dr M.J. Moore-Rinvulcri* (NWCHS, Wigan, 1990)

‘A Catholic Congregation in the Age of Revolution: St Benedict’s, Hindley’, *NWCH*, XVII (1990), pp. 20-28

‘Tierney’s Dodd’, *South Western Catholic History*, IX (1991), pp. 11-18

‘Burckhardt’s Essay’, *NWCH*, XVIII (1991), pp. 46-47

(Ed.), Daniel Rock, *The Church of our Fathers: A Selection* (NWCHS, Wigan, 1992)

‘The Anglo-Celtic Catholic Ascendancy, 1685-91’, *NWCH*, XIX (1992), pp. 1-6

The Recusant Historian’s Handbook (NWCHS, Wigan, 1993)

‘The Lancashire Secular Clergy: A Select Critical Bibliography’, *NWCH*, XX (1993), pp. 76-77

Catholic Lancashire From Reformation to Renewal 1559-1991 (Phillimore, Chichester, 1994)

St Joseph’s Wrightington (Wrightington, 1994)

“‘Elected Silence’”: Hopkins in Rochdale’ in John McDermott (ed.), *Hopkins’ Lancashire: Sesquicentennial Essays* (NWCHS, Wigan, 1994), pp. 7-12

'Gibbon: The Philosophic Historian', *NWCH*, XXI (1994), pp.39-41

With A.J. Mitchinson, Barbara Murray, and Peggy Wells (eds), *Bishop Leyburn's Confirmation Register of 1687* (NWCHS, Wigan, 1997)

"'Deep in Unfathomable Mines": The Myth of Catholic Secret Tunnels', *NWCH*, XXIV (1997), pp. 42-46

A Reasonable Service: Two Essays on Lingard (NWCHS, Wigan, 1998)

'The Catholic Poor: Paupers and Vagabonds, 1580-1780' in Marie B. Rowlands (ed.), *English Catholics of Parish and Town 1558-1778* (Catholic Record Society, London, 1999), pp.115-28

Daniel Rock: Goth and Cisalpine (NWCHS, Wigan, 1999)

'The Cisalpines' in Hilton (ed.), *A Catholic of the Enlightenment: Essays on Lingard's Work and Times* (NWCHS, Wigan, 1999), pp. 10-20

Acton and Catholic Local History (NWCHS, Wigan, 1999)

'Catholic Congregationalism in Fleetwood, 1841-42', *NWCH*, XXVI (1999), pp. 62-69

'*Pride and Prejudice* and *The Decline and Fall of the Roman Empire*', *The Jane Austen Society Report* (2000), pp. 61-63

'Ruskin's Influence on English Catholicism', *Recusant History*, XXV (1) (2000), pp. 96-105

(Ed.), John Ruskin, *A Christian Catholic: A Selection from the works of John Ruskin* (NWCHS, Wigan, 2000)

‘Ruskin at the Savoy’, *The Friends of Ruskin’s Brantwood Newsletter* (Autumn 2000), 7-12

‘Catholic Negro Slaves in Eighteenth-Century England’, *NWCH*, XXVII (2000), pp. 20-25

A Monkey up a Stick: Remembering Frank Randle (Aspull and Haigh Historical Society, Wigan, 2001)

‘Catholic Lancashire at the End of the Second Millennium’, *NWCH*, XXVIII (2001), pp. 93-97

From the Fylde to Rome: Two Essays on the Life and Influence of William Allen (NWCHS, Wigan, 2002)

Monumental Inscriptions of Five Hindley Chapel Graveyards (Prodesse, Wigan, 2002)

‘Ruskin’s Amazon: Lady Butler’, *The Ruskin Programme Bulletin*, XXX (2002), pp. 3-6

‘“Of One Mind”: Ruskin and William Francis Butler’, *The Ruskin Programme Bulletin*, XXXI (2003), pp. 4-8

‘“A rose by any other name”: Some Ruskin Drawings in Rome’, *Ruskin Programme Bulletin*, XXXII (1003), p.19

‘Ruskin’s Road to Rome’, *Friends of Ruskin’s Brantwood Newsletter* (Autumn 2003), pp. 17-30

‘A Church Triumphant: Edwardian Catholicism’ in Hilton (ed.), *Turning the Last Century: Essays on English Catholicism circa 1900* (NWCHS, Wigan, 2003), pp. 2-9

'Adventure, conversion, and vision in the Evangelical age: Thomas Rutter's
 "Religious Experience"', *NWCH*, XXX (2003), pp.67-73
The Lancashire Dialect Writers (Prodesse, Wigan, 2003)
The Empty Plinth: Wigan's Missing Boer War Memorial (Prodesse, Wigan, 2003)
 'Brown, George Hilary' in *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography* (60 vols,
 Oxford, 2004)
 'Butler, Alban' in *ODNB*
 'Dicconson, Edward' in *ODNB*
 'Pagan Ruskin', *Pagan Dawn*, no. 150 (2004), pp. 40-41
 "'So very Anglo-Saxon'": cisalpines, goths, and Anglo-Saxons', *True Principles: The
 journal of The Pugin Society*, III (1) (2004), pp. 43-47
 'Lingard's Anglo-Saxonism: A Post-Colonial Reading' in Peter Phillips (ed.), *Lingard
 Remembered: Essays to mark the Sesquicentenary of John Lingard's Death* (CRS,
 London, 2004)
 'Of Making Many Books': *Catholics and the Arts and Crafts Movement* (NWCHS,
 Wigan, 2004)
 'Our Lady's, Bryn, 19003-2003: Coal and Catholicism', *NWCH*, XXXII (2005), pp.
 69-76
Ruskin's Rome (Portico Monograph No. 28, Manchester, 2005)
 (Ed.), Donald Alexander Mackenzie, *Wigan: Home-Thoughts, from France
 (Written on the Somme, May 1918)* (Mrs Carol Littler, Wigan, 2005)

‘Ruskin’s Anglo-Saxonism: Constructing and Deconstructing *The Pleasures of England*’, *The Ruskin Review and Bulletin*, I (3), (2005), pp. 38-55

‘Ruskin and Smetham: The Critic and the Artist’, *Ruskin Review*, II (2) (2006), pp. 4-12

Anglo-Saxon Attitudes: A Short Introduction to Anglo-Saxonism (Anglo-Saxon Books, Hockwold, 2006)

Dark Knights of the Soul: The Military Religious Orders (Prodesse, Wigan, 2006)

‘“An English Spring”’: Newman’s Anglo-Saxonism’, *Midland Catholic History*, XIII (2006), pp. 26-30

‘From Coniston to Leigh: A Ruskin Connection’, *Friends of Ruskin’s Brantwood Newsletter* (Spring 2007), pp. 12-13 (re-printed with amendments in *Past Forward*, no. 46 (2007), p. 23)

‘The Ruskin Code’, *Friends of Ruskin’s Brantwood Newsletter* (Autumn 2007), pp. 15-18

The Artifice of Eternity: The Byzantine-Romanesque Revival in Catholic Lancashire (NWCHS, Wigan, 2008)

‘“A subject of different interest”: Ruskin on the Crimean War’, *The War Correspondent: The Journal of the Crimean War Research Society*, XXVII(1) (2009), pp. 16-17

Antonio Barluzzi: Architect of the Holy Places (Prodesse, Wigan, 2009)

‘An American response to Ruskin on Gibbon and Darwin’, *Ruskin Review and Bulletin*, V (1) (Spring 2009), pp. 16-18

‘*Ruskin at the Savoy: The Gilbert and Sullivan Operas as Indications of the Victorian Popular Reception of Ruskin*’ in Anselm Heinrich, Katherine Newey and Jeffrey Richards (eds), *Ruskin, the Theatre and Victorian Visual Culture* (Basingstoke, 2009)

British Travellers in the Holy Land in the 1830s (Prodesse, Wigan, 2009)

Antonio Barluzzi: Architect of the Holy Places (Prodesse, Wigan, 2009)

Lancashire Catholic Survival: From Religious Conservatism to Recusancy (NWCHS, Wigan, 2009)

‘George Stephens – the “Runic Archaeologist” and “English Scandinavian”’, *Widowinde*, no 148 (2009), pp. 19-20

Hindley: Coal, Cotton, and Community (Prodesse, Wigan, 2010)

‘From Liverpool to the Lake District: W. G. Collingwood’, *Liverpool History Society Journal*, no. 9 (2010), pp. 51-53

A Sign of Contradiction: English Travellers and the Fall of Papal Rome (Portico Monograph no. 38, Manchester, 2010)

‘Ruskinian Catholicism’, *Ruskin Review and Bulletin*, VI (2) (2010), pp. 5-14

‘“Sailing to Byzantium”: Ruskin’s Imaginary Travel to Greece’ in Keith Hanley and Emma Sdegno (eds), *Ruskin, Venice and Nineteenth-Century Cultural Travel* (Universita Ca’ Foscari Venezia, Venice, 2011), pp. 361-81.

Lingard’s Rome (NWCHS, Wigan, 2012)

‘Paul Woodroffe: Master of Catholic heraldry in stained glass’, *The Heraldic Craftsman*, no. 82 (2013), pp. 2-4

'Perilous Speculations': Ruskin's Romanists (Prodesse, Wigan, 2013)

'Pugin's Heraldic Revival', *True Principles*, IV (4) (Spring 2014), pp. 324-330

'At an angle to the rules or the case of the disappearing heraldic artist: Anselm Baker and his collaborator John Forbes Nixon', *The Heraldic Craftsman*, no 85 (April 2014), pp. 4-6

'Ruskin's Heraldry', *Ruskin Review*, X (1) (2014), pp. 51-57

Eric Gill in Context and in Preston (NWCHS, Wigan, 2015)

The Historiography of Laurence Vaux (NWCHS, Wigan, 2015)

Bibliography

Books

- Anon., *Miscellanea III* (Catholic Record Society, vol. 3, London, 1906)
- Aspden, Kester, *Fortress Church: The English Roman Catholic Bishops and Politics 1903-63* (Gracewing, Leominster, 2002)
- Aston, Trevor (ed.), *Crisis in Europe 1560-1660: Essays from Past and Present* (Routledge and Keegan Paul, London, 1965)
- Aveling, Hugh, *Post-Reformation Catholicism in East Yorkshire 1558-1790* (East Yorkshire Local history Series, number 11, York, 1960)
- Aveling, Hugh, *Northern Catholics: The Catholic Recusants of the North Riding of Yorkshire 1558-1790* (Geoffrey Chapman, London, 1966)
- Aveling, Hugh, *Catholicism in the City of York 1558-1791* (Catholic Record Society, London, 1966)
- Aveling, Hugh, *The Handle and the Axe: The Catholic Recusants in England from Reformation to Emancipation* (Bond and Briggs, London, 1986)
- Baker, Geoff, *Reading and Politics in Early Modern England: the Mental World of a Seventeenth-Century Catholic Gentleman* (Manchester University Press, Manchester, 2013)
- Beck, George Andrew (ed.), *The English Catholics 1850-1950* (Burns and Oates, London, 1950)
- Belloc, Hilaire, *The Crisis of Civilization* (Cassell, London, 1937)
- Belloc, *The Servile State* (T. N. Fouch, London, 1912)

- Blackwood, B. G., *The Lancashire Gentry and the Great Rebellion 1640-69* (Chetham Society, 3rd series, vol. 25, Manchester, 1978)
- Bossy, John, *The English Catholic Community 1570-1850* (Darton, Longman and Todd, London, 1975), pp. 223-46
- Bouch, C. M. L., *Prelates and People of the Lake Counties: A History of the Diocese of Carlisle 1333-1933* (Titus Wilson and Son Ltd, Kendal, 1984)
- Braddick, Michael J., *State Formation in Early Modern England c. 1550-1700* (Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 2000)
- Broomhall, S. and Tarbin, S (eds), *Women, Identities and Political Cultures in Early Modern Europe* (Ashgate, Aldershot, 2008)
- Burton, Edwin H., *The Life and Times of Bishop Challoner (1691-1781)* (2 vols, Longmans, Green and Co, London, 1909)
- Butler, Alban, *The Lives of the Fathers, Martyrs and other Principal Saints* (4 vols, no publisher names, London, 1756-59)
- Cattermole, Philip H., *John Lingard: The Historian as Apologist* (Matador, Kibworth Beachamp, 2013)
- Chesterton, G. K., *What's Wrong with the World* (Cassell, London, 1910)
- Chinnici, Joseph P., *The English Catholic Enlightenment: John Lingard* (Patmos Press, Shepherdstown, 1980)
- Clark, Kenneth, *The Gothic Revival* (Pelican, Harmondsworth, 1964)
- Collingwood, W. G., *The Life of John Ruskin* (Riverside Press, Cambridge, 1902)

Cook, E. T. and Wedderburn, Alexander (eds), *The Works of John Ruskin* (36 vols, George Allen, London, 1903-12)

Cooper, Kate and Gregory, Jeremy (eds), *Elite and Popular Religion: Studies in Church History vol. 42* (Boydell and Brewer, Woodbridge, 2006)

Corthell, Ronald, Dolan, Francis. E, Highley, Christopher, and Marotti, Arthur F., *Catholic Culture in Early Modern England* (University of Notre Dame Press, Notre Dame, 2007)

Crook, J. Mordaunt, *William Burges and the High Victorian Dream* (Frances Lincoln Limited, London, 2013)

Cruickshanks, Eveline, *The Glorious Revolution* (Macmillan, Basingstoke, 2000)

Davies, John, *Back to the Land: From Ditchling to Parbold* (North West Catholic History Society, Wigan, 2003)

Davies, John and Allan, Mitchinson (eds), *'Obstinate Souls': Essays presented to J. A. Hilton on the occasion of his seventieth birthday by the North West Catholic History Society* (North West Catholic History Society, Wigan, 2011)

Daybell, J. (ed.), *Early Modern Women Letter Writers 1450-1700* (Palgrave Macmillan, Basingstoke, 2001)

Daybell (ed.), *Women and Politics in Early Modern England* (Ashgate, Aldershot, 2004)

De l'Hopital, Winefride, *Westminster Cathedral and its Architect* (2 vols, Methuen, London, 1919)

- Delumeau, Jean, *Catholicism between Luther and Voltaire* (Burns and Oates, London, 1977)
- Dickens, A. G., *The English Reformation* (Batsford, London, 1964)
- Dickinson, Rachel and Hanley, Keith (eds), *Ruskin's Struggle for Coherence: Self-Representation through Art, Place and Society* (Cambridge Scholars Press, Newcastle, 2006)
- Doran, John, Methuen, Charlotte and Walsham, Alexandra (eds), *Religion and the Household: Studies in Church History, vol. 50* (Boydell Press, Woodbridge, 2014)
- Doran, Susan, *Elizabeth I and Religion 1558-1603* (Routledge, London, 1994)
- Doyle, Peter, *Mitres and Missions: The Roman Catholic Diocese of Liverpool 1850-2000* (The Bluecoat Press, Liverpool, 2005)
- Duckett, G. F., *Penal Laws and Test Act 1687-88* (2 vols, London, 1882-83)
- Duffy, Eamon (ed.), *Challoner and his Church* (Darton, Longman and Todd, London, 1981)
- Duffy, *The Stripping of the Altars: Traditional Religion in England c. 1400-c. 1580* (Yale University Press, New Haven and London, 1992)
- Dures, Alan, *English Catholicism 1558-1642* (Longman, Harlow, 1983)
- Dutton, Richard, Findlay, Alison, and Wilson, Richard (eds), *Region, religion and patronage: Lancastrian Shakespeare* (Manchester University Press, Manchester, 2003)
- Dutton, Richard, Findlay, Alison, and Wilson, Richard (eds), *Theatre and Religion: Lancastrian Shakespeare* (Manchester University Press, Manchester, 2003)

Eagles, Stuart, *After Ruskin: The Social and Political Legacies of a Victorian Prophet, 1870-1920* (Oxford University Press, Oxford, 2011)

Fremantle, Anne (ed.), *The Papal Encyclicals in their Historical Context* (New American Library, New York, 1963)

Gibbon, Katy, *English Catholic Exiles in Late Sixteenth-Century Paris* (Boydell and Brewer, Woodbridge, 2011)

Gilbert, Alan D., *Religion and Society in Industrial England: Church, Chapel and Social Change, 1740-1914* (Longman, London, 1976)

Gill, Eric, *Autobiography* (Devlin-Adair, New York, 1941)

Gill, *In a Strange Land* (Jonathon Cape, London, 1944)

Glaser, Eliane (ed.), *Religious Tolerance in the Atlantic World: Early Modern and Contemporary Perspectives* (Palgrave Macmillan, Basingstoke, 2014), pp. 149-70

Glickman, Gabriel, *The English Catholic Community 1688-1745: Politics, Culture and Ideology* (Boydell Press, Woodbridge, 2009)

Gooch, Leo, *A Complete Pattern of Nobility: John Lord Lumley (c. 1534-1609)* (University of Sunderland Press, Rainton Bridge, 2009)

Haigh, Christopher, *Reformation and Resistance in Tudor Lancashire* (Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 1975)

Haigh, *English Reformations: Religion, Politics, and Society under the Tudors* (Clarendon Press, Oxford, 1993)

Haigh, *The Plain Man's Pathways to Heaven: Kinds of Christianity in Post-Reformation England, 1570-1640* (Oxford University Press, Oxford, 2007)

- Haile, Martin and Bonney, Edwin, *Life and Letters of John Lingard 1771-1851*
(Herbert and Daniel, London, 1912)
- Hales, E. E. Y., *The Catholic Church in the Modern World: A Survey from the French Revolution to the present* (Eyre and Spottiswoode, London, 1958)
- Hanley, Keith and Sdegno, Emma (eds), *Ruskin, Venice and Nineteenth-Century Cultural Travel* (Universita Ca' Foscari Venezia, Venice, 2011)
- Hannah, Rosemary, *The Grand Designer: 3rd Marquess of Bute* (Birlin, Edinburgh, 2012)
- Harris, Alana, *Faith in the family: A lived religious history of English Catholicism, 1945-82* (Manchester University Press, Manchester, 2013)
- Hastings, Adrian, *A History of English Christianity 1920-1990* (SCM Press, London, 1991)
- Hastings (ed.), *Bishops and Writers: Aspects of the Evolution of Modern English Catholicism* (Anthony Clark, Wheathampstead, 1977)
- Havran, Michael, *The Catholics in Caroline England* (Oxford University Press, London, 1961)
- Heal, Felicity, *Reformation in Britain and Ireland* (Oxford University Press, Oxford, 2003)
- Heimann, Mary, *Catholic Devotion in Victorian England* (Oxford University Press, Oxford, 1995)
- Hilton, J. A. (ed.), *A Catholic of the Enlightenment: Essays on Lingard's Work and Times* (North West Catholic History Society, Wigan, 1999)

Hilton, *A Reasonable Service: Two Essays on Lingard* (The Lingard Fund, Wigan, 1999)

Hilton, *Anglo-Saxon Attitudes: A Short Introduction to Anglo-Saxonism* (Anglo-Saxon Books, Hockwold, 2006)

Hilton (ed.), *Catholic Englishmen* (North West Catholic History Society, Wigan, 1984)

Hilton, *Catholic Lancashire: From Reformation to Renewal 1559-1991* (Phillimore, Chichester, 1994)

Hilton, *Daniel Rock: Goth and Cisalpine* (North West Catholic History Society, Wigan, 1999)

Hilton, *Lancashire Catholic Survival: From Religious Conservatism to Recusancy* (North West Catholic History Society, Wigan, 2009)

Hilton, *Lingard's Rome* (North West Catholic History Society, Wigan, 2012)

Hilton, *'Perilous Speculations': Ruskin's Romanists* (Prodesse, Wigan, 2013)

Hilton, *Ruskin's Rome* (Portico Library, Manchester, 2005)

Hilton, *The Artifice of Eternity: The Byzantine-Romanesque Revival in Catholic Lancashire* (North West Catholic History Society, Wigan, 2008)

Hilton, *The Historiography of Laurence Vaux* (North West Catholic History Society, Wigan, 2015)

Hilton, J. A., Mitchinson, A. J., Murray, Barbara, and Well, Peggy (eds), *Bishop Leyburn's Confirmation Register of 1687* (North West Catholic History Society, Wigan, 1997)

- Hilton, Tim, *John Ruskin: The Early Years* (Yale University Press, London, 1985)
- Hilton, Tim, *John Ruskin: The Later Years* (Yale University Press, London, 2000)
- Hollinshead, Janet, *Women of the Catholic Community: The Blundells of South Lancashire during the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries* (North West Catholic History Society, Wigan, 2010)
- Holmes, J. Derek, *More Roman than Rome: English Catholicism in the Nineteenth Century* (Burns and Oates, London, 1978)
- Hornsby-Smith, Michael P., *Catholics in England 1950-2000: Historical and Sociological Perspectives* (Cassell, London, 1999)
- Hoskins, W. G., *Local History in England* (Longman, Harlow, 1972)
- Janssens, G. A. M. and Aarts, A. G. A. M. (eds), *Studies in Seventeenth-Century English Literature, History and Bibliography* (Editions Rodopi B. V., Amsterdam, 1984)
- Jones, Edwin, *The Great Myth: The English Nation* (Sutton Publishing, Stroud, 1998)
- Jones, Edwin, *John Lingard and the Pursuit of Historical Truth* (Sussex Academic Press, Brighton, 1981)
- Kaplan, E., et al. (eds), *Catholic Communities in Protestant States: Britain and the Netherlands, c. 1570-1720* (Manchester University Press, Manchester, 2009)
- Kesselring, K. J., *The Northern Rebellion of 1569: Faith, Politics and Protest in Elizabethan England* (Palgrave Macmillan, Basingstoke, 2010)

- Lake, Peter and Questier, Michael (eds), *Conformity and Orthodoxy in the English Church, c. 1560-1660* (Boydell Press, Woodbridge, 2000), pp. 217-61
- Laslett, Peter, *The World we have lost* (Methuen, London, 1979)
- Leatherbarrow, J. Stanley, *The Lancashire Elizabethan Recusants* (Chetham Society, vol. 110, Manchester, 1947)
- Lethaby, W. R. and Wedderburn, Alexander (eds), *The Church of Sancta Sophia, Constantinople, A Study of Byzantine Building* (Methuen, London, 1894)
- Levack, Brian P., *The Devil Within: Possession and Exorcism in the Christian West* (Yale University Press, New Haven, 2013)
- Lothian, James R., *The Making and Unmaking of the English Catholic Intellectual Community 1910-1950* (University of Notre Dame Press, Notre Dame, Indiana, 2009)
- Lux-Sterritt, Laurence and Mangion, Carmen (eds), *Gender, Catholicism and Spirituality: Women and the Roman Catholic Church in Britain and Europe, 1200-1900* (Palgrave Macmillan, Basingstoke, 2011)
- Lux-Sterritt, *Redefining Female Religious Life: French Ursulines and English Ladies in Seventeenth-Century Catholicism* (Ashgate, Aldershot, 2005)
- MacCulloch, Diarmid, *Reformation: Europe's House Divided 1490-1700* (Penguin Books, London, 2002)
- Marshall, Peter and Scott, Geoffrey (eds), *Catholic Gentry in English Society: The Throckmortons of Coughton from Reformation to Emancipation* (Ashgate, Farnham, 2009)

Mathew, David, *Catholicism in England: The Portrait of a Minority: Its Culture and Tradition* (Eyre and Spottiswood, London, 1948)

Matthew, H. G. C. and Harrison, Brian (eds), *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography* (60 vols, Oxford University Press, Oxford, 2004)

McClelland, V. Alan, and Hodgetts, Michael (eds), *From Without the Flaminian Gate: 140 Years of Roman Catholicism in England and Wales 1850-2000* (Darton, Longman and Todd, London, 1999)

McLeod, Hugh, *Religion and the People of Western Europe* (Oxford University Press, Oxford, 1981)

McNabb, Vincent, *The Church and the Land* (Burns, Oates and Washbourne, London, 1926)

Meynell, Mrs [Alice], *John Ruskin* (Blackwood, Edinburgh and London, 1900)

Miller, John, *Popery and Politics in England 1660-1688* (Cambridge University Press, 1975)

Mitchinson, Allan, *Catholicism in Standish: From Persecution to Parish 1559-1884* (North West Catholic History Society, Wigan, 2005)

Morris, William, *Gothic Architecture: A Lecture to the Arts and Crafts Exhibition Society* (Kelmscott Press, Hammersmith, 1893)

Mursell, Gordon, *English Spirituality from 1700 to the Present Day* (Society for Promoting Christian Knowledge, London, 2001)

Mullett, Michael (ed.), *English Catholicism* (6 vols, Pickering and Chatto, London, 2006)

- Mullett, Michael A., *Catholics in Britain and Ireland 1558-1829* (Macmillan, Basingstoke, 1998)
- Mullett, *James II and English Politics* (Routledge, London, 1994)
- Newman, John Henry, *Sermons preached on Various Occasions* (Longmans, Green and Co., London, 1913)
- Norman, Edward, *Roman Catholicism in England from the Elizabethan Reformation to the Second Vatican Council* (Oxford University Press, Oxford, 1985)
- Norman, *The English Catholic Church in the Nineteenth Century* (Clarendon Press, Oxford, 1984)
- Parkinson, Anne C., *A History of Catholicism in the Furness Peninsula 1127-1997* (University of Lancaster, Centre for North West Regional Studies, Lancaster, 1998)
- Peters, Christine, *Patterns of Piety: Women, Gender and Religion in Late Medieval and Reformation England* (Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 2003)
- Phillips, C. B. and Smith, J. A., *Lancashire and Cheshire from AD 1540* (Routledge, London, 2014)
- Phillips, Peter, *John Lingard: Priest and Historian* (Gracewing, Leominster, 2008)
- Phillips (ed.), *Lingard Remembered: Essays to mark the Sesquicentenary of Lingard's Death* (Catholic Record Society, London, 2004)
- Pincus, Steve, *1688: The First Modern Revolution* (Yale University Press, New Haven and London, 2009)

- Poole, Robert (ed.), *The Lancashire Witches: Histories and Stories* (Manchester University Press, Manchester, 2006)
- Questier, Michael, *Catholicism and Community in Early Modern England: Politics, Aristocratic Patronage and Religion c. 1530-1640* (Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 2003)
- Reid, F. and Holden, K. (eds), *Women on the Move: Refugees, Migration and Exile* (Cambridge Scholars Publishing, Cambridge 2010)
- Rockett, June, *Held in Trust: Catholic Parishes in England and Wales 1900-1950* (St Austin Press, London, 2001)
- Rowlands, Marie B. (ed.), *Catholics of Parish and Town 1558-1778* (Catholic Record Society, London, 1990)
- Royle, Edward, *Issues of Regional Identity: In honour of John Marshall* (Manchester University Press, Manchester, 1998)
- Scarisbrick, J. J., *The Reformation and the English People* (Blackwell, Oxford, 1985)
- Shea, Donald F., *The English Ranke: John Lingard* (Humanities Press, New York, 1969)
- Shell, Alison, *Oral Culture and Catholicism in Early Modern England* (Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 2009)
- Smith, Alan G. R. (ed.), *The Reign of James VI and I* (Macmillan, London, 1973)
- Smith, T. A., *Catholics in Preston: From Early to Modern Times* (North West Catholic History Society, Wigan, 2008)

Sowerby, Scott, *Making Toleration: The Repealers and the Glorious Revolution*

(Harvard University Press, Cambridge, Mass., 1993)

Shagan, Ethan E. (ed.), *Catholics and the 'Protestant Nation': Religious Politics and*

Identity in Early Modern England (Manchester University Press, Manchester, 2005)

Shepard, Alexandra and Withington, Phil (eds), *Communities in Early Modern*

England: Networks, Place, Rhetoric (Manchester University Press, Manchester, 2005)

Talbot, Clare (ed.), *Miscellanea: Recusant Records* (Catholic Record Society,

London, vol. 53, 1961)

Thirsk, Joan, *The Agrarian History of England and Wales* (3 vols, Cambridge

University Press, Cambridge, 1984)

Tosh, John, *The Pursuit of History: Aims, Methods and New Directions in the Study*

of Modern History (Longman, London, 1984)

Tyacke, Nicholas (ed.), *The English Revolution c. 1590-1720: Politics, Religion and*

Communities (Manchester University Press, Manchester, 2013)

Villis, Tom, *British Catholics and Fascism: Religious Identity and Political*

Extremism between the Wars (Palgrave Macmillan, Basingstoke, 2013)

Walsham, Alexandra, *Catholic Reformation in Protestant Britain* (Ashgate,

Farnham, 2014)

Walker, Claire, *Gender and Politics in Early Modern Europe: English Convents in*

France and the Low Countries (Palgrave Macmillan, Basingstoke, 2003)

- Walsham, *Church Papists: Catholicism, Conformity and Confessional Polemic in Early Modern England* (Boydell Press, Woodbridge, 1999)
- Walsham, *The Reformation of the Landscape: Religion, Identity and Memory in Early Modern Britain and Ireland* (Oxford University Press, Oxford, 2011)
- Walton, John K., *Lancashire: a social history, 1558-1939* (Manchester University Press, Manchester, 1987)
- Ward, Bernard, *The Dawn of the Catholic Revival in England 1781-1803* (2 vols, Longmans, Green and Co, London, 1909)
- Ward, *The Eve of Catholic Emancipation 1803-1829* (3 vols, Longmans, Green and Co, London, 1911-12)
- Ward, *The Sequel to Catholic Emancipation 1830-1850* (2 vols, Longmans, Green and Co, London, 1915)
- Wark, K. R., *Elizabethan Recusancy in Cheshire* (Chetham Society, new series, vol. 19, Manchester, 1971)
- Watkin, E. I., *Roman Catholicism in England from the Reformation to 1950* (Oxford University Press, London, 1967)
- Wheeler, Michael, *Ruskin's God* (Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 1999)
- Wheeler, *The Old Enemies: Catholics and Protestants in Nineteenth-Century English Culture* (Cambridge, University Press, Cambridge, 2006)
- Wilson, Richard, *Secret Shakespeare: Studies in theatre, religion and resistance* (Manchester University Press, Manchester, 2004)

Wright, N., et al. (eds), *Women, Property and the Letters of the Law in Early Modern England* (University of Toronto Press, Toronto, 2004)

Wyhe, C. van (ed.), *Female Monasticism in Early Modern Europe: An Interdisciplinary View* (Ashgate, Aldershot, 2008)

Articles in Books

(Full bibliographical details of the books listed in this section are given in the **Books** section above.)

Bossy, John, 'The Character of Elizabethan Catholicism' in Aston, *Crisis in Europe 1560-1660: Essays from Past and Present*, pp. 223-46

Bossy, 'The English Catholic Community 1603-1623' in Smith, *The Reign of James VI and V*, pp. 91-105

Callow, John and Mullett, Michael, 'The Shireburns of Stonyhurst: memory and survival in a Lancashire recusant family' in Dutton, Findlay and Wilson, *Region, religion and patronage*, pp. 169-85

Connolly, G. P., 'Shifting Congregations: Catholic rural migration in late eighteenth-century Lancashire' in Hilton, *Catholic Englishmen*, pp. 13-20

Cooper, Thomas, revised Hilton, 'Brown, George Hilary' in Matthew and Harrison, *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, vol. 8, p. 42

Duffy, Eamon, 'Richard Challoner 1681-1781: A Memoir' in Duffy, *Challoner and his Church*, pp. 1-26

Findlay, Alison and Dutton, Richard, 'Introduction' in Findlay and Dutton, *Region, religion and patronage*, pp. 1-31

Gibbon, Katy, "'An Unquiet Estate Abroad": the religious exile of Catholic noble and gentlewomen under Elizabeth I' in F. Reid and K. Holden (eds.), *Women on the Move: Refugees, Migration and Exile*, pp. 43-58

Hanley, 'Introduction in Dickinson and Hanley, *Ruskin's Struggle for Coherence*, pp. 1-xxviii

Hastings, Adrian, 'Some reflections on the English Catholicism of the late 1930s' in Hastings, *Bishops and Writers*, pp. 107-126

Hewison, Robert, 'Ruskin, John', in Matthew and Harrison, *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, vol. 48, pp. 173-93

Hilton, 'Butler, Alban' in Matthew and Harrison, *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, vol. 9, pp. 115-16

Hilton, 'Lingard's Anglo-Saxonism' in Phillips, *Lingard Remembered*, 23-34

Hilton, 'Lingard's Hornby' in Hilton, *Catholic Englishmen*, p. 37-44

Hilton, ' "Sailing to Byzantium" Ruskin's Imaginary Travel to Greece' in Hanley and Sdegno, *Ruskin, Venice and Nineteenth-Century Cultural Travel*, pp. 361-81

Hilton, 'The Catholic Poor: Paupers and Vagabonds, 1580-1780' in Rowlands, *Catholics of Parish and Town*, pp. 115-28

Hilton, 'The Cisalpines' in Hilton, *A Catholic of the Enlightenment*, pp. 10-20

Hook, Paul (ed.), 'Catholic Registers of Holywell, Flintshire, 1698-1829' in Anon., *Miscellanea III*, pp. 105-134

Hughes, Philip, 'The English Catholics in 1850' in Beck, *English Catholics*, pp. 1-41

Kelly, James E., 'Conformity, Loyalty and the Jesuit Mission to England of 1589' in Eliane Glaser (ed.), *Religious Tolerance in the Atlantic World*, pp. 149-70

Langton, John, 'The continuity of regional culture: Lancashire Catholicism from the late sixteenth to the early nineteenth century' in Royle, *Issues of Regional Identity*, pp. 82-101

Luckett, Richard, 'Bishop Challoner: The Devotional Writer' in Duffy, *Challoner and his Church*, pp. 71-89

Marshall, Peter and Scott, Geoffrey, 'Introduction: The Catholic Gentry in English Society' in Marshall and Scott, *The Catholic Gentry in English Society*, pp. 1-30

Milton, Anthony, 'Religion and community in pre-civil war England' in Tyacke, *The English Revolution*

Mullett, Michael, "'Composed Entirely of the Poorest Class: The Establishment of the Parish of St Catherine, Penrith, Cumbria, 1833-50' in Davies and Mitchinson, *'Obstinate Souls'*, pp. 29-47

Mullett, Michael, 'John Lingard in Context' in Hilton, *A Catholic of the Enlightenment*, pp. 2-9

Mullett, Michael, 'The Reformation in the parish of Whalley' in Poole, *The Lancashire Witches*, pp. 88-104

Murphy, Emilie K. 'Adoremus Te Christe: Music and post-Reformation English Catholic Domestic Piety' in Doran et al. (eds), *Religion and the Household*, pp. 240-53

Phillips, Peter, 'Lingard, John' in Matthew and Harrison, *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, vol. 33, pp. 913-96

Questier, Michael, 'Conformity and the Law' in Lake and Questier, *Conformity and Orthodoxy in the English Church, c. 1560-1660*, pp.237-61

Questier, 'Elizabeth and the Catholics' in Shagan (ed.), *Catholics and the 'Protestant Nation'*, pp. 69-94

Riley, Emma, 'John Lingard and the Liturgy' in Phillips, *Lingard Remembered*, pp. 143-56

Riley, 'Lingard as Liturgist' in Hilton, *A Catholic of the Enlightenment*, pp. 33-48

Rowlands, Marie, 'Recusant Women 1560-1640' in Prior, *Women in English Society*, pp. 63-78

Rowlands, 'Hidden People: Catholic Commoners, 1558-1624' in Rowlands, *Catholics of Parish and Town*, pp.10-35

Rowlands, 'Surviving the Times, 1625-90' in Rowlands, *Catholics of Parish and Town*, pp. 61-77

Rowlands, '1767 – The New People' in Rowlands, *Catholics of Parish and Town*, pp. 286-356

Sena, Margaret, 'William Blundell and the Networks of Catholic Dissent in post-Reformation England' in Shepard and Withington (eds), *Communities in Early Modern England*, pp. 54-75

Underwood, 'Catechesis, Socialisation and Play in a Catholic Household, c. 1660: The "Children's Exercises" from the Blundell Papers' in Doran et al. (eds), *Religion and the Household*, pp. 269-81

Walker, Claire, "'Do not suppose me a well mortified Nun dead to the world": Letter Writing in Early Modern English Convents in J. Daybell (ed.), *Early Modern Women Letter Writers 1450-1700*, pp. 159-76

Walker, 'Loyal and Dutiful Subjects: English Nuns and Stuart Politics' in J. Daybell (ed.), *Women and Politics in Early Modern England*, pp. 228-42

Walker, 'Priests, Nuns, Presses and Prayers: The Southern Netherlands and the Contours of English Catholicism' in E. Kaplan et al. (eds), *Catholic Communities in Protestant States*, pp. 136-55

Walker, 'Recusants, Daughters and Sisters of Christ: English Nuns and their Communities in the Seventeenth Century' in S. Broomhall and S. Tarbin (eds), *Women, Identities and Political Cultures in Early Modern Europe*, pp. 51-76

Walker, 'Securing Souls or Telling Tales?: The Politics of Cloistered Spirituality' in C. van Wyhe (ed.), *Female Monasticism in Early Modern Europe*, pp. 227-44

Walker, 'Spiritual Property: The English Benedictine Nuns of Cambrai and the Dispute over the Baker Manuscripts' in N. Wright et al. (eds), *Women, Property and the Letters of the Law in Early Modern England*, pp. 237-55

Walsham, Alexandra, "'Yielding to the Extremity of the Time": Conformity, Orthodoxy and the Post-Reformation Catholic Community' in Lake and Questier, *Conformity and Orthodoxy in the English Church*, pp. 211-236

Whitehead, Maurice, ‘ “Violently pulled down”: The English Jesuit Educational Experiment of 1687-88’ in Davies and Mitchinson, *‘Obstinate Souls’*

Williams, J. Anthony, ‘Change or Decay? The Provincial Laity 1691-1781’ in Duffy, *Challoner and his Church*, pp.27-54

Williams, ‘No Popery Violence in 1688: Revolt in the Provinces’ in Janssens and Aarts, *Studies in Seventeenth-Century English Literature, History and Bibliography*, pp. 245-59

Articles in Journals

Anstruther, Godfrey, ‘Lancashire Clergy in 1639’, *Recusant History*, vol. 4 (1) (1957), pp. 38-46

Aveling, Hugh, ‘The Catholic Recusants of the West Riding of Yorkshire 1558-1790’, *Proceedings of the Leeds Philosophical and Literary Society* (Leeds, 1963), pp. 191-256

Blackwood, B. G., ‘Plebeian Catholics in the 1640s and 1650s’, *Recusant History*, vol. 18 (1) (1986), pp. 42-59

Blackwood, ‘The Catholic and Protestant Gentry of Lancashire during the Civil War period’, *Transactions of the Historic Society of Lancashire and Cheshire*, vol. 126 (1976), pp. 1-29

Blackwood, ‘The Economic State of the Lancashire Gentry on the Eve of the Civil War’, *Northern History*, vol. XII (1976), pp. 53-83

- Blackwood, 'The Lancashire Cavaliers and their Tenants', *Transactions of the Historic Society of Lancashire and Cheshire*, vol. 117 (1965), pp. 17-32
- Blackwood, 'The Cavalier and Roundhead Gentry of Lancashire', *Transactions of the Lancashire and Cheshire Antiquarian Society*, vol. 77 (1967), pp. 77-96
- Bossy, John, 'Recusant history and after', *British Catholic History*, vol. 32 (3) 2015, pp. 271-79
- Cust, Richard, 'Catholicism, Antiquarianism and Gentry Honour: The Writings of Sir Thomas Shirley', *Midland History*, vol. XXIII (1998), pp. 40-70
- Gardner, Norman, 'The Coulstons of Lonsdale and Lancaster: Merchants, Bankers and Catholic Benefactors', *North West Catholic History*, vol. XXV (1998), pp. 10-27
- Gibbons, Katy, "'No home in exile?'" Elizabethan Catholics in Paris', *Reformation*, vol. 15 (2010), pp. 115-31
- Gibbons, "'Une place reserve?": Catholic exiles and contested space in later sixteenth-century Paris', *French Historical Studies*, vol. 32 (2009), pp. 33-61
- Haigh, Christopher, 'The Continuity of Catholicism in the English Reformation', *Past and Present*, number 93 (1981), pp. 37-59.
- Haigh, Christopher, 'Success and Failure in the English Reformation', *Past and Present*, issue 173 (2001), pp. 28-49
- Haile, Martin and Bonney, Edwin, *Life and Letters of John Lingard 1771-1851* (Herbert and Daniel, London, 1912)
- Hill, J. E. C., 'Puritans and "the Dark Corners of the Land"', *Transactions of the Royal Historical Society*, 5th series, vol. 13 (1963), pp. 77-102

Hilton, 'Adventure, conversion and vision in the Evangelical Age: Thomas Rutter's "Religious Experience"', *North West Catholic History*, vol. XXX (1003), pp. 67-743

Hilton "'An English Spring": Newman's Anglo-Saxonism', *Midland Catholic History*, vol.. XIII (2006), pp. 26-30

Hilton, 'At an angle to the rules or the case of the disappearing heraldic artist: Anselm Baker and his collaborator , John Forbes Nixon', *The Heraldic Craftsman, The Society of Heraldic Arts*, no 85 (2014), pp. 2-4

Hilton, 'Catholic Congregationalism in Fleetwood, 1841-42', *North West Catholic History*, vol. XXVI (1999), pp. 62-69

Hilton, 'Catholicism in Caroline Northumberland', *Northern Catholic History*, no 8 (1978), pp. 3-10

Hilton, 'Catholicism in Elizabethan Durham', *Recusant History*, vol. 14 (1) (1977), pp. 1-8

Hilton, 'Catholicism in Elizabethan Northumberland', *Northern History*, vol. XIII (1977), pp. 44-58

Hilton, 'Catholicism in Jacobean Durham', *Recusant History*, vol. 14 (2) (1977), pp. 75-85

Hilton, 'Catholicism in Jacobean Northumberland', *Northern Catholic History*, no 7 (1978), pp. 10-19

Hilton, 'Catholic Lancashire at the End of the Second Millennium', *North West Catholic History*, vol. XXVIII (2001), pp. 93-97

Hilton, 'Catholic Negro Slaves in Eighteenth-Century England', *North West Catholic History*, vol. XXVII (2000), pp. 20-25

Hilton, 'Lingard's Cisalpine History', *Priests and People*, vol. 3 (8), pp. 328-31

Hilton, 'Paul Woodroffe: Master of Catholic heraldry in stained glass', *The Heraldic Craftsman, The Society of Heraldic Arts*, no. 82 (2013), pp. 2-4

Hilton, 'Pugin's Heraldic Revival', *True Principles: The journal of the Pugin Society*, vol. IV (4) (2014), pp. 324-30

Hilton, 'Ruskin's Anglo-Saxonism: Constructing and Deconstructing *The Pleasures of England*', *The Ruskin Review and Bulletin*, vol. I (3) (2005), pp. 38-55

Hilton, 'Ruskin's Influence on English Catholicism', *Recusant History*, vol. 25 (1) (2000), pp. 96-105

Hilton, 'Ruskinian Catholicism', *Ruskin Review and Bulletin*, vol. 6 (2) | (2010), pp. 5-15

Hilton, '“So very Anglo-Saxon”: cisalpines, goths, and Anglo-Saxons', *True Principles: The journal of The Pugin Society*, vol. III (1) (2004), pp. 43-37

Hilton, 'The Anglo-Celtic Catholic Ascendancy, 1685-91', *North West Catholic History*, vol. XIX (1992), pp. 1-6

Hilton, 'The Case of Wigan: Catholic Congregationalism in the Age of Revolution', *North West Catholic History*, vol. X (1983), pp. 1-7

Hilton, 'The Catholicism of the Ascendancy', *London Recusant*, new series, vol. I (1981), pp. 60-70

Hilton, 'The Catholic Ascendancy in the Eastern Counties', *Essex Recusant*, vol. XX (1) (1978), pp. 15-23

Hilton, 'The Catholic Ascendancy in London and the Home Counties', *London Recusant*, vol. V (2) (1975), pp. 78-83

Hilton, 'The Catholic Ascendancy in the Midlands, 1685-88', *Staffordshire Catholic History*, vo. CVIII (1978), pp. 15-18

Hilton, 'The Catholic Ascendancy in the North, 1685-88', *North West Catholic History*, vol. V (1978), pp. 1-13

Hilton, 'The Catholic Ascendancy in the South-West, 1685-88', *London Recusant*, vol. VII (2) 1977, pp. 68-72

Hilton, 'The Catholic Ascendancy in Wales and the Marches, 1685-88', *Worcestershire Recusant*, vol. XXX (1977), pp. 3-8

Hilton, 'The Catholic Ascendancy in the Worcester Region, 1685-88', *Worcestershire Recusant*, vol. XXIV (1975), pp. 2-7

Hilton, 'The Catholics in Caroline Durham', *Durham County Local History Society Bulletin*, no 9 (1976), pp. 9-18

Hilton, 'The Catholic North-East 1640-1859', *Durham County Local History Society Bulletin*, no 24 (1980), pp. 37-44

Hilton, 'The Catholicism of the Ascendancy, 1685-88', *London Recusant*, new series no.1 (1981), pp. 60-67

Hilton, 'The Counter-Reformation in the North East'. *Northern Catholic History*, no 5 (1977), pp. 3-12

- Hilton, 'The Cumbrian Catholics', *Northern History*, vol. XXVI (1980), pp. 40-58
- Hilton, 'The Heraldry of the post-Reformation English Catholic Community: Part I, English Catholic Heraldry under Penalty, 1559-1778; Part II, English Catholic Heraldry since Toleration, 1778-2010', *The Coat of Arms: The Journal of the Heraldry Society* (pending)
- Hilton, 'The Recusant Commons in the North-East 1570-1642', *Northern Catholic History*, no. 12 (1980), pp. 3-13
- Hilton, "'The Science of the Saints': The Spirituality of Butler's *Lives of the Saints*", *Recusant History*, vol. 15 (3) (1980), pp. 189-93
- Hilton, 'Twenty Years On: The Catholic Renewal in the North-West 1965-1985', *North West Catholic History*, vol. XIII (1986), pp. 21-26
- Hilton, 'Wigan Catholics and the Policies of James II', *North West Catholic History*, vol. I (3) (1969), pp. 97-110
- Jones, Edwin, *John Lingard and the Pursuit of Historical Truth* (Sussex Academic Press, Brighton, 2001)
- Lux-Sterritt, Laurence, "'Virgo becomes Virago': women in the accounts of the seventeenth-century English Catholic missionary", *Recusant History*, vol. 30 (4) (2011), pp. 537-54
- Lux-Sterritt, 'An Analysis of the Controversy Caused by Mary Ward's Institute in the 1620s', *Recusant History*, vol 25 (4) (2001), 636-47

Lux-Sterritt, 'Les religieuses en mouvement: Ursulines et Dames anglaises à laube de XVII^e Siècle', *Revue d'Histoire Moderne et Contemporaine*, vol 53 (4) (2005), pp. 7-23

Lux-Sterritt, 'Mary Ward's English Institute: the Apostolate of Self-Affirmation', *Recusant History*, vol. 28 (2) (2006), pp. 192-208

Lux-Sterritt, 'Une polémique dans l'Angleterre de la contre-réforme: Mary Ward et sa Compagnie de Jésus au féminin', *Revue de l'Histoire de Religions*, vol. 225 (3) (2008), pp. 393-414

Lux-Sterritt, "'Virgo becomes Virago": Women in the Accounts of Seventeenth-Century Missionaries', *Recusant History*, vol. 30 (4) (2011), pp. 537-53

Mullett, Michael, ' "A Receptacle for Papists and an Assilum": Catholicism and Disorder in Late Seventeenth-Century Wigan', *The Catholic Historical Review*, vol. LXXIII (3), pp. 391-407

Mullett, Michael, 'John Lingard, Historian', *North West Catholic History*, vol. XXII (1995), p. 36.-38

Mullett, Michael, 'The Urban Reformation in North-Western England', *North West Catholic History*, vol. XXXI (2004), pp. 5-20

Murphy, Emilie K. M., 'Music and Catholic Culture in post-Reformation Lancashire: piety, protest, and conversion', *British Catholic History*, vol. 34 (4) (2015), pp. 492-525

Oates, Rosamund, 'Catholicism, Conformity and the Community in the Elizabethan Diocese of Durham', *Northern History*, vol.. XLIII (1) (2006), pp. 31-76

Paxton, Nicholas, 'The Survival of Catholicism in Elizabethan Lancashire – A Single Movement?', *North West Catholic History*, vol. XXXVIII (2011), pp. 5-23

Phillips, Peter, 'Re-evaluating John Lingard's History of England', *Recusant History*, vol. 28 (4) (2007), pp. 529-41

Questier, Michael, 'Practical Antipapistry during the Reign of Elizabeth I', *The Journal of British Studies*, vol. 36 (1997), p. 371-96

Questier, 'The Politics of Religious Conformity and the Accession of James I.' *Historical Research*, vol. 74 (174) (2000), pp. 28-47

Thwaytes, Lance, 'Catholics of the Seventeenth Century in the Barony of Kendal' in Rowlands, *Catholics of Parish and Town*

Underwood, Lucy, 'Recusancy and the Rising Generation', *Recusant History*, vol. 31 (4) (2013), pp. 511-34

Walker, Claire, ' "Going against some forcible wind": Writing and Reform in Medieval and Early Modern Convents', *Journal of Women's History*, vol. 21 (1) (2009), pp. 144 -55

Walker, 'Prayer, Patronage and Political Conspiracy: English Nuns and the Restoration', *The Historical Journal*, vol. 43 (2000), pp. 1-23

Wright, A. D., 'Catholic History, North and South', *Northern History*, vol. XIV (1978), pp. 126-51

Theses

Brindley, Christina Michelle, 'Images of Female Piety and the Development of Post-Reformation Catholicism in the Diocese of Chester, c. 1558- c. 1625 (PhD thesis, Manchester Metropolitan University, 2013)

Hilton, J. A., 'Catholic Recusancy in County Durham, 1558-1625' (MPhil thesis, University of Leeds, 1976)

Kelly, James Edward, 'Learning to Survive: the Petre Family and the formation of Catholic communities from Elizabeth I to the Eve of the English Civil War' (PhD thesis, King's College London, 2008)

Merrell, Catherine Berenice, 'The Late Victorian Periodical Press and Attitudes to the "The Problem of the Poor"' (PhD thesis, De Montfort University, 2001)

Wright, F. Alison, 'The Layburns and their World circa 1620-1720: the English Catholic Community and the House of Stuart' (PhD thesis, St Andrews University, 2002)

Parkinson, Anne Cecilia, 'Catholicism in Cumberland and Westmorland 1558-1829' (PhD thesis, University of Lancaster, 2003)

Websites

'Obituary: John Aveling', www.independent.co.uk [accessed 4 September 2014]

'Catholic Negro Slaves', www.blackpresence.co.uk/catholic-slaves (accessed 8 July 2015)

Who were the Nuns? A Prosopographical study of the English convents in exile 1600-1800, www.wwtn.history.gmul.ac.uk